



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, August 28, 2018, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:54 P.M.

Members Present

Ted Reeds, Chair
Peter Grant, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner*

Members Absent

Holly Becker
Joy Jones
Susan McKee
David Schoell, Vice-Chair

*Late Arrival

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin

Others Present

Eddie James, Jack Page, Marycarol Page, Pat Magee

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 9, 2018

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, August 9, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		Shears	Becker
2. Grant			Jones
3. Bumgarner			McKee
4. Townsend			Schoell
5. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-18-030 / 1591 Swan Dr.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 21, 2018
Applicant: Eddie James
Proposals:
 1. Construction of carport in street yard
 2. Installation of garage door at entry to carport

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that the installation of the door would provide a practical solution for entry to the carport and added that concern about security was a factor. Commissioner Reeds observed that no significant measure of difference existed between the present appearance of the residence and its appearance as proposed with the construction of the carport without the garage door. The applicant produced a sample of the skylight and the metal frame for inspection. Commissioner Shears then presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the residence was considered a Non-Contributing Resource and should be viewed as a product of its own era and that the construction of the carport had been recommended for approval.

As the discussion continued, attention focused on the proposal for installation of the garage door. Commissioner Grant commented that installation of an overhead door would be a conventional solution. Commissioner Townsend expressed concern that installation of a garage door at the entry to the carport would actually create a garage and requested clarification about the requirements in the Zoning Code. Staff noted that, according to Section 90.090-C.1.f, all sides of a carport within the street setback must be open. Commissioner Grant inquired whether

any part of the cover for the carport would be attached to the walls, and the applicant indicated that the cover could be independently supported on columns. Commissioner Shears commented that the drawings appeared to depict the cover connected to the walls, and Commissioner Reeds commented that a cover supported on columns would be more appropriate. The applicant indicated that the proposal could be modified. Commissioner Townsend observed that the proximity of the carport to Swan Drive was a factor, adding that the enclosure with a garage door would detract from the appearance of the landscape along Swan Drive. Commissioner Bumgarner commented that the best solution seemed to be installation of the cover and operable gates at the entry to the carport. Commissioner Townsend agreed.

As there was no further discussion, staff reminded the commissioners that the proposals should be addressed with separate motions. Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application for the construction of the carport with the condition that the cover be independently supported on columns. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1591 Swan Dr. (Swan Lake)
Construction of carport in street yard

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Grant			Jones
3. Bumgarner			McKee
4. Shears			Schoell
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

Commissioner Turner made a motion for disapproval of the application for the installation of the garage door. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Installation of garage door at entry to carport

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Grant			Jones
3. Bumgarner			McKee
4. Shears			Schoell
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

2. **HP-0033-2018 / 1711 S. Detroit Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jack L. Page

Proposal:

1. Replacement of two windows on west facade

Staff presented its report, and afterwards Mr. Magee, the applicant's contractor, commented that the objective was a match of the original windows, adding that the width of the windows posed a challenge. The windows are fifty-six inches (56") in width, and the maximum width of double-hung windows currently available is fifty-two inches (52"). The window selected as a replacement would be a picture window, and muntins would be applied to match the appearance of the original windows. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the dimensions of the simulated-divided-light window and was informed that a muntin with a dimension of 7/8" was available. Commissioner Turner inquired whether a spacer bar was inserted between the panes and was informed that this element was present. Commissioner Turner then inquired whether muntins could be inserted on the interior of the window to create the appearance of a simulated-divided-light window and was informed that muntins could be inserted. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the material of the window selected as a replacement and was informed that the material was a patented product composed with fiberglass. The contractor presented a sample of the window for inspection. Commissioner Grant inquired about the condition of the original windows and was informed that the windows were in satisfactory condition, although the storm windows were in poor condition. The applicant commented that the storm windows had been damaged during maintenance and could not easily be replaced and expressed concern about the lack of efficiency without their installation. Commissioner Townsend observed that in Europe storm windows were installed in the interior. Commissioner Shears commented that custom-made wooden storm windows were available. The applicant noted that, were those windows to be damaged, the same dilemma would occur. Commissioner Bumgarner commented that interior storm windows presented challenges with maintenance and that the applicant would require assistance because of their size. Commissioner Grant inquired about the dimensions of the sash, and the applicant's contractor indicated that the dimensions could be modified to match the original window as closely as possible. Commissioner Grant noted the difference in dimensions of the rails on the original window, and the applicant's contractor assured Commissioner Grant about the match of those dimensions. Commissioner Turner commented that, upon installation, the windows would appear smaller, but Commissioner Reeds observed that, with removal of the storm windows, the windows would appear to match the size of the original windows.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that muntins with a width of 7/8” be inserted on the exterior and interior of the window and that dimensions of the rails and stiles match those of the original windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner. Because the vote ended in a tie, approval of the application was denied.

Vote: 1711 S. Detroit Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Grant		Becker
2. Bumgarner	Shears		Jones
3. Turner	Townsend		McKee
			Schoell

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Chairman Reeds reported on the review of the proposal for a Special Exception for the project which would affect the property located at 9 West Matthew Brady Street, which was identified as a Contributing Resource to the Brady Historic District. The proposal had not been reviewed by the Board of Adjustment prior to his departure for the Regular Meeting of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on work in progress at 1904 South Yorktown Avenue. The Cheairs Furniture Company Building and the Vernon African Methodist Episcopal Church have been listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

Amanda J. DeCort, Executive Director of the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture, announced that the request for a Special Exception for the project at 9 West Matthew Brady Street had been denied.

G. Adjournment

Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:02 P.M.