



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, June 6, 2017, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Craddock called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:02 A.M. and noted that Actionable Item 2 had been withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

Members Present

Mike Craddock, Chair
Ted Reeds, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Michael Birkes
Chris Bumgarner
Peter Grant
Susan McKee
David Pounds
Mary Lee Townsend

Members Absent

Robert Shears
Jim Turner

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Audrey Blank

Others Present

Marty McMahan, Tom Neal, Elin Dowdican, Ray Hobbs, Bill Andrew, Becky Johnston, Joe Johnston

2. Approval of Minutes from May 23, 2017

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, May 11, 2017

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		Townsend	Shears
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Pounds			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-17-046 / 1851 E. 17th St.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 1, 2017
Applicant: Marty McMahan
Request:
1. Reconstruction of screened-in porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that a single panel, rather than the multiple panels shown in the Survey Photograph, would flank each lower side of the entry. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1851 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Pounds			
9. Townsend			

2. **HP-17-051 / 1629 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 1, 2017

Applicant: Tom Neal

Request:

1. Construction of carport according to documents submitted

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The applicant was present, commented that the residence had served as the model for the garage and carport, and inquired whether two versions of the proposal could be approved—the version with the width of eleven feet (11'-0") presented to the subcommittee and the version with the width of twelve feet (12'-0") presented at this meeting—as a Special Exception had been pursued. Staff indicated that only a single version could be approved. Commissioner Reeds proposed that only the latter version would be reviewed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1629 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Pounds			
9. Townsend			

3. **HP-17-055 / 1701 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 1, 2017

Applicants: Bill and Karol Andrew

Request:

1. Construction of addition according to documents submitted

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Reeds presented the report for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the height of the ridge had been adjusted and that no vinyl windows would be installed. The applicant was present and commented that specifications for the door near the garage had not been provided. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the scale of the lights,

and the applicant responded that scale in the elevation was accurate. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the hardware for the garage doors and was informed that no hardware would be installed. Commissioner McKee requested information about the number of new windows and was informed that new windows would be installed on the addition and on both sides of the chimney. Commissioner McKee commented that the new windows near the chimney would not be appropriate as their size seemed distorted and added that smaller windows would have been installed originally. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the trim and was informed that the intention was a match of each detail. Commissioner Grant proposed repair of the upper sash and installation of new lower sash, and Commissioner McKee reminded the applicant about the preference for repair, rather than replacement, of historic windows.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that specifications for the door near the entry to the garage and its hardware be submitted and that the windows near the chimney be removed from consideration of this application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1701 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Pounds			
9. Townsend			

4. HP-17-056 / 2123 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Rebecca Johnston

Request:

1. Replacement of three second-story windows

Staff presented its report, and the applicant commented that the intention was a match of the second-story windows previously installed. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Birkes made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Vote: 2123 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Reeds			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Birkes			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Pounds			
9. Townsend			

5. **HP-17-057 / 2115 E. 20th St.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Jeff Foye

Request:

1. Construction of fence in street yard

Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present but declined to comment. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the length of the fence, and the applicant responded that the fence extended to the edge of the driveway. Commissioner Grant inquired about the dimensions of the post and was informed that the post was a 6x6 post.

Discussion then focused on the addition of a return on the fence. Commissioner Townsend inquired about placement, and Commissioner Reeds commented that the fence was flanked by vegetation on its west side and by the driveway on its east side and proposed a return on one panel adjacent to the driveway. Commissioner Birkes expressed concern about the length of the return and its interference with access and proposed a return with the length of one-half of a panel. Commissioner Grant inquired about the height of the scallop and the treatment of the material, and the applicant responded that the height of the scallop would be four inches (4") and that a stain would be applied.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the application with the condition that a return of one-half panel be placed adjacent to the driveway. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pounds and approved by majority.

Vote: 2115 E. 20th St. (Yorktown)

In Favor

1. Craddock
2. Reeds
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Grant
6. McKee
7. Pounds

Opposed

Abstaining

- Bumgarner
Townsend

Not Present

- Shears
Turner

- C. Review and Discussion of Requirements for Documentation for Applications
At Commissioner Schoell's request, a previously approved project was reviewed as an example of flawed execution. Several commissioners commented on the necessity for more documentation. Staff proposed regular inspections of sites during projects and indicated its readiness to pursue implementation of procedures in coordination with Inspection Services.
- D. Reports
1. Chair Report
None
 2. Staff Report
None
- E. New Business
None
- F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None
- G. Adjournment
Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:13 P.M.