



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, September 26, 2017, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Craddock called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:37 P.M.

Members Present

Mike Craddock, Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner
Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Michael Birkes
Peter Grant
David Pounds
Ted Reeds

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Shaun Schaefer, Bridgette Staub, Dean Wersal

2. Approval of Minutes from September 14, 2017

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, September 14, 2017

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Craddock | | | Birkes |
| 2. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 3. Bumgarner | | | Pounds |
| 4. McKee | | | Reeds |
| 5. Shears | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. Turner | | | |

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-17-092 / 1710 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Bridgette J. Staub
Request:
 1. Replacement of six windows

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that, because she was unaware of the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit, a deposit of \$2,500 had already been provided to Window World of Tulsa and that, having become aware of the preference for exterior muntins, inquiries about their availability and expense had been pursued. The applicant was informed by Window World of Tulsa that vinyl muntins would add \$200 to the expense of each window and had therefore contacted several sources about wooden and aluminum muntins but was unsuccessful. Commissioner Craddock noted that the guidelines must be addressed, adding that distributors were aware of the requirement for a permit in the districts, and the applicant responded that the dealer was surprised by the existence of the guidelines. Commissioner Shears requested clarification about the type of windows on the second story and was informed that the windows were double-hung, metal windows which had been patched with painter's tape by the previous owner. Commissioner Turner commented on the appearance of vinyl windows, noting that they lacked resemblance to historic windows. The applicant commented on the distortion created by the storm windows currently installed, and Commissioner Shears agreed, adding that vinyl windows likewise created distortion as they lacked depth. Commissioner Schoell commented on his personal experience with vinyl windows, noting that the vinyl windows installed on his previous residence failed to perform satisfactorily

within six years. The applicant responded that these windows offered an affordable solution and that guarantees had been provided. Commissioner McKee inquired about the condition of the windows and was informed that they were in “terrible condition” with some windows being held together with tape. Commissioner Turner then commented on the existing windows, noting that the sash seemed to have been placed where the trim would have been and expressing concern about a lack of connection for any windows proposed for installation. Commissioner Bumgarner noted that vinyl windows would limit the palette of color for the owner. Commissioner McKee inquired whether a refund had been requested and was informed that the manufacturer had been contacted immediately after the previous review but the windows were already in production. Commissioner Craddock commented that the vinyl windows lacked the detail which historically appropriate windows would have and noted that the manufacturer would be held to a standard of performance. The staff informed the applicant that the manufacturer was as responsible as the applicant for being informed about requirements and advised the applicant to seek the advice of an attorney, as Window World of Tulsa had sold windows which could not be installed. Commissioner Townsend proposed that the applicant request the manufacturer to supply the muntins. Commissioner Shears noted that the windows selected as the replacement for the picture window with its three panels did not match.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny approval of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved by majority. At the applicant’s request, the staff was directed to provide an explanation of the denial, which could be used by the applicant during her negotiations with Window World of Tulsa.

Vote: 1710 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Craddock | Turner | Bumgarner | Birkes |
| 2. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 3. McKee | | | Pounds |
| 4. Shears | | | Reeds |
| 5. Townsend | | | |

2. HP-17-099 / 1624 S. Victor Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer

Requests:

1. Installation of aluminum covers on window frames
2. Installation of aluminum covers on trim on doors

Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on July 25, 2017

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the objectives were the creation of a uniform appearance, as the covers would match the aluminum-clad wood windows, and the extension of the life of the trim on the windows and doors. Commissioner Craddock requested additional information about this treatment, and Commissioner Turner responded that the installation of covers was common and offered advantages for maintenance. Commissioner Shears inquired whether the covers would be attached with adhesive, but Commissioner Turner could not remember any application of adhesive. Commissioner Schoell expressed approval, noting that the installation of the covers reflected the spirit of the aluminum-clad windows, and inquired about the finish on the covers. The applicant indicated that the covers would have a faux-grain finish and added that the finish was hardly visible.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1624 S. Victor Ave. (Yorktown)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Craddock | | | Birkes |
| 2. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 3. Bumgarner | | | Pounds |
| 4. McKee | | | Reeds |
| 5. Shears | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. Turner | | | |

3. HP-17-100 / 1527 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Dean Wersal

Requests:

1. Reconstruction of retaining wall with surface inclined to match angle of bulkheads
2. Replacement of steps and installation of recessed lights at base of each step

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the lawn once sloped downward to the sidewalk and that the wall had been constructed in 1953, according to the previous owner's son, and had deteriorated so severely that it was ready to collapse. Commissioner Shears commented that the proposed treatment of the wall was present elsewhere, and Commissioner Turner agreed, noting the challenges with drainage. The applicant mentioned that stone from the wall would be salvaged for the project.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1527 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Craddock | | | Birkes |
| 2. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 3. Bumgarner | | | Pounds |
| 4. McKee | | | Reeds |
| 5. Shears | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. Turner | | | |

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Chairman Craddock reported that correspondence with the Tulsa Preservation Commission's expression of concern about the proposal for installation of speed humps and signage on South Madison Avenue had been prepared, and staff confirmed that the correspondence had been personally delivered to the Office of the Mayor and the Tulsa City Council's office and forwarded to other recipients via electronic mail. Commissioner Schoell reported that the Mayor and a member of his staff would travel to Fayetteville to view efforts to calm traffic.

2. Staff Report

None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:38 P.M.