



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, May 14, 2020, 11:00 A.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:02 A.M. As permitted by the temporary amendment of the Open Meeting Act, the Regular Meeting was conducted as a videoconference due to the concern about COVID-19.

Members Present

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair*
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair*
Holly Becker*
Chris J. Bumgarner** ***
Susan J. McKee, MFA*
Katelyn C. Parker, RA*
David W. Schoell, P.E., S.E.*
Robert L. Shears, ASLA*
James E. Turner, AIA* ***

Members Absent

Joy Jones, Secretary
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank*, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr.** , Felicity O. Good**

Others Present

Chip Atkins*, Leslie Dinsmore*, Brandon Jackson*, Kerry Miller*, Tom Neal*, Levi Hutton*, Ken Brooking*, Matt McAfee*

* Participation via Remote Access

** Attendance in South Conference Room

*** Late

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, April 28, 2020

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, April 28, 2020

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Bumgarner
3. Becker			Reeds
4. McKee			Turner
5. Parker			
6. Schoell			
7. Shears			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0168-2020 / 824 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: March 17, 2020, April 21, 2020
Applicant: Brandon L. Jackson
Proposal:
 1. Construction of residence

Staff presented its report, noting that Ply Gem vinyl windows with exterior muntins would be used. Commissioner Townsend reported that the project had improved since its first review and inquired about the front setback. The applicant stated that other residences on the block had thirty-five-foot (35'-0") setbacks but requested that the setback be adjusted to twenty-five feet (25'-0") or thirty feet (30'-0"). Commissioner Parker noted that the setback should be based only on the residences directly to the north and south of the property and offered to measure them. Chip Atkins, Neighborhood Representative for Swan Lake, commented on previous applications reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission that involved front setbacks. While Commissioner Parker recorded measurements, Commissioner McKee asked whether the rough cedar bracket would be painted, and the applicant answered affirmatively. Commissioner McKee expressed concern about the texture of the brackets, but Commissioner Turner noted that the brackets would match the rough texture of the siding. Upon an inquiry about the setbacks of adjacent residences from Commissioner Grant, the applicant reported that the adjacent residences on the same side of the street are between twenty-six feet (26'-0") and thirty-one feet (31'-0"). Commissioner Parker returned, reporting that the residence to the north had a front setback of twenty-five feet (25'-0") and the residence to the south a front setback of thirty-five feet (35'-0"). The applicant indicated a preference for a twenty-five-foot (25'-0") setback. Commissioner Grant then directed discussion to the height of the roof. Commissioner Parker expressed concern about the overall height of thirty-one feet and six inches (31'-6"), noting that the adjacent airplane bungalow to the north was only one story in height at its front. Commissioner Turner stated that the front elevation seemed proportional, and Commissioner Parker replied that it was wider than most residences in the Four-Square Style. After discussion of the height and setback of other residences on the block, Commissioner Parker suggested a thirty-foot (30'-0") setback, which would be an average of the two adjacent residences' setbacks.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the front setback be thirty feet (30'-0"). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved by majority.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 824 N. Cheyenne. Ave. **(Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	Bumgarner		Jones
2. Townsend	McKee		Reeds
3. Becker			
4. Parker			
5. Schoell			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

2. **HP-0172-2020 / 1324 E. 17th Pl.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 21, 2020

Applicants: Lizette and Jason Corcoran

Proposals:

1. Construction of addition
2. Construction of addition to porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the requested documentation and revisions were provided. According to Staff, Ply Gem vinyl windows with seven-eighths-inch (0'-7/8") simulated divided lights would be used. Commissioner Townsend confirmed that all requested information was included. Commissioner Schoell inquired whether a sample of the window was available, and Commissioner Parker replied that a previous applicant had presented a sample of a Ply Gem window. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, the applicant's designer, Tom Neal, confirmed that the windows on the existing residence would remain. Commissioner McKee requested clarification about the existing window material, and Mr. Neal replied that the windows were vinyl. Commissioner Grant indicated approval of the windows with seven-eighths-inch (0'-7/8") simulated divided lights, and Commissioner Parker agreed. Commissioner McKee expressed concern about the scale of the addition, citing similar alterations to residences throughout Swan Lake. Mr. Neal replied that the scale of the addition was nearly the same as that of the adjacent residence. Neighborhood Representative Atkins noted that similar projects had been approved throughout the district and that in this case the addition was located at the rear of the residence and was somewhat concealed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved by majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.5, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3

Vote: 1324 E. 17th Pl. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	McKee		Jones
2. Townsend			Reeds
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Parker			
6. Schoell			
7. Shears			
8. Turner			

3. HP-0178-2020 / 1728 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 7, 2020

Applicant: Kenneth D. Brooking

Proposals:

1. Replacement of driveway
2. Replacement of shingles
3. Installation of Mini Split Units

Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting the applicant's prompt response to the Letter of Notification. Staff reported that the original driveway had been covered by erosion, so the new driveway appears wider but actually matches the original dimensions. Commissioner Grant requested information on the material of the shingles, and the applicant replied that 3-Tab shingles had been replaced by the same material in a slightly darker color, adding that most of the roof was not visible from the street. Staff commented that the replacement in kind complied with the Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner Townsend provided a report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that an architectural shingle would be preferred when the roof is replaced in the future. Commissioner Turner added that the Mini Split Units were barely visible from the street.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.5.6, A.5.7, A.7.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1728 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Reeds
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Schoell			
8. Shears			
9. Turner			

4. **HP-0180-2020 / 225 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 7, 2020

Applicant: Kerry A. Miller

Proposals:

1. Construction of walkway
2. Construction of fence

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Townsend reported that, although masonry bands on walkways are not typical in North Maple Ridge, similar treatments of walkways exist in the district. Commissioner Grant inquired about the width of the walkway, and the applicant replied that it would be three feet (3'-0") wide. Commissioners Grant and Shears expressed concern about the width of the walkway, and, after discussion, Commissioner Shears suggested matching the sidewalk's width of four feet (4'-0"). Commissioners Schoell and McKee affirmed this recommendation. Commissioner Shears then requested information about the brick pavers in the driveway, and the applicant replied that the driveway would have a double course of brick, which would be inserted with mortar above a four-inch (0'-4") thick concrete base. Commissioner Shears expressed concern about the structural integrity of the driveway, but Commissioner Schoell stated that the treatment would not disturb the driveway's structure, unless it caused drainage to increase. Neighborhood Representative Atkins agreed that damage from water should be of concern. Commissioner Grant then directed the discussion to the termination of the walkway. Commissioner Grant suggested that a square landing would be more appropriate, and Commissioner Shears agreed and recommended that the landing be eight feet (8'-0") wide. Upon inquiries from Commissioners Shears and Schoell, the applicant provided additional information regarding the treatment of the landing and the step at the termination of the walkway.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the walkway be four feet (4'-0") wide, that the landing be eight feet (8'-0") wide, and that the landing be square rather than curved. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 225 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Reeds
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Schoell			
8. Shears			
9. Turner			

5. **HP-0181-2020 / 1531 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 7, 2020

Applicant: Paul N. (Chip) Atkins IV

Proposals:

1. Replacement of wall in basement
2. Removal of window on north side of basement

Staff presented its report, noting that as much of the original material as possible would be salvaged and that Classic Rock Face Block would serve as a replacement where required. The applicant added that alternative materials, such as a veneer or masonry, may be required due to the cost of Classic Rock Face Block, but noted the original material would be salvaged and reused wherever possible. Commissioner Townsend reported that the window to be removed was well hidden from the street.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the original material be matched as closely as possible. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.1, A.4.2

Vote: 1531 S. Trenton Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Reeds
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Schoell			
8. Shears			
9. Turner			

6. **HP-0182-2020 / 710 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 7, 2020

Applicant: Levi H. Hutton

Proposal:

1. Replacement of wooden siding with SmartSide Siding

Staff presented its report, relaying images showing the extent of the damage to the original siding and noting that the original siding would be salvaged where possible and that the SmartSide Siding would match its exposure. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's review involved the extensive discussion of proper techniques for abatement of lead-based paint. Commissioner Grant inquired about the dimensions of the siding, and the applicant replied that the original siding was three-eighths of an inch (0'-3/8") thick and the SmartSide Siding would be five-sixteenths of an inch (0-5/16") thick. Commissioner Schoell explained that the original siding was probably beveled and beveled cedar siding could be successfully blended with the original material. Upon inquiries from Commissioners Grant and Parker, the applicant stated that the first story of the east façade had significant damage and would require a full replacement but that the siding on the rest of the residence would only be replaced as needed. According to

the applicant, the siding to be retained would remain in place and new siding would be blended with it. Commissioner Grant expressed concern about the visibility of the window casing and recommended the extension of its depth. Commissioner Parker indicated approval of the SmartSide Siding but warned that it would be difficult to blend because the SmartSide Siding was not beveled. The applicant responded, stating that the entire length would be replaced when a board required replacement. Commissioners Schoell, Parker, and Grant then discussed with the applicant cost-sensitive options for blending beveled cedar siding with the original material rather than replacing entire runs with SmartSide Siding. Commissioner Turner expressed approval of the SmartSide Siding as long as it had a smooth surface.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the siding on the first floor of the east façade be replaced with SmartSide Siding, that the thickness of the casing be increased, and that the damaged siding elsewhere be replaced in kind with beveled cedar siding. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4

Vote: 710 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Bumgarner
3. Becker			Reeds
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Schoell			
7. Shears			
8. Turner			

6. Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative – Yorktown Neighborhood Association

Staff announced that Matt McAfee had been nominated to serve as the Neighborhood Representative for the Yorktown Neighborhood Association. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to confirm the appointment of Mr. McAfee as Neighborhood Representative for the Yorktown Neighborhood Association. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and was approved by majority.

Vote: Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative – Yorktown Neighborhood Association

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant		Schoell	Jones
2. Townsend			Bumgarner
3. Becker			Reeds
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

- C. Presentation – Design of Website
Staff will relay a link to the website for review and comment.
- D. Reports
 - 1. Chair Report
None
 - 2. Staff Report
Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at 1516 South Newport Avenue. The owners responded to the Letter of Notification with an application, which was approved by staff. Staff expressed appreciation for the review of the design of the Yard Sign for approved projects.
- E. New Business
Commissioner Parker announced that many roofs in Brady Heights required replacement due to damage from hail. Commissioner Schoell affirmed that this was the case in North Maple Ridge.

Commissioner Shears requested an update on the appeal of the Board of Adjustment’s decision affirming the Tulsa Preservation Commission’s denial of HP-0116-2019. Staff reported that the case had been assigned to a docket.
- F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
Commissioner Townsend welcomed Matt McAfee, the newly appointed Neighborhood Representative, to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee.
- G. Public Comment
None
- H. Adjournment
Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 1:04 P.M.