



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, January 9, 2020, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:07 A.M.

Members Present

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair
Joy Jones, Secretary
Holly Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner
Susan J. McKee, MFA
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
David W. Schoell, P.E.
Robert L. Shears, ASLA

Members Absent

James E. Turner, AIA

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Alycia M. Herron, Dawn Laverty, Joe Johnson

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 12, 2019

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 12, 2019

In Favor

1. Grant
2. Townsend
3. Becker
4. McKee
5. Parker
6. Reeds
7. Schoell
8. Shears

Opposed

Abstaining

Jones
Bumgarner

Not Present

Turner

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Jones recused herself during the review of HP-0147-2019 because an agent with her real estate company, Unique Properties of Oklahoma LLC, represents the owner of the property at 202 East 20th Street.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0147-2019 / 202 E. 20th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Review Dates: December 10, 2019, January 2, 2020

Applicant: Alycia M. Herron

Proposal:

- 1. Replacement of siding
- 2. Replacement of windows
- 3. Replacement of lamps on porch

Work started without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting the applicant’s prompt response to the Letter of Notification. Commissioner Grant added that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, after two reviews, had forwarded the application with a recommendation for its approval, noting that the subcommittee’s review may have been different if it had occurred prior to the Work. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the proposed window material, and Commissioner Grant stated that the proposed windows, which had already been purchased, were made of vinyl with exterior muntins added. Commissioner Schoell expressed disapproval of the window material, stating that the depth of the muntins and profiles around the vinyl windows drastically differed from those of the original wood windows and thus did not meet the requirements of the Unified Design Guidelines. Upon inquiries, the owner, Ms. Laverty, and the applicant, Ms. Herron, confirmed that all nineteen (19) windows would be replaced but the windows selected as replacements had not yet been installed. Ms. Laverty stated that no windows previously installed had been retained, and Ms. Herron stated some of those windows had been original but were almost beyond repair. Commissioner Reeds expressed the opinion that, while the exterior muntins were an improvement, the vinyl material was not acceptable and aluminum-clad wood windows would have been preferable.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Becker but failed to garner a majority.

Vote: 202 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	McKee		Jones*
2. Townsend	Parker		Turner
3. Becker	Reeds		
4. Bumgarner	Schoell		
5.	Shears		

*Recused

As the motion failed, Staff suggested that the commission could choose to reconsider each item of the application separately. Commissioner Grant opened discussion for Item 1, the replacement of the siding.

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve Item 1, the replacement of the siding. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner.

Commissioner Shears inquired about the siding that had previously been on the residence, and Staff indicated that it had been vinyl and that the HardiePlank Siding matched its exposure. Commissioner Townsend noted that the HardiePlank Siding was an improvement but indicated a desire to record that the residence had originally featured novelty siding, so future improvements would match the original exposure and material. Staff offered to add this information to an electronic database, which would be available for future reviews.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds amended his motion to approve the HardiePlank Siding with the condition that any future restoration be required to match the original novelty siding. Commissioner Schoell stated that the exposure and grain of the installed siding would not have traditionally existed in North Maple Ridge and that, although willing to compromise, he was disappointed.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 202 E. 20th St. (**North Maple Ridge**) Item 1: Replacement of siding

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	McKee		Jones*
2. Townsend	Shears		Turner
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Schoell			

*Recused

Commissioner Grant directed discussion to the replacement of the lamps on the porch. As there was no discussion, however, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve Item 3, the replacement of the lamps on the porch. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 202 E. 20th St. (**North Maple Ridge**) Item 3: Replacement of lamps on porch

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones*
2. Townsend			Turner
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			

*Recused

Commissioner Grant then opened discussion of Item 2, the replacement of the windows. Ms. Laverty commented that vinyl windows exist throughout North Maple Ridge, and Commissioner Grant stated many of the vinyl windows were installed before the Historic Preservation Overlay was established or were installed without an Historic Preservation Permit. Ms. Laverty inquired about the aftermath were the motion not to be approved. Staff informed her that the installation of windows could not legally proceed but that she could appeal the decision to the Board of Adjustment within ten (10) Calendar Days of the Tulsa Preservation Commission's decision. Commissioner Bumgarner noted that the Unified Design Guidelines do not call for the restoration of noncontributing structures but require them to blend in with their surroundings. Commissioner Shears noted that the windows were highly visible from the street. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired whether vinyl windows had been previously approved, and Staff responded that they had been approved on a case-by-case basis with more flexibility given to new construction. Staff noted that, as a noncontributing structure, the residence should be viewed as a product of its time. Commissioner Shears commented that few residences in North Maple Ridge were considered contributing structures. Commissioner Parker stated that the residence was built in 1915 and was once a bungalow, so wood windows would be most appropriate. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Reeds, Ms. Laverty stated she had not been aware of the residence's inclusion in an Historic Preservation Overlay District, as the information had appeared only on one line in a Seller's Disclosure Form. Commissioner Reeds then inquired whether any permits had been obtained, and Ms. Herron stated permits were obtained for major Work, such as changes to the electrical and plumbing systems.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve Item 2, the replacement of the windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 202 E. 20th St. (**North Maple Ridge**) Item 2: Replacement of windows

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	McKee		Jones*
2. Townsend	Parker		Turner
3. Becker	Schoell		
4. Bumgarner	Shears		
5. Reeds			

*Recused

2. **HP-0151-2019 / 1158 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Charney Properties, Inc.

Historic Preservation Permit Review Date: January 2, 2020

Proposal:

1. Installation of door and hardware
2. Installation of lamps on porch
3. Installation of Street Numbers
4. Installation of mailbox
5. Construction of fence

Staff presented its report, explaining that the wooden fence would be six feet (6'-0") in height with a cap and the front door would feature a dentil shelf. Staff reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended approval of the application with the condition that the dimensions of the doorway be retained during the installation of the new door and that the applicant had agreed to the condition. According to Commissioner Townsend, the subcommittee found the mailbox to be appropriate but had recommended a less modern font for the Street Numbers and a complete replacement of the lamps on the porch, as they were not original. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, the applicant stated the proposed gate would be a walk-through gate as presented. Commissioner Shears inquired about treatment of the driveway, and Staff responded that the driveway would be repaired and replaced in kind. After the applicant clarified that the north boundary of the fence would extend westward from the northern edge of the driveway, Commissioner Parker requested clarification on its status as an attached feature. Staff replied that Section 70.070-B.4 of the Tulsa Zoning Code exempts accessory structures from review, unless they are in the street yard or attached to the residence. According to staff, the determination that the fence was an attached feature was consistent with previous reviews.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.3, A.7.3, G.1.4

Vote: 1158 N. Denver Ave. **(Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Bumgarner
2. Townsend			Turner
3. Jones			
4. Becker			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Grant opened the discussion of appointments to the committees. Commissioners Bumgarner, Jones, McKee, Reeds, Schoell, and Turner were appointed as members of the Outreach Committee, and Commissioner Turner was appointed as Chair. Commissioners Jones, Schoell, and Shears were appointed as members of the Rules and Regulations Committee, and Commissioner Schoell will serve as Chair. Commissioners Jones, McKee, and Parker were appointed as members of the Historic Preservation Committee, and Commissioners Reeds, Schoell, Shears, and Turner were appointed as alternate members; as Vice-Chair, Commissioner Townsend will serve as Chair.

Commissioner Grant announced that he would like to form an ad hoc committee to review the processes for prevention, notification, review, and enforcement of Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit. Commissioners Bumgarner, Jones, and Parker were appointed as members, and Commissioner Grant will serve as Chair.

Commissioner McKee expressed an interest in the review of the Unified Design Guidelines, and Staff indicated that the responsibility would be assigned to the Historic Preservation Committee. Commissioner Jones inquired about creation of a list of approved brands of materials to share with owners. Commissioner Reeds responded that the Tulsa Preservation Commission cannot endorse individual brands but could refer owners to other organizations able to provide expertise.

Commissioner Grant then announced the Tulsa Preservation Commission's Annual Retreat. The Annual Retreat will occur on February 1, 2020.

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at 811 North Cheyenne Avenue, noting that the owner had responded promptly to the Letter of Notification with an application. During the review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee on January 2, the owner agreed to revise treatment of the dormer by adjusting the size and placement of the windows and replicating the columns on its corners.

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at 1103 North Cheyenne Avenue. The Working in Neighborhoods Department drafted a citation, but the owner failed to respond to requests for contact. Staff was informed that the owner had been notified of a deadline for submission of an application by January 14 or a warrant would be issued.

Staff noted its responses to requests for Site Visits. A photograph from a recent Site Visit at 1728 South Rockford Avenue was presented.

Staff reported on its response to Councilor Hall-Harper's request for a preliminary opinion on the eligibility of the "Historic Building" at Booker T. Washington High School for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places. Staff conducted a Site Visit and forwarded a formal preliminary request for eligibility to the State Historic Preservation Office.

D. New Business

Commissioner Reeds raised a Point of Order, questioning whether the failed motion for the approval of HP-0147-2019 should have been withdrawn before subsequent motions were made concerning the application. Legal Staff responded that the motion had in effect been reconsidered. Commissioner Townsend suggested that the commission could individually consider multiple items under a single application in future reviews.

Commissioner Parker noted that a failed motion to approve does not mean that an application has been denied. Commissioner Townsend offered clarification, noting that, if a motion to approve fails, the Tulsa Preservation Commission has taken no action on the application.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

Commissioner Schoell spoke as a member of the public and as a homeowner in a Historic Preservation Overlay District and expressed his disappointment in the outcome of the vote on Item 2—the replacement of the windows—on the application for projects at 202 East 20th Street. Commissioner Schoell commented that he and other owners in the North Maple Ridge Historic Preservation Overlay District invested substantial resources in the maintenance of their residences and that the decision to allow vinyl windows to be installed opened the opportunity for the approval of similar projects.

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:23 P.M.