



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, May 22, 2018, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters  
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:32 P.M.

**Members Present**

Ted Reeds, Chair  
David Schoell, Vice-Chair  
Peter Grant, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner  
Susan McKee  
Robert Shears  
Mary Lee Townsend  
Jim Turner

**Members Absent**

David Pounds

**Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

**Others Present**

Tom Vincent, Michelle Medlock, Annie Hartzog, Jody Collins

2. Approval of Minutes from May 10, 2018  
Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, May 10, 2018**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		McKee	Pounds
2. Schoell		Shears	
3. Grant			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

**B. Actionable Items**

1. **1010 E. 8<sup>th</sup> St.** (Fire Alarm Building Easement)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 3, 2018*

Applicant: Whit Todd, AIA

Proposals:

1. Construction of ramp for accessibility
2. Installation of door
3. Installation of grates
4. Installation of security lights on facade
5. Expansion of parking

Staff presented its report, noting that the Tulsa Preservation Commission's authority to review the proposal had been verified after the review of the easement by its counsel. Commissioner Reeds commented that the ramp should be regarded as temporary, that approval should be granted for five years, and that the approval should expire after that period unless a request for an extension were presented. Commissioner Turner inquired about the specifications for the grates and was informed that they would be fitted with a hinge and a lock and would not extend past the level of the grade. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the sill of the window would be exposed and was informed that the sill would remain intact. Commissioner McKee inquired about the specifications for the door and was informed that a metal door with a flat panel and a lever for hardware would be selected.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the ramp be noted as temporary and that approval of the project would expire in five years. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved by majority.

**Vote: 1010 E. 8<sup>th</sup> St. (Fire Alarm Building Easement)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		Shears	Pounds
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

**2. HP-0001-2018 / 230 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)**

Applicants: Rachel Blue and Tom Vincent

Proposals:

1. Construction of fence
2. Replacement of driveway
3. Construction of garage
4. Extension of porte cochère to new garage

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the details recommended during its review had been incorporated. Commissioner Reeds then inquired about the doors on the garage and was informed that both overhead and carriage house doors were available. Commissioner Reeds next inquired about the placement of the garage, and Ms. Medlock, the applicants' consultant, responded that the line for the sewer, which was indicated on the Site Plan, was far enough from the boundary, that the garage was located four feet (4'-0") from the sewer, and that the alley had been abandoned. Commissioner Reeds requested confirmation that the requirements for open space had been met and was informed that the street yard on Detroit Avenue would be open and that the fence had been relocated closer to the residence. Commissioner Bumgarner noted that the proposal would be reviewed for its compliance with the requirements by the staff of the Permit Center. Ms. Medlock commented that the new window on the garage would match the windows on the residence and added that no depth for the profile of the muntins had been provided by Pella Windows. Commissioner Turner observed that this type of window had been previously approved and inquired about the extension of the breezeway.

Discussion then focused on the connection between the porte cochère and the garage and the heights of those elements. Ms. Medlock commented that the deck of the roof would be reconstructed and new shingles would be installed. Commissioner Turner inquired about the intersection of the roof of the extension and the roof of the garage, and Commissioner Grant requested confirmation that the height of the roof would be seventeen feet (17'-0") as shown on the elevation. Ms. Medlock replied that the present height of the porte cochère would indeed be retained, and Commissioner Turner responded that the intersection would not occur exactly as presented on the elevation. Commissioner McKee observed that the lines of the gutters failed to meet. Commissioner Turner inquired about the height of the door on the garage and was informed that the height would be nine feet (9'-0"), but Commissioner Reeds noted that ten feet (10'-0") was indicated on the elevation.

Discussion then focused on other aspects of the proposal. Commissioner Shears inquired about the columns and was informed that a column would be located near the walkway and that the gate would have a lock. Commissioner Turner inquired about the material for the siding on the garage and was informed that HardiePlank Lap Siding would be installed with an exposure to match that on the residence. Commissioner Turner inquired whether a match with the Palladian Window on the residence had been considered for the window on the garage and was informed that the objective had been a match with the windows on the east facade of the residence. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the entry to the driveway and was informed that the entry or curb cut would match the present entry in its configuration, although the driveway would be wider. Commissioner McKee inquired about the material for the new columns and was informed that the brick would match the brick presently on the columns. Commissioner Shears inquired about the accommodation of the slope of the site, and Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the driveway would follow the slope of the site. Commissioner Schoell expressed his appreciation for the concept but noted that more documentation would be required to address the issues raised in the review. Commissioner Reeds likewise found the proposal acceptable in principle and reiterated the necessity for additional documentation. Ms. Medlock requested and received assurance about the acceptance of the proposal, which would permit additional documentation to be completed. Commissioner Shears noted that a finished floor elevation would be critical. The applicant agreed to address the issues and present a revised version of the proposal at a future Regular Meeting.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to continue the review of the application with the consent of the applicant. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 230 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Pounds
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

**3. HP-0003-2018 / 1705 S. Cincinnati Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: Annie Heartfield Hartzog

Proposal:

1. Replacement of vinyl fence with wooden fence  
*Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on November 28, 2017*

Staff presented its report, noting the request for an amendment to an approved proposal. The applicant commented that the retaining wall would be located eighteen inches (18”) from the sidewalk and that the fence would be located an additional eighteen inches (18”) further from the sidewalk. Commissioner Shears inquired about the location of the setback, and the applicant indicated confirmation of the distance. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the applicant’s preference for a design, and the applicant expressed her preference for a simple pattern, indicating that the version without the “X” pattern would be acceptable. Commissioner Shears proposed that the fence be double-sided to appear identical on both sides.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application, indicating that Option 1 without the “X” pattern could be selected at the applicant’s discretion. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1705 S. Cincinnati Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Pounds
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

4. **HP-0006-2018 / 1539 S. Detroit Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Powers Design and Build

Proposal:

1. Replacement of two windows on north facade

Staff presented its report, noting that the windows selected as replacements would match the windows previously approved. The applicant noted that the locations of these windows had been fully revealed upon the removal of the Masonite Siding. Commissioner Turner inquired about the dimensions and was informed that they were approximately three feet (3'-0") in width and four feet (4'-0") in height. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the windows were double-hung, and the applicant responded that identification was inconclusive. Commissioner Schoell speculated that casement windows could have been installed, and Commissioner McKee observed that both single and double-hung windows could have been present.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1539 S. Detroit Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

**In Favor**

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Grant
4. McKee
5. Shears
6. Townsend
7. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

Bumgarner  
Pounds

5. **HP-0007-2018 / 1232 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jody L. Collins

Proposal:

1. Replacement of chain-link fence with wooden fence

Staff presented its report, noting the applicant's concern about security. The applicant commented that the fence would be less visible when viewed from the south and added that the fence would be constructed with 1x4 planks and be six feet (6'-0") in height. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the wrought-iron gate would be retained and was informed that the gate would remain. Commissioner Shears inquired whether a 2x6 cap had been considered, and the applicant indicated that a cap would be considered. Commissioner Shears recommended the addition of 1x2 trim under the cap.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Shear made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the fence be constructed with 1x4 cedar planks, a 2x6 cedar cap, and 1x2 cedar trim under the cap. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1232 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds 2. Schoell 3. Grant 4. McKee 5. Shears 6. Townsend 7. Turner			Bumgarner Pounds

**6. HP-0008-2018 / 1575 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas

Proposal:

1. Relocation of meter to west side of residence

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant agreed to place the meter in a less visible location. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1575 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds 2. Schoell 3. Grant 4. McKee 5. Shears 6. Townsend 7. Turner			Bumgarner Pounds

- C. Reports
  - 1. Chair Report  
None
  - 2. Staff Report  
None
  
- D. New Business  
None
  
- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None
  
- F. Public Comment  
None
  
- G. Adjournment  
Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:59 P.M.