



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 10, 2021, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Townsend called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:05 A.M.

Members Present

Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Chair
Susan J. McKee, MFA, Secretary
Holly M. Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Mark D. G. Sanders
Ted A. Reeds II, AIA*
Robert L. Shears, ASLA

Members Absent

James E. Turner, AIA, Vice-Chair
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Jillian Ihloff

Staff Present

Mark D. Swiney, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Michael G. Isley, Stephanie Ames-Mullican, Alicia M. Schultz, Tom Neal, Bryan Dillingham, PLA, ASLA

*Late Arrival

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, May 25, 2021

Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Becker and approved with a majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, May 25, 2021

In Favor

1. Townsend
2. McKee
3. Becker
4. Bumgarner
5. Parker

Opposed

Abstaining

Sanders
Shears

Not Present

Turner
Grant
Ihloff
Reeds

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0278-2021 / 1316 E. 19th St.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 3, 2021
Applicants: Alicia M. and Joshua A. Schultz
Proposal:
 1. Replacement of windows

Staff presented its report, noting that the windows would match those previously approved for installation on the east facade. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended the approval of the application because the west facade is barely visible from the street and the windows will match those previously approved. Commissioner Becker noted that the windows on the north facade are original and would not be replaced. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the dimensions of the muntins. The applicant replied that the muntins would have a profile of seven-eighths of an inch (0'-7/8") and presented a sample of the window selected as the replacement. The applicant added that the new windows would be barely visible and would match those on the east facade but noted that the original windows on the north facade would remain intact. Commissioner Sanders commented on his participation in the review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the limited visibility and the previous approval of the windows on the east facade persuaded him to vote in favor of the application, despite his disapproval of vinyl windows. Commissioner Parker expressed her preference to repair the windows and commented on their quality of materials and expected lifespan. Commissioner McKee agreed and added that the repair of wood windows is more cost effective over time than the installation of vinyl windows. The applicant replied that an estimate to repair the windows had been obtained but the expense was prohibitive, and Commissioner McKee offered to provide the applicant with a resource for repair. Tom Neal, 2507 East 11th Place, recommended a resource. Commissioner Shears agreed that the repair of the original wood windows would be preferable but expressed support for the application due to the previous approval of the windows on the east facade and the limited visibility of the west facade. Commissioner Townsend agreed as well. Upon an inquiry about the implications of a disapproval of the application from Commissioner Becker, Staff explained the applicant's options would be revision of the proposal or an appeal to the Board of Adjustment. Commissioner Townsend noted that the previous approval of the windows on the east facade of the residence would be a factor in the Board of Adjustment's consideration of the appeal.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved with a majority. Commissioner Sanders encouraged the applicant to pursue the repair of the windows rather than their replacement.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6

Vote: 1316 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Townsend | McKee | | Turner |
| 2. Bumgarner | Becker | | Grant |
| 3. Sanders | Parker | | Ihloff |
| 4. Shears | | | Reeds |

2. **HP-0280-2021 / 216 E. 20th St.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 3, 2021
Applicant: Michael G. Isley
Proposals:
1. Replacement of windows
 2. Removal of window

Staff presented its report, noting that the deterioration of the three windows on the north facade prompted the proposal for their replacement. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had no issue with the removal of the small window, as it was not original, and recommended approval of the application. The applicant noted his intention to repair the windows elsewhere on the residence but stated that the repair of the three windows on the north facade would not be feasible. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Shears, the applicant confirmed that single-pane windows were proposed, and Commissioner Parker expressed her approval of the selection. Commissioner Sanders complimented the applicant on his thorough completion of the Window Survey and indicated approval of the proposal. Commissioner Shears suggested the applicant attempt to find a source for wavy glass to replace the panes in the windows to be repaired, and Commissioner McKee offered a suggestion for a source.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 216 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Townsend | | | Turner |
| 2. McKee | | | Grant |
| 3. Becker | | | Ihloff |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | Reeds |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Sanders | | | |
| 7. Shears | | | |

3. **HP-0281-2021 / 1123 E. 21st St.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 3, 2021
 Applicant: Bryan Dillingham, PLA, ASLA
 Proposal:
 1. Construction of wall

Staff presented its report, noting that the wall would be constructed with concrete masonry units coated with stucco and topped with a cap of pre-cast concrete. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had questions about the materials and methods of construction but was satisfied with the applicant's proposal and recommended approval of the application. Commissioner Townsend complimented the applicant on the selection of the palette, whose colors would match those on the residence. The applicant explained that the steep slope of the lawn prompted the construction of the wall and described the vegetation that would be planted in two tiers in front of and behind the wall. Commissioner Shears expressed his approval of the proposal and added that the applicant had included sufficient details, which met the expectations for an application for an Historic Preservation Permit. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Sanders, the owner confirmed that the color of the cap would match that of the quoins flanking the entry.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.1.5

Vote: 1123 E. 21st St. (North Maple Ridge)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Townsend | | | Turner |
| 2. McKee | | | Grant |
| 3. Becker | | | Ihloff |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | Reeds |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Sanders | | | |
| 7. Shears | | | |

4. **HP-0279-2021 / 1614 E. 17th Pl.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 3, 2021
 Applicant: Tom Neal
 Proposals:
 1. Construction of addition with attached garage on east side of residence
 2. Construction of addition on west side of residence
 3. Reconstruction of sleeping porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the detached garage would be demolished and could not be rebuilt due to the presence of a sinkhole and a line for the sewer beneath the site. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's discussion had focused on the fenestration and other features of the additions and that the applicant had provided the requested revisions. Commissioner Becker stated that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had concluded the addition

would improve the residence and had recommended approval of the application in concept. The applicant described the history of the residence and the challenges caused by lack of maintenance and expressed appreciation for the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's recommendations during its review. The applicant stated that he intended to restore the original cedar siding if its condition allowed and noted that he would return to the Tulsa Preservation Commission with the remaining details in the design and Product Data. Commissioner Sanders added that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application in concept with the condition that construction of new elements would not commence until the remaining details had been approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. The applicant added that the approval of the application as presented would allow for the removal of the vinyl siding and the selection of materials and hardware.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application as presented with the condition that the remaining details of the application be completed and approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission prior to the construction of any new elements. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3

Vote: 1614 E. 17th Pl. (Swan Lake)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Townsend | | | Turner |
| 2. McKee | | | Grant |
| 3. Becker | | | Ihloff |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Reeds | | | |
| 7. Sanders | | | |
| 8. Shears | | | |

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on work in progress at 1104 North Cheyenne Avenue. The owner is expected to submit an application for the repair and replacement in kind of several features and the replacement of the windows. Staff announced that colleagues from the Tulsa Planning Office will offer a presentation on the Neighborhood Infill Overlay to the Tulsa Preservation Commission at its next Regular Meeting. Staff noted that June 26 seemed to be the date preferred for the Annual Retreat whose site will be the Community Room at 810 South Cincinnati Avenue. Staff will circulate a chart for commissioners to confirm their attendance and indicate refreshments.

- D. New Business
None

- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

- F. Public Comment
None

- G. Adjournment
Commissioner Townsend adjourned the Regular Meeting at 11:59 A.M.