



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Tuesday, May 25, 2021, 4:30 P.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum
Commissioner Townsend called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:42 P.M.

Members Present

Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Chair
James E. Turner, AIA, Vice-Chair
Holly M. Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Katelyn C. Parker, RA

Members Absent

Jillian Ihloff
Susan J. McKee, MFA
Robert L. Shears, ASLA
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
Mark D. G. Sanders

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Karen E. Nollan, Andrew C. Jayne, Robert P. Cleaver, Matt Case, Matthew D. McAfee, Kimberly A. McCoy, AIA, Charles D. (Chas) Higgins, Steven Jones

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, April 27, 2021
Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Becker and approved with a majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, April 27, 2021

In Favor

1. Townsend
2. Turner
3. Becker
4. Grant
5. Parker

Opposed

Abstaining

Bumgarner

Not Present

Ihloff
McKee
Reeds
Sanders
Shears

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0261-2021 / 1523 E. 19th St.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: March 16, 2021; April 1, 2021

Applicants: Jodi F. and Andrew C. Jayne

Proposal:

1. Construction of walkway

Project completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the owner proceeded with construction of the walkway without an Historic Preservation Permit and requested that the proposal be forwarded directly to the Tulsa Preservation Commission without any review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Mr. Robert P. Cleaver, 1745 South St. Louis Avenue, stated that he walks by the residence frequently and is thrilled with the Work completed at the site. Commissioner Townsend observed that the walkway appears to be a removable feature and expressed approval of the proposal. Commissioner Turner recalled confusion caused by previously submitted drawings of the walkway but stated the walkway as constructed was an appropriate solution.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3

Vote: 1523 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears
6. Parker			

2. **HP-0271-2021 / 1518 S. Norfolk Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 6, 2021

Applicant: Kimberly A. McCoy, AIA

Proposals:

1. Installation of gate
2. Construction of walkway
3. Replacement of siding with LP SmartSide Siding

Staff presented its report, noting the construction of the detached accessory structure was exempt from the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had no concerns with the proposal and had forwarded the application to the Tulsa Preservation Commission with a recommendation for approval.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.3, A.2.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1518 S. Norfolk Ave. **(North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears
6. Parker			

3. **HP-0272-2021 / 1708 S. Quincy Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 6, 2021

Applicant: Tulsa Renew

Proposal:

1. Replacement of siding with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding

Staff presented its report, noting that other damaged elements, such as brackets, would be repaired or replaced in kind. Commissioner Turner reported that the applicant had informed the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee that the siding on the entire residence would be replaced as it was too damaged by punctures from the nails to be repaired and that the dimensions of the original wooden siding would be matched. Commissioner Turner noted that the HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding would have a slightly different depth than the original wooden siding. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, Commissioner Turner stated that the HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding is slightly thinner than the original siding and that the treatment of the corners would differ from that on the original siding. The applicant expressed a desire to return the residence to its original appearance. Upon inquiries from Commissioners Grant and Parker, the applicant provided the dimensions of the siding and the method to achieve a two and one-half inch (0'-2 1/2") profile. Commissioner Turner inquired about features present in the gable, and the applicant replied that, were a vent present under the vinyl siding, it would be repaired or replaced in kind. The applicant added that the original material and dimensions in the gable over the porch would be matched if shingles, rather than siding, were present.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4

Vote: 1708 S. Quincy Ave. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears
6. Parker			

4. **HP-0274-2021 / 706 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 18, 2021

Applicant: Charles D. (Chas) Higgins

Proposals:

1. Increase in height of frieze board
2. Installation of siding on frieze board

*Application to amend previous approval of application
by Tulsa Preservation Commission on January 26, 2021*

Staff presented its report, noting that the frieze board would be increased in height from twenty-four inches (2'-0") to thirty-two inches (2'-8"). Matthew D. McAfee, the Neighborhood Representative for the Yorktown Historic Preservation Overlay District, reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application and noted that the photograph, taken during construction, did not reflect the final version of the project. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Parker, the applicant stated that trim would not be present between the columns and the siding. Commissioner Parker observed the presence of a trim beam just above the columns on the examples from other residences provided by the applicant and indicated a need for the inclusion of the feature. Commissioners Grant and Turner agreed, and Commissioner Turner noted that other appropriate details would include crown moulding and a drip edge. Upon a request for clarification by the applicant, Commissioner Turner noted that the bottom two courses of trim could be removed and replaced with a smooth piece of trim and that a water table should be inserted.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the following conditions—

- that the bottom two (2) courses of siding be removed and replaced with a smooth trim beam,
- that a water table with a beveled edge and bed moulding be placed at a slope,
- that the water table and the expression of the beam be continuous on all sides of the porch, and
- that a cap be placed at the bottom of the beam.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 706 N. Denver Ave. (**Brady Heights**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Grant			Sanders
5. Bumgarner			Shears
6. Parker			

5. **HP-0275-2021 / 2120 E. 18th St.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 18, 2021

Applicant: Karen E. Nollan

Proposal:

1. Replacement of walkway

Staff presented its report, noting that the deterioration of the walkway spurred its replacement. Neighborhood Representative McAfee reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had no issue with the selected materials or shape of the walkway but were concerned that the walkway would be wide enough to accommodate a parked vehicle. The applicant stated that she revised the proposal to install a walkway eight feet and six inches (8'-6") wide on each side and six feet (6'-0") wide at the center. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Turner, the applicant explained that the walkway presently on the site would be removed, and the new walkway would be constructed with pieces of flagstone surrounded by river rock.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3

Vote: 2120 E. 18th St. (**Yorktown**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears
6. Parker			

6. **HP-0276-2021 / 1568 S. Yorktown Ave.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 18, 2021

Applicant: Elysia Erickson

Proposal:

1. Installation of solar panels

Staff presented its report, noting that the installation of solar panels on the accessory structure was exempt from the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit. Upon a request for clarification from Commissioner Townsend, Staff stated that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee requested that the panels on the south side of the

roof of the accessory structure be removed to limit the visibility of panels from the right-of-way. Neighborhood Representative McAfee added that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee believed the installation of the panels on the primary residence satisfied the Unified Design Guidelines and predicted that the tree on the south side of the accessory structure may be removed to accommodate the panels. Commissioner Turner observed that the solar panels on the residence may be visible from Yorktown Avenue, but Staff stated that portion of the roof was not fully visible from the street. Commissioners Townsend and Turner inquired about the placement and angle of the solar panels on the roof, and Staff replied that the Product Data provided by the applicant indicated that the panels would be mounted parallel to the slope of the roof at a height of six inches (0'-6"). Commissioner Parker expressed approval of the installation of solar panels, noting that solar panels would not damage the historic material of the residence. Commissioner Turner disagreed and stated that aesthetics is the main consideration of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the solar panels be mounted as presented—parallel to the slope of the roof at a height of no more than six inches (0'-6"). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Becker and was approved with a majority.

Tulsa Zoning Code, Section 70.070-B Exemptions; Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.6

Vote: 1568 S. Yorktown Ave. (**Yorktown**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Turner		Ihloff
2. Becker			McKee
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Grant			Sanders
5. Parker			Shears

7. **HP-0270-2021 / 1725 S. Newport Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 6, 2021
 Applicant: Elliott Roofing
 Proposal:
 1. Replacement of shingles with Tesla Solar Roof Tiles

Staff presented its report, noting the availability of a product sample in the South Conference Room. Commissioner Turner reported that the roof is the first of its kind reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission and described Solar Roof Tiles and their installation, noting that photovoltaic tiles would be placed where needed and faux glass insulated panels with a similar appearance would be placed elsewhere. Commissioner Turner recalled that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee expressed some concern about the extensive use of the metal trim but recommended approval of the application. Matt Case, representative of Elliott Roofing, presented the sample for inspection and answered commissioners' questions about the tiles and the various sizes of panels and their functions and methods for installation. Mr. Case explained that photovoltaic panels would be installed where possible and smaller panels and metal flashing would be placed to accommodate areas, such as valleys, hips, ridges, and edges. Upon several inquiries from Commissioners Turner and Grant, Mr. Case described the underlayment and the gap between the tiles and deck

that would facilitate airflow. Neighborhood Representative McAfee commented on the limited visibility of the roof from the right-of-way due to its low slope, and Commissioner Parker noted that the sheen of the tiles would give the roof a distinct appearance. Commissioner Turner inquired about the intended treatment of the feature on the roof and speculated that it probably was not an original feature, and Commissioner Parker agreed. Mr. Case indicated that the feature may be removed, and Staff informed the applicant that an amendment to the proposal could be sought should the owner decide to remove the feature. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Bumgarner, Mr. Case stated that no trees would be removed. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired about the financial benefit and the need for alternative sources of energy, and Mr. Case commented on the available tax and insurance credits and noted that a power wall could be installed to supplement the solar panels. Mr. Case added that a self-adhesive membrane would be placed on the flat sections of the roof and that architectural shingles would be placed on the lower section of the roof and on the roof of the detached accessory structure.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.5.6, A.5.7, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1725 S. Newport Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears
6. Parker			

8. HP-0268-2021 / 1745 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 6, 2021

Applicant: Robert P. Cleaver

Proposals:

1. Replacement of windows
2. Replacement of door and sidelights

Staff presented its report, sharing the photographs included in the Window Survey and noting that the windows selected as replacements would match those previously approved for installation on the residence. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee did not express much concern about the replacement of the windows but regarded the replacement of the door and sidelights as less appropriate. The Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended that the applicant select a door that would more closely resemble the original door. The applicant commented on the conditions of the windows to be replaced and noted that the shutters were not the cause of condensation present on the interior of the panes and added that the pattern and dimensions of the door selected as a replacement would match the original door with the exception of the panel at the bottom, which would not be visible from the right-of-way. Commissioner Parker inquired

whether the applicant had considered replacement of only the glass panes in the door, and the applicant indicated a readiness to consider the option but expressed concerns about security and energy efficiency of the original door. Commissioner Parker commented favorably on the energy efficiency of wooden windows and doors and, after noting common causes of leaks, suggested installation of weather stripping and storm windows or storm doors as strategies for the prevention of condensation and leaks. The applicant expressed apprehension about installation of storm windows as a preventive measure, and Commissioner Parker emphasized a preference for retention of the original door and windows. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, the applicant explained that concerns about security would be mitigated by the presence of double-pane glass on the new door. Upon further inquiries from Commissioner Townsend, the applicant provided clarification about the dimensions of the sidelights and the configurations of the panes and noted that the space for the new doorway would match that of the original doorway. Commissioner Turner then requested that the applicant request the manufacturer to match the dimensions of the bottom panel as well. Upon an inquiry from Neighborhood Representative McAfee, the applicant stated that the mail slot was original and would be retained. Commissioner Townsend suggested that the commission consider Item 1 and Item 2 separately.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve Item 1: Replacement of windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved with a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6

Vote: 1745 S. St. Louis Ave. (**Swan Lake**)
Item 1: Replacement of windows

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Parker		Ihloff
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			Reeds
4. Bumgarner			Sanders
5. Grant			Shears

Commissioner Townsend opened the floor for a motion on Item 2. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Grant, the applicant confirmed that the door jamb would be replaced along with the door. As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve Item 2: Replacement of door and sidelights with the condition that the dimensions match those of the original door, including the bottom panel and sidelights. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved with a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6

Vote: 1745 S. St. Louis Ave. (**Swan Lake**)
Item 2: Replacement of door and sidelights

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Becker		Ihloff
2. Turner	Parker		McKee
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Grant			Sanders
5.			Shears

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Townsend reported that the owners at 1868 East 16th Place had extended appreciation to the Tulsa Preservation Commission for review of their application for an Historic Preservation Permit for the construction of their new residence and had invited commissioners to visit. Commissioner Townsend announced that the Annual Retreat could be scheduled. Staff will circulate a chart with dates for commissioners to consider.

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on alteration of an Approved Proposal without review and approval by the Tulsa Preservation Commission at the residence located at 1607 South Trenton Avenue. Staff is awaiting a response from the Owner.

Staff noted its response to the report of activity at the residence located at 715 North Denver Avenue. Staff is awaiting a response from the Owner.

Staff reported on work in progress at 305 East 20th Street. Several unapproved features have been installed, and several approved features have not yet been installed. A Letter of Notification will be forwarded to the Owners.

Staff announced that colleagues from the Tulsa Planning Office will offer a presentation about the Neighborhood Infill Overlay to the Tulsa Preservation Commission at a forthcoming Regular Meeting. Among the neighborhoods to be affected is the Brady Heights Historic Preservation Overlay District.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Turner announced that the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture will offer its monthly tours in person after a hiatus due to the concern about COVID-19. The tours will be conducted on the second Saturday of the month.

Staff proposed an item to discuss Accessory Dwelling Units and their exemption from the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit in Section 70.070-B.4 of the Tulsa Zoning Code.

Neighborhood Representative McAfee requested that an item be added to discuss the process for demolitions in Historic Preservation Overlay Districts.

F. Public Comment

Neighborhood Representative McAfee announced that the Yorktown Neighborhood Association met with representatives of St. John Building Corporation, who announced that the residence located at 1916 East 17th Place would be demolished. Mr. McAfee added that this residence would be the seventh on the same block to be demolished by St. John Building Corporation and that an offer by Commissioner Reeds to conduct a free structural assessment of the residence was declined.

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Townsend adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:24 P.M.