



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, July 24, 2018, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

Members Present

Ted Reeds, Chair
David Schoell, Vice-Chair
Peter Grant, Secretary
Joy Jones*
Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Holly Becker
Chris Bumgarner
David Pounds

*Late Arrival

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Audrey Blank

Others Present

Sharon Burl, Sally Davies, Katelyn Parker, Mallory Massey, Damon Ousley,
John Acton, Michael Lapolla, Mark Sanders, Brian Parker

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, July 12, 2018
Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, July 12, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell		Reeds	Becker
2. Grant		Townsend	Bumgarner
3. McKee			Jones
4. Shears			Pounds
5. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

Because the applicant for Actionable Item 1 on the agenda had not arrived and because the applicant for Actionable Item 2 on the agenda had withdrawn the application, Chairman Reeds selected Actionable Item 3 to be reviewed firstly.

1. **HP-0020-2018 / 2215 E. 18th St.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kenneth L. Kincaid

Proposals:

1. Increase in width of driveway
2. Construction of retaining walls

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that the width of the driveway posed challenges with navigation and that the construction of the walls would improve the appearance of the lawn. Commissioner Shears noted that a wall constructed of stacked boulders would be appropriate for this residence. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the selection of sixteen feet (16'-0") as the desired width for the driveway, and the applicant responded that a more narrow width would be acceptable. Commissioner Schoell then observed that a width of sixteen feet (16'-0") would be too narrow to accommodate two vehicles parked side by side. The applicant indicated that a width of twelve feet (12'-0") had been considered. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the wall located near the western edge of the property belonged to the applicant, but the applicant was uncertain about the location of the boundary. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the pavers along the driveway and was informed that the previous owner had installed them. Commissioner Townsend then inquired whether the actual width of the surfaces was approximately ten feet (10'-0"), as the driveway was approximately eight feet (8'-0") wide and the pavers were approximately two feet (2'-0") wide. Commissioner Jones commented that an increase in the width of the driveway to twelve feet (12'-0") would improve the curb appeal, and Commissioner McKee observed that this width would fit the character of the neighborhood better than a width of sixteen feet (16'-0"). Commissioner Turner commented that the addition of steps along the driveway would be appropriate.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the width of the driveway not exceed twelve feet (12'-0"). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved by majority.

Vote: 2215 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Turner		Becker
2. Schoell			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Pounds
4. Jones			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

2. **HP-0022-2018 / 1211 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Robert L. Shears

Proposal:

1. Reconstruction of eaves on east facade of porte cochère

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had provided documentation to guide the process of reconstruction of the eaves. Commissioner Schoell complimented the applicant on the effort towards the restoration of the residence to its former appearance.

As there was no further discussion, the applicant recused himself, and afterwards Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1211 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Turner		Becker
2. Schoell			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Pounds
4. Jones			Shears
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

3. **HP-0021-2018 / 1115 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 17, 2018

Applicant: Mallory I. Massey

Proposals:

1. Replacement of windows
2. Replacement of door
3. Replacement of columns
4. Construction of handrail for steps
5. Construction of fence
6. Installation of brackets under eaves
7. Installation of lattice under porch
8. Installation of lamp on wall of porch
9. Installation of lamp on ceiling of porch
10. Application of paint to masonry
11. Removal of chimney
12. Removal of window on south facade
13. Removal of trim on beam above porch
14. Adjustment of projection of eaves on porch

Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting recommendations for approval of the proposals for replacement of the door and construction of the fence. Additional items for review—Items 6–14—were identified during the review by the members of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The applicant complained that she had been “singled out” and noted that windows had been purchased and were replaced with the windows presently installed, that only a single example of a door had been provided by the staff of the Tulsa Preservation Commission, that the columns matched the column found in the basement, that the lattice prevented intrusion by vermin, that the lamps provided necessary illumination, that no paint had been applied to the masonry, that the chimney had collapsed during repair of the roof, that only the frame of the window on the south facade was actually present as the wall on the interior of the residence had been sealed, and that the trim on the beam was still present. Her contractor, Mr. Ousley, could not remember the original depth of the eaves and added that a considerable amount of effort had been exerted to comply with the code.

In response to her complaint, Commissioners Reeds and Grant assured the applicant that she had not been “singled out” and that occasionally owners appeared with requests for approval after completion of a project. Commissioner Reeds added that the Unified Design Guidelines had been developed to protect the value of property within the Historic Preservation Overlay Districts and that the procedure for review and approval of proposals should be followed. Commissioner Townsend presumed that documentation could be provided and noted its

importance for review of applications, and Commissioner Reeds requested the specifications for the lamps as an example of the type of documentation to be provided.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds proposed a Special Meeting of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee to address the proposals in Items 1, 3-4, and 6-14. Staff was directed to prepare the agenda and arrange reservations of a venue for a Special Meeting on July 27. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the replacement of the door and construction of the fence. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and was approved unanimously. .

Vote: 1115 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Becker
2. Schoell			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Pounds
4. Jones			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

4. **HP-0026-2018 / 225 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: John W. Acton

Proposal:

1. Replacement of window on west facade

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that the original window was actually smaller than the window presently installed. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether only the upper section of the window would be replaced and was informed that a window with a fixed pane would be installed and that the lower section would be replaced with siding. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether the applicant regretted the installation of the window presently on this facade, and the applicant so indicated. Commissioner Grant advised the applicant to replace the entire length of a piece of siding, rather than resort to replacement of shorter lengths.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: 225 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

In Favor

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Grant
4. Jones
5. Shears
7. Townsend

Opposed

- McKee
Turner

Abstaining

Not Present

- Becker
Bumgarner
Pounds

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None
2. Staff Report

Staff noted several expressions of concern about proposals for projects at Lee Elementary School had been received and added that members of the community would participate in the session for Public Comment. Commissioners Townsend and Turner commented on previous reviews of proposals for projects submitted by Tulsa Public Schools.

D. New Business

Commissioner Reeds announced the resignation of Commissioner Pounds and commended his service to the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Staff will forward the Letter of Resignation to Mayor Bynum.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Turner proposed a formal recognition of Commissioner Pounds during a future Regular Meeting. Staff will contact Commissioner Pounds about his schedule.

F. Public Comment

Several members of the community expressed concerns about previous and anticipated projects at Lee Elementary School. Mr. Lapolla requested that Tulsa Public Schools be reminded about the requirement for review and approval of proposals by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Mr. Sanders commented that the inscriptions on the facades and on features on the grounds were vulnerable and encouraged Tulsa Public Schools' submission of proposals for review by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Staff was directed to draft correspondence to address the issue of review and approval of proposals.

Mr. Parker, president of the Brady Heights Neighborhood Association, expressed his appreciation of the efforts of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and his desire for a more effective partnership. A survey of residences in Brady Heights will be forwarded to the staff of the Tulsa Preservation Commission to supplement its documentation of the neighborhood.

G. Adjournment

As there were no other comments, Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:15 P.M.