



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, February 8, 2018, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:04 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Ted Reeds, Chair  
David Schoell, Vice-Chair  
Peter Grant, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner  
Mike Craddock  
Susan McKee  
Mary Lee Townsend

#### **Members Absent**

David Pounds  
Robert Shears  
Jim Turner

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Philip E. Marshall, Marina Haver, Barbara Olson, Darwin Olson, Shaun Schaefer

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from January 23, 2018

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, January 23, 2018**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		McKee	Pounds
2. Schoell		Townsend	Shears
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. Craddock			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

**B. Actionable Items**

1. **HP-18-009 / 1546 S. Yorktown Pl. (Gillette)**  
Applicants: Darwin and Barbara Olson  
Request:  
1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that a request for clarification in the representation of the windows had been addressed and that the proposal had been forwarded with a recommendation for approval.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved unanimously.

**Vote: HP-18-009 / 1546 S. Yorktown Pl. (Gillette)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Pounds
2. Schoell			Shears
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. Craddock			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			

2. **HP-18-007 / 2330 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Philip E. Marshall

Request:

1. Substitution of Simulated-Divided-Light Vinyl Windows with 7/8" muntins  
*Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on December 14, 2017*

Staff presented its report, noting that 7/8" muntins had been approved for Installation elsewhere in Barnard Trace. The applicant commented that 5/8" muntins had been previously approved but those muntins with a 3/8" putty profile were unavailable. Commissioner Schoell commented that the muntins could be available from another manufacturer, and the applicant responded that his source for the windows lacked windows with this profile. Commissioner Schoell noted that the profile was available in aluminum-clad wooden windows and encouraged the commissioners to be mindful of the dimensions of vinyl windows in future reviews.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote:** HP-18-007 / 2330 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Schoell		Pounds
2. Grant	McKee		Shears
3. Bumgarner	Townsend		Turner
4. Craddock			

3. **HP-18-010 / 1704 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: David W. Schoell

Request:

1. Substitution of HardiePlank Lap Siding for wooden fascia  
*Application to amend previous approval of an application by staff of Tulsa Preservation Commission on August 1, 2017*

Staff presented its report, noting that HardiePlank Lap Siding had occasionally been approved for installation. The applicant noted that the material would be HardieTrim Board, expressed concern that, if the entire fascia were replaced, the fascia would appear to be new, and added that cedar would be used if it were affordable.

As there was no further discussion, the applicant recused himself, and Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** HP-18-010 / 1704 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Pounds
2. Grant			Shears
3. Bumgarner			Turner
4. Craddock			Schoell
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			

4. **HP-18-011 / 1913 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kevin J. Levesque

Requests:

1. Replacement of front door with Craftsman-Style door
2. Removal of window on west facade

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had removed the window before he was aware of the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit. Several commissioners expressed concern about the appearance of the wall after the removal of the window.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the entire west facade be painted to ensure an uniform appearance. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** HP-18-011 / 1913 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Pounds
2. Schoell			Shears
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. Craddock			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			

5. **HP-18-012 / 1540 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer

Request:

1. Replacement of windows

Staff presented its report, and the applicant noted that the windows had been installed as the project was assumed to be exempt from the requirement for a permit due to the location of the residence. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the windows previously installed were original, and the applicant expressed his uncertainty. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether those windows were double-hung and, after being informed that they were, noted that the windows selected as replacements were windows with sashes which could be tilted. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the dimension of the profile and was informed that the distance between sash and pane was more narrow than the distance on the windows previously on the residence. Commissioner Bumgarner expressed his doubt about the scope of the review, as the property could not be sold separately. Staff noted that the property was used as a residence, not a garage, and should be considered a residence, therefore. Commissioner Schoell encouraged the applicant to explore adjustment of the tone of the paint, and the applicant responded that his contractor had assured him that the original color of the trim could be matched. Commissioner Reeds observed that the property had once served as an accessory and had become a residence, and Commissioner McKee noted that the site had been a residence and a studio for an artist. Commissioner Bumgarner commented that the property could become a garage again. Staff noted that the property was treated as a separate residence by its owner. Commissioner Reeds commented that the windows matched closely enough.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote:** HP-18-012 / 1540 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	McKee	Schoell	Pounds
2. Grant			Shears
3. Bumgarner			Turner
4. Craddock			
5. Townsend			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report  
None
2. Staff Report  
None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:01 P.M.