



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, September 12, 2019, 11:00 A.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:02 A.M.

Members Present

David W. Schoell, P.E., Chair
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Vice-Chair
Joy Jones, Secretary
Holly Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner
Susan J. McKee, MFA
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
Robert L. Shears, ASLA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

Members Absent

James E. Turner, AIA

Staff Present

Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Jeff Stephens, Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Brandon D. McCarthy
Josh Friesenhahn
Joel Collins
Rebekah Thompsen

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 27, 2019

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved by majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 27, 2019

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
Grant		Schoell	Turner
Jones		McKee	
Becker			
Bumgarner			
Parker			
Reeds			
Shears			
Townsend			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0101-2019 / 1716 S. Quincy Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Applicant: J. Collins & Associates
Proposal:
 1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had provided the documentation on the status of the windows and on the patterns and profiles of windows requested by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Grant reported that some existing windows were the original putty-glaze windows and some were replacements, adding that the applicant planned to match the replacement windows on the residence. Commissioner Grant stated that the proposed addition matched the style and materials of the residence, so the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had forwarded the application to the Tulsa Preservation Commission with a recommendation of approval.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3

Vote: 1716 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Turner
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Jones			
6. McKee			
7. Parker			
8. Reeds			
9. Shears			
10. Townsend			

2. **HP-0119-2019 / 1607 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Terra Nova Properties

Proposal:

1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, stating that the application had been reviewed twice by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee and that the applicant had provided the documentation and revisions requested by the subcommittee. The applicant added that all windows would match the windows presently on the residence, rather than the windows shown on the elevations. Upon inquiry, the applicant confirmed that the dormers would be an aesthetic gesture with no actual living space added to the second story. Commissioner Parker stated that the dormers did not seem proportionally correct for the house and questioned the choice to add them if they were not necessary. Commissioner Grant then presented a report, noting that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had reviewed the application extensively on two occasions. Commissioner Grant commented that the proposal for the dormers had been reviewed and that they were deemed appropriate because of precedent elsewhere in the neighborhood. Commissioner Grant stated that the application was forwarded with a recommendation of approval. Commissioner Reeds recommended lowering the dormers to strengthen the presence of the ridge of the roof, rather than engaging the ridge. Commissioner Parker requested that the dormers be lowered but the windows remain in the proposed location. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether the window casing would be matched, and the applicant responded that the windows presently on the residence would be matched exactly. Commissioner Schoell noted the application had improved greatly since its first review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the ridges on the dormers be lowered by one foot (1'-0") and that the windows remain in the location shown in the elevation. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1607 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Turner
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Jones			
6. McKee			
7. Parker			
8. Reeds			
9. Shears			
10. Townsend			

3. **HP-0123-2019 / 1002 E. 20th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Brandon and Rachel McCarthy

Proposals:

1. Replacement of gate for driveway
2. Installation of gate
3. Construction of retaining wall
4. Construction of planter

Staff presented its report and clarified the definition of a street yard on a corner lot, stating that Chapter 95 of the Zoning Code provided the definition of a street yard as any yard abutting a street. Staff noted that the landscape features in the yards adjacent to both 20th Street and Madison Avenue were subject to review by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. The applicant added that the proposal had been revised to create a square entry from the walkway as recommended by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The applicant then noted that the retaining wall would be six feet and eight inches (6'-8") in height at its highest point on the southwest corner of the property and a wooden privacy fence six feet (6'-0") in height would be installed above it on a portion of the west side of the yard. Commissioner Grant presented a report, stating that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had been pleased by the proposed design. Commissioner Grant noted that the height and the opacity of the wooden privacy fence atop the retaining wall had been a concern during the review and suggested the possibility of a wrought-iron fence. The applicant mentioned several other wooden privacy fences in the neighborhood with similar heights which had been constructed within the last ten years. Commissioner Parker observed that a fireplace indicated in the Site Plan appeared to be in the street yard but was not included in the application and noted that it would require an additional review by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Shears expressed a concern about the height of the wall and informed the applicant that a structural engineer would be required to review the design of the wall and its foundation prior to issuance of a permit by the City of Tulsa. When asked about his own experience walking by similar walls in North Maple Ridge, Commissioner Schoell stated that he rarely noticed them and found them to provide a level of privacy along the sidewalk. Commissioner Parker requested that the height of the wooden fence be reduced to five feet (5'-0"), but the applicant objected and noted that other similar designs with a greater height had been approved. Commissioner Jones agreed that the adjustment would probably not be necessary because others in the neighborhood had been approved. Commissioner McKee noted that the guidelines had been revised within the past ten years, and Commissioner Parker stated that the Tulsa Preservation Commission is not bound by precedent. Upon a comment from Commissioner Reeds, the applicant confirmed that the brick would match the brick presently on the site exactly.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1002 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Turner
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Jones			
6. McKee			
7. Parker			
8. Reeds			
9. Shears			
10. Townsend			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported that the review of the appeal of the denial of the application for Historic Preservation Permit Number HP-0116-2019 had been postponed until the Regular Meeting of the City of Tulsa Board of Adjustment on September 24. Staff requested that a member of the Tulsa Preservation Commission be present at that review.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

Upon inquiry by Commissioner Parker, staff commented that additional funds for the Certified Local Government Program had been received. The funds could be used to host a historic homeowners' fair in May 2020.

Commissioner Schoell requested information about a workshop on windows, and staff noted that enough additional funds were available to sponsor a workshop in autumn. A former clinic now serving as a church has been offered as a site for the event. A date would need to be set, and afterwards announcements could be released via Facebook and the Tulsa Preservation Commission's website.

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 11:51 A.M.