



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, July 25, 2017, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Craddock called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Mike Craddock, Chair  
Ted Reeds, Vice-Chair  
David Schoell, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner  
Susan McKee  
Robert Shears  
Mary Lee Townsend

#### **Members Absent**

Michael Birkes  
Peter Grant  
David Pounds  
Jim Turner

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Janine VanValkenburgh

#### **Others Present**

Casey Fanning, Nick Denison, Paul Clements, Kevin Hale, Susan O'Neal, Joe Parker, Jim Haver, Shaun Schaefer, Meghan and Jacob Johnson, Garth Bjorklund

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from July 13, 2017

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes with the condition that her vote for approval of Actionable Item 1 be noted. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, July 13, 2017**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		Shears	Birkes
2. Reeds			Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-17-067 / 736 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: July 6, 2017, July 18, 2017*  
Applicants: Jacob and Meghan Johnson  
Request:  
1. Construction of single-family residence according to documents submitted

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The applicants commented that the objective had been a style appropriate for the district, and their architects added that the design presented a contemporary interpretation of the Prairie Style with a reliance on rammed earth as a material. Commissioner Reeds commented that rammed earth had been approved for a project elsewhere in the district. The applicants commented that the rammed earth would resemble stucco upon completion of construction. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the material for the sills and caps and was informed that cast-in-place concrete had been selected. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the gutters and was informed that the gutters would have a low profile. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired about the material for the siding and was informed that HardiePlank Siding had been selected.

Discussion then focused on the windows. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the material and was informed that the windows would be Pella aluminum or aluminum-clad windows with simulated divided lites. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the dimensions of the muntins and was informed that they would be no larger than 7/8". Commissioner McKee requested the specific identification of the type of windows, and the applicants indicated that the windows would be aluminum and, in response to an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, that they would be installed flush with the façade.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the muntins have a dimension between 1/2" and 7/8" and that the windows be recessed six inches (0'-6") from the façade. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

**Vote:** 736 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock	McKee		Birkes
2. Reeds			Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

2. **HP-17-070 / 1228 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Chace Daley

Request:

1. Replacement of front door

*Work completed without a Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report and noted that, although the applicant had intended to attend, conflicts with the applicant's schedule had recently arisen and prevented his participation. Chairman Craddock inquired whether an extension had been requested and, upon being informed that an extension had not been requested, directed the review to proceed. Several commissioners commented that the style of the door was not appropriate for the style of the residence, and Commissioner Townsend recommended reference to Sections A.1 and A.3 of the Unified Design Guidelines.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1228 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Birkes
2. Reeds			Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

3. **HP-17-071 / 1624 S. Victor Ave.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer

Request:

1. Replacement of original and non-original windows

Staff presented its report, and the applicant and owner were present but declined to comment. Commissioner McKee inquired whether repair had been pursued, and the applicant responded that repair had been considered but had proven too expensive. Commissioner Reeds observed that two patterns—5/1 and 6/1—were present and inquired which was original. Commissioner McKee commented that the jailhouse-style windows would probably have been original. Commissioner Townsend recommended that the windows selected as replacements match the original windows.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote:** 1624 S. Victor Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock	McKee		Birkes
2. Reeds	Schoell		Grant
3. Bumgarner	Shears		Pounds
4. Townsend			Turner

4. **HP-17-074 / 1601 S. Owasso Ave.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Joe Parker

Request:

1. Construction of fence in street yard

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present but declined to comment. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether other materials had been considered, and the applicant responded that the only materials available were steel and aluminum—the latter having been selected as the applicant will construct the fence himself. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired whether the gate closed and was informed that the gate would have two panels, which could be secured with a pin inserted in the pavement. Commissioner Shears inquired about the connections and was informed that the pieces would be anchored with screws which would be covered. Commissioner Shears then inquired about the installation near the garage and was assured that ease of access would be preserved. Commissioner Schoell expressed his preference for another material, indicating that iron or steel seemed more appropriate for the neighborhood but noting that the construction was reversible.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

**Vote:** 1601 S. Owasso Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock	Townsend		Birkes
2. Reeds			Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. McKee			
6. Shears			

5. **HP-17-075 / 1823 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Casey Fanning

Requests:

1. Adjustment of height of pier on front porch
  2. Construction of caps with concrete masonry units
- Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on June 27, 2017*

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present and commented that, as some confusion had arisen during the review of the application, he assumed that the piers should have the same height. Commissioner Townsend observed that the project as completed represented a departure from the typical Craftsman Style bungalow. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether joints were visible between the concrete masonry units and was informed that joints were visible but the surface was smooth. Commissioner Schoell commented that a precast cap would have been more smooth, and the applicant apologized for the failure to explore construction with precast concrete. Commissioner McKee inquired whether the applicant would be prepared to replace the caps with precast concrete caps, and the applicant responded that, because he and his wife would soon depart for employment overseas, his schedule would not permit that repair to be completed. Commissioner Reeds expressed his preference for a monolithic appearance of the caps.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the joints be flush with the surface and that a coat of elastomeric paint be applied. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

**Vote: 1823 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock	McKee		Birkes
2. Reeds	Townsend		Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. Shears			

**6. HP-17-076 / 1708 S Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Susan O'Neal

Request:

1. Replacement of floor on front porch

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present and commented that an error in her application had been corrected in correspondence with the staff. Commissioner Reeds noted that the original boards would have been more narrow than the boards presently installed. The applicant commented that the tongue-and-groove boards first installed did not match and were removed. However, the boards selected for replacement were not tongue-and-groove lumber. Commissioner Shears inquired about the difference in the dimensions and was informed that the difference was 1/8". Commissioner McKee assured the applicant about the availability of tongue-and-groove lumber for floors. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired about the application of a cap for the exposed ends of the planks and was informed that the original floor did not have a cap.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny approval of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1708 S Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Birkes
2. Reeds			Grant
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. Bumgarner			Turner
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

None

2. Staff Report

None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:15 P.M.