



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, November 27, 2018, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:39 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Ted Reeds, Chair  
David Schoell, Vice-Chair  
Peter Grant, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner  
Katelyn Parker\*  
Robert Shears

#### **Members Absent**

Holly Becker  
Joy Jones  
Susan McKee  
Mary Lee Townsend  
Jim Turner

\*Late Arrival

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Audrey Blank

#### **Others Present**

Jim Brackett, George Anding, Bill Brackett, Molly Evans, Nathan Pickard,  
Whitney Stauffer, Chip Atkins, Molly Jones, Jana Burk, Jorge Robles, Cherie Cook

#### 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 8, 2018

Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, November 8, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Schoell			Jones
3. Grant			McKee
4. Bumgarner			Townsend
5. Parker			Turner
6. Shears			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0051-2018 / 1535 S. Yorktown Ave.** (Yorktown)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: November 1, 2018, November 20, 2018*  
Applicant: George Anding  
Proposal:
  1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, and afterwards Commissioner Reeds noted that the applicant had responded to the recommendations offered by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. In response to a request for clarification about the location of the brackets, the applicant indicated that the brackets would be inserted near the corners.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1535 S. Yorktown Ave. **(Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Schoell			Jones
3. Grant			McKee
4. Bumgarner			Townsend
5. Parker			Turner
6. Shears			

2. **HP-0053-2018 / 640 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 20, 2018*

Applicant: Molly Jones

Proposal:

- 1. Substitution of structural masonry for rammed earth for construction of exterior walls and columns

*Amendment to an Approved Proposal by the Tulsa Preservation Commission on April 13, 2017*

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant noted the addition of wainscot to the facades. Commissioner Reeds commented that the design revealed an evolution from a monolithic to a manmade structure and noted that the owner’s avocation of woodworking was reflected in the title of the project—The Joinery.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Vote: 640 N. Denver Ave. **(Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Schoell			Jones
3. Grant			McKee
4. Bumgarner			Townsend
5. Parker			Turner
6. Shears			

3. **HP-0054-2018 / 1920 S. Cincinnati Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 20, 2018*

Applicant: Selser Schaefer Architects

Proposals:

- 1. Replacement of signage on Council Oak Elementary School
- 2. Replacement of inscription on benches

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that, as directed by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, investigations of any previous appearance of the inscriptions on the arch near the former entry to the stadium and on the Main Entry had been conducted. No documentation in the records of the Tulsa Public Schools was discovered, and photographs in the Beryl Ford Collection indicated that their appearance had not changed in the past ninety years.

Discussion continued with comments on the proposal and inquiries about techniques for intervention. Commissioner Reeds commented that the strategy of replacement in kind was appropriate, and the applicant offered an assurance about adoption of the least invasive technique for replacement of the inscriptions. Neighborhood Representative Atkins commented that the adoption of Council Oak Elementary School as the new name merely substituted an affiliation with those members of the Muscogee (Creek) Nation who owned slaves for an affiliation with Robert E. Lee. In his opinion, the more appropriate solution would be retention of the present inscriptions and the addition of signage with the new name. Commissioner Reeds noted his respect for Mr. Atkins's opinion but commented that selection of a name was not the charge of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and added that the application had been forwarded with a recommendation for approval by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Mr. Atkins expressed concern that the removal of the inscriptions would hinder the pursuit of incentives in the program for Historic Preservation Tax Credits. Staff noted that eligibility for participation in the program was restricted to a building identified as a Contributing Resource to a district or individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places and that Council Oak Elementary School lacked these designations. Commissioner Shears expressed disapproval of the alteration of historic signage. Commissioner Parker expressed approval of the concealment, rather than removal, of inscriptions but advocated preservation of historic signage.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: 1920 S. Cincinnati Ave. **(North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Shears	Parker	Becker
2. Schoell			Jones
3. Grant			McKee
4. Bumgarner			Townsend
			Turner

With the departure of Commissioner Bumgarner and Commissioner Schoell due to the conflicts with their schedules, quorum could not be maintained, and the Regular Meeting ended at 5:13 P.M.