



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 10, 2017, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Craddock called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:01 A.M.

Members Present

Mike Craddock, Chair
Ted Reeds, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Michael Birkes
Chris Bumgarner
Peter Grant
David Pounds
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend

Members Absent

Susan McKee
Jim Turner

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Lyle and Jan Johnson, Christian Oliva, Mark Sanders

2. Approval of Minutes from July 25, 2017

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, July 25, 2017

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		Birkes	Bumgarner
2. Reeds		Pounds	McKee
3. Schoell		Townsend	Turner
4. Grant			
5. Shears			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-17-084 / 1716 S. Quaker Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 3, 2017
Applicant: Christian Oliva
Request:
 1. Reconstruction of front porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, referring specifically to the request for information about the windows. Commissioner Grant inquired about the material for the floor of the porch, and the applicant responded that the material would be 3-1/8" Douglas Fir tongue-and-groove boards, which would be stained. Commissioner Reeds requested confirmation of the material for the window and, when informed that the window would be aluminum, recommended an aluminum-clad, wooden window. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the material of the existing windows, was informed that they were fiberglass, and inquired about a match of those windows. The applicant mentioned an attempt to match the windows, noting that doors had actually been installed to serve as windows. Commissioner Grant inquired whether other vendors had been contacted, and the applicant responded that several vendors had been consulted and that expense was a factor in the selection.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the condition that 3-1/8" Douglas Fir tongue-and-groove boards be installed for the floor of the porch. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: 1716 S. Quaker Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock	Schoell		McKee
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Birkes			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Grant			
6. Pounds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			

2. HP-17-085 / 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Muselmann

Request:

1. Construction of fence in street yard

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present but declined to comment. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the installation of a cap, and the applicant indicated that no cap would be installed. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the treatment of the posts and was informed that the posts would be covered with 2x4 boards to which the planks of the fence would be attached. Commissioner Pounds inquired whether the design of the fence was appropriate for the style of the residence. Commissioner Birkes commented that the fence would be an improvement over the chain-link fence on the site, and the applicant noted that a fence with horizontal boards without spaces between them had been constructed across the street. Commissioner Reeds endorsed the arrangement, and the applicant commented that it accented the horizontality of the residence. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether the imitation of the pattern of the siding on the residence had been considered, and the applicant responded that the imitation had been considered but that he preferred a simple solution.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Birkes and approved by majority.

Vote: 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

In Favor

1. Craddock
2. Reeds
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Bumgarner
6. Grant
7. Shears
8. Townsend

Opposed

Abstaining

Pounds

Not Present

McKee
Turner

3. HP-17-086 / 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Muselmann

Requests:

1. Application of stucco to columns on porch
2. Construction of planter in street yard

*Application to amend previous approval of an application
by Tulsa Preservation Commission on March 28, 2017*

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and added that the planters near the southeast corner of the residence had already been approved, that the planter proposed for construction would be similar in appearance to that wall, and that the application of stucco to the column would create the appearance of a mitered corner. Commissioner Schoell inquired about advantages of this treatment, and the applicant responded that the surface would be more durable and expressed his preference for the appearance of the column without any applied ornamentation. Commissioner Birkes inquired about the material for the substrate and was informed that the material would be cement board. To create variety in the surfaces, stucco would be applied with a medium texture on the pier and a smooth finish on the column, and the pier and column would be different colors. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the caps and was informed that the caps on the piers were approximately four inches (0'-4") in height and the caps on the planters were approximately three inches (0'-3") in height and that the overhang would be one-and-a-half inch (0'-1-1/2"). Commissioner Grant inquired about the presence of columns with stucco elsewhere in the neighborhood and was informed that they were present but that the texture was uniform. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the construction of the planter and was informed that eight-inch (0'-8") concrete masonry units would be placed above a footing,

covered with stucco, and sealed with a cap, whose surface would have a bevel for drainage. Commissioner Pounds commented on the application of stucco on columns on a residence with wooden siding, noting that usually those residences featured wooden columns supporting a wooden box beam. Commissioner Townsend inquired whether application of paint on the column had been considered, and the applicant offered his opinion that stucco would present a better appearance and resemble wood.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Birkes and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			McKee
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. Pounds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			

4. **HP-17-077 / 740 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 3, 2017

Applicants: Lyle and Jan Johnson

Request:

1. Construction of single-family residence according to documents submitted

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting the revisions of the East Elevation and the submission of Product Data for the windows, hardware, and fixtures. The applicants commented that the design of the garage doors had not been revised, as they were not fully visible and as a different style would eventually be selected. Commissioner Townsend complimented the appearance of the transom above the entry and commented on the numbers of muntins on the

door. The applicant indicated that an error in their depiction had occurred and that fewer muntins would actually be present. Commissioner Grant inquired about the placement of the windows and was informed that the windows would be placed near the façade, rather than be recessed, to create a more generous stool on the interior. Commissioner Shears inquired about the slope of the roof on the structure adjacent to the residence and was informed that the slope would be identical to the slope of the roof on the residence. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the appearance of the rammed earth and was informed that the intention was removal of any striation to create an homogeneous appearance. Commissioner Craddock inquired about the slope of the roof on the shed and was informed that the slope would match the slopes elsewhere. Commissioner Reeds observed that the windows on the gables seemed too small. The applicants noted that the window on the south side was located in the attic. Commissioner Reeds recommended its removal or its placement on center and higher in the gable.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Birkes made a motion to approve the application with these conditions—(1) revision of the representation of the lites on the front door, (2) adjustment of the slope of the roof of the side porch, (3) installation of 6x6 posts on the side porch, and (4) relocation of the window in the attic. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 740 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			McKee
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. Pounds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			

C. Discussion of Proposal for Installation of Speed Humps on South Madison Avenue between 15th Street and 21st Street

Commissioner Schoell noted that medians as a feature were present in only three districts on the National Register of Historic Places in Tulsa—North Maple Ridge,

Gillette, and Owen Park—and expressed his concern about the impact of the installation of speed humps. Presently six humps in one direction and five humps in the other direction have been proposed for installation in response to a petition. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired whether Commissioner Schoell was more opposed to the signage, and Commissioner Schoell indicated his opposition and his readiness to compromise. In response to an inquiry about the purview of the Tulsa Preservation Commission, the staff noted that the commission lacked the authority to intervene. Chairman Craddock inquired whether a lack of endorsement of the proposal could be forwarded to the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission and the Tulsa City Council. The staff responded that some grounds for appeal of the City of Tulsa’s decision to install speed humps could exist and that, if the commission wished to influence the design, comments could be submitted. Commissioner Pounds expressed concern about future challenges of any issues related to safety and added that, as the median contributes to the character of the district, it should be protected. Commissioner Schoell commented that a delay in implementation had occurred when challenges to the installation arose and proposed that the commission had a responsibility to comment as this issue involved an effect on the character of South Madison Avenue and the district.

Mr. Sanders, a resident of the district, requested permission to address the Tulsa Preservation Commission and was recognized by Chairman Craddock. In his opinion, detours and congestion created by construction of the Gathering Place, rather than speed or volume of traffic, presented the challenge and caused only a temporary dilemma. Noting that the commission cannot dictate policy on safety, he contended that the commission had a role to play when historic resources were affected. In response to his comments, several commissioners proposed an Actionable Item to consider a recommendation at a forthcoming Regular Meeting. The staff recommended an entry for discussion only, and Commissioner Pounds expressed reservations about the role of the commission and the extent of its jurisdiction. Chairman Craddock commented that the commission was granted purview over the Historic Preservation Overlay Districts and added that this issue offered an opportunity to create more cooperation among agencies and divisions of the City of Tulsa. The staff recommended appointment of an ad hoc committee to review the issue thoroughly and report to the commission. Commissioners Schoell and Birkes volunteered to form the committee.

- D. Reports
 - 1. Chair Report
None
 - 2. Staff Report
None

E. New Business
None

F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

G. Adjournment
Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:35 P.M.