



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 8, 2021, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Townsend called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:33 A.M.

Members Present

Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Chair²

James E. Turner, AIA, Vice-Chair²

Holly M. Becker²

Chris J. Bumgarner¹

Susan J. McKee, MFA^{1, 3}

Katelyn C. Parker, RA¹

Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA²

Mark D. G. Sanders¹

Robert L. Shears, ASLA¹

Members Absent

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank¹, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr.², Felicity O. Good²

Others Present

Elissa Baker¹, Crystal Ghere¹, Ginger Sexton¹, Kent Keith¹, Matthew D. McAfee¹,

Michael Park¹, Pam Crandall¹, Jacob Shirley¹, Valerie O'Brien¹, Jesse Sandoval¹,

Andrew C. Jayne¹, Ben Welch²

¹ Participation via Remote Access

² Attendance in South Conference Room

³ Early Departure

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, March 23, 2021

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved with a majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, March 23, 2021

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend		Shears	Grant
2. Turner			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Public Information Session

1. Section 106 Process – Disposition of Property – 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue
2. Section 106 Process – Demolition – 2220 North Denver Boulevard
3. Section 106 Process – Demolition – 1819 West Reconciliation Way
4. Section 106 Process – Demolition – 1915 West Easton Place

In accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and its implementing regulations, 36 CFR Part 800, Staff presented information and invited public comment to address the determination of adverse effects of the disposition of the property located at 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue and the demolition of the residences located at 2220 North Denver Boulevard, 1819 West Reconciliation Way, and 1915 West Easton Place. Staff explained that all four sites are located in districts listed in or determined to be eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places, and the nature of each project has been determined to create an adverse effect. The property located at 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue has been proposed for release from the Public Housing Portfolio of the Housing Authority of the City of Tulsa. Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds administered by the Working in Neighborhoods Department would be used for the demolition of the residences located at 2220 North Denver Boulevard, 1819 West Reconciliation Way, and 1915 West Easton Place.

Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Sanders, Staff clarified that only the property located at 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue is owned by the Housing Authority and the latter three properties are privately owned. Kent Keith, Vice-President of Construction for the Housing Authority, commented that the property located at 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue is among two hundred and seventeen (217) properties within the portfolio of scattered sites to be sold upon the direction of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. According to Mr. Keith, all residences will be sold but will remain affordable housing. Staff noted that, among those properties whose environmental reviews were completed, only this property located at 1907 North Cheyenne Avenue was located in a district listed in or eligible for its inclusion in the National Register. Upon request for clarification from Commissioner Sanders, Staff noted that the Reservoir Hill Historic District, where the site is located, has been determined to be eligible for inclusion in the National Register. Upon inquiry from Commissioner Sanders, Jesse Sandoval, Demolition Inspector for the Working in Neighborhoods Department, noted that the residences located at 2220 North Denver

Boulevard, 1819 West Reconciliation Way, and 1915 West Easton Place are privately owned. Staff added that the owners have requested assistance with demolition with Community Development Block Grant funds. Staff concluded the Public Information Session with the provision of Information for Contact and reminded those present to submit comments by Close of Business on April 23.

C. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0069-2019 / 1730 S. Quincy Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Travis Harris, AIA

Proposal:

1. Extension of period of performance

Staff presented its report, noting that no alterations to the design had been made. Upon request for clarification by Commissioner Turner, Staff stated that the initial application had been approved under the current Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner McKee inquired about the status of the project, and Staff replied that no activity had occurred. Commissioner Turner recalled that the project would require the approval of variances from the Board of Adjustment.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application to extend the period of performance for a Calendar Year. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved with a majority.

Tulsa Zoning Code cited: Section 70.070-H

Vote: 1730 S. Quincy Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Turner		Grant
2. Becker	McKee		
3. Bumgarner	Parker		
4. Reeds			
5. Sanders			
6. Shears			

2. **HP-0259-2021 / 1212 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Crystal Ghere

Proposal:

1. Replacement of driveway

Staff presented its report, noting that only the section of the driveway presently constructed with asphalt would be replaced with concrete and that the new driveway would maintain the same dimensions. The applicant added that the section of the driveway constructed with concrete is in satisfactory condition, but the other section of the driveway has experienced deterioration. Commissioner Turner expressed the need for a Site Plan with the dimensions of the area to be replaced. The applicant explained that the intent would be maintenance of the current dimensions of the section covered with asphalt. Upon inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, the applicant confirmed that plain, uncolored concrete would be used. Commissioner Turner noted the lack of details presented to the Tulsa Preservation Commission, and Staff offered to confirm the width of the driveway.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the new driveway be no wider than the present driveway constructed with asphalt. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved with a majority. Commissioner McKee noted that, like Commissioner Turner, she opposed the motion due to the absence of a Site Plan with the dimensions of the proposed driveway.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1212 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Turner		Grant
2. Becker	McKee		
3. Bumgarner			
4. Parker			
5. Reeds			
6. Sanders			
7. Shears			

3. **HP-0252-2021 / 1916 E. 17th PI.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 1, 2021
Applicant: Ark Wrecking Company of Oklahoma
Proposal:
1. Demolition of residence

Staff presented its report and reviewed the standards of Section F: Guidelines for Demolition of Structures in the Unified Design Guidelines and Section 70.070-G: Demolition Requests in the Tulsa Zoning Code. Commissioner Turner reported that a representative of St. John Building Corporation was present and provided information regarding St. John Building Corporation's plans in the area. Commissioner Turner stated that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee determined that insufficient evidence was presented to verify that the demolition of the residence was warranted, so the subcommittee forwarded the application to the Tulsa Preservation Commission with a recommendation for its denial. Commissioner Turner added that the subcommittee encouraged the representatives from St. John Building Corporation to engage further in conversations with neighbors about St. John Building Corporation's plans for its properties in the Yorktown Historic District. Matthew D. McAfee, Neighborhood Representative for the Yorktown Historic District, commented that residents explored a number of alternatives to demolition, including purchasing or leasing the property.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously. Neighborhood Representative McAfee inquired when the sixty (60) day stay of demolition would begin. Legal Staff offered to review the Tulsa Zoning Code and relay the information to Staff.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, F.1.1
Tulsa Zoning Code cited: Section 70.070-G

Vote: 1916 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Grant
2. Turner			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			
9. Shears			

4. **HP-0261-2021 / 1523 E. 19th St.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 1, 2021

Applicants: Jodi F. and Andrew C. Jayne

Proposals:

1. Placement of pavement adjacent to addition to porch*
2. Placement of pavers in yard on west side of site
3. Replacement of door on west facade
4. Replacement of door on garage

**Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report, sharing photographs that showed the prevalence of concrete elsewhere in the cul-de-sac in which the residence is situated. Staff noted that vegetation would be planted to conceal the pavement adjacent to the addition to the porch. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's discussion focused on the presence of stamped concrete on the driveway, walkway, and pavers. Commissioner Turner reported that the Unified Design Guidelines prohibit stained concrete but that the applicant indicated the concrete is not tinted. Commissioner Turner observed that the residence faces a private street and expressed the opinion that the pavement adjacent to the addition to the porch would be well-screened by the vegetation and that the pavers could be considered a temporary feature. The applicant commented that the walkway and driveway, the only two areas with stamped concrete, had been previously approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. According to the applicant, the pavement for the sitting area adjacent to the addition to the porch was constructed with plain concrete. The applicant stated that the pavers would be constructed with concrete or masonry and indicated that he would not consider stone as a material for the steps or the sitting area due to concerns about safety. Upon request for clarification by Commissioner Townsend, Commissioner Turner stated that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended the approval of the application with the condition that the concrete not be stamped or tinted.

Commissioner Townsend opened discussion to commissioners, and Commissioner McKee expressed approval of the vegetation that would screen the pavement but noted that it would not be a permanent treatment. Upon request for clarification by Commissioner Becker, Commissioner Turner confirmed that the sitting area had already been constructed. Commissioner Becker expressed her concern about the placement of concrete on top of the roots of the tree but noted that removal of the pavement could further damage the tree. Commissioner Turner observed that the residence and adjacent residences are noncontributing structures, and Staff noted

the implementation of the overlay after their construction. Commissioner Shears expressed approval of the pavement for the sitting area but requested additional information about the pavers. The applicant stated that the pavers would not be connected to each other or the walkway but between three (3) and five (5) pavers would be placed south of the walkway. Upon inquiries from Commissioners Shears and Sanders, the applicant clarified the proposed location of the pavers. Commissioner Shears noted the need for additional details showing the exact dimensions, location, and construction of the pavers. The applicant responded that the concrete would be poured and the pavers placed in the ground. Commissioner Townsend noted that a Site Plan and dimensions for the pavers, along with an indication of the preferred material, was not included. Staff suggested that another term for "pavers" could be "stepping stones", and the applicant agreed. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the height of each step, and the applicant replied that he was not aware of the height as the steps had not yet been constructed. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, Staff noted that, when the Tulsa Preservation Commission had previously approved applications for stepping stones, the commission had often included conditions about dimensions, placement, number, and materials for their approval. Commissioner Shears stated that stepping stones might be acceptable but indicated a preference for concrete steps cast in place and connected to the walkway, and the applicant accepted the recommendation. Commissioner Shears stated that more information would be needed about the construction of the steps and noted that, depending on the height of the steps, a rail could be required. The applicant commented that the requirement for a rail would be considered during the review of the application for a Building Permit, but Commissioner Townsend explained that, if a rail were required, it would be subject to review and approval by the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve Items 1, 3, and 4. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Commissioner Shears again indicated the need for additional details about the construction of the pavers. Staff summarized the details requested by commissioners and stated that if the height of the steps exceeds thirty inches (30"), a rail would be required by the International Residential Code and should be reviewed and approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Shears requested a section of the steps. Upon an inquiry from Staff, Commissioners Turner and Reeds indicated that, upon the receipt of the requested information, Item 2 could be returned directly to the Tulsa Preservation Commission without a review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The applicant indicated his preference for the Tulsa Preservation Commission to vote on Item 2 so that he could appeal the decision to the Board of Adjustment. Staff noted the challenges of the review of projects initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit and explained that the proposal was acceptable in concept but required additional documentation. The applicant indicated acceptance of the extension of the period of review.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.5, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.6.1, B.6.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1523 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Grant
2. Turner			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			
9. Shears			

5. HP-0258-2021 / 1623 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 1, 2021

Applicant: Elysia Erickson

Proposal:

1. Installation of solar panels on roof

Staff presented its report, and afterwards Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended approval of the installation of solar panels on the rear of the residence and encouraged the applicant to install the other panels on the accessory structure. Commissioner Turner stated that the subcommittee did not approve of solar panels on the front of the ridge line because of the standards of the Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner Townsend clarified the location of the panels recommended for approval and noted that the panels should be installed flush with the roof, as shown in the mounting detail.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the installation of solar panels be limited to the southeast section of the roof south of the ridge line, that the panels be installed flush with the roof, and that any additional panels be installed on the accessory structure. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.6, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1623 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Grant
2. Turner			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			
9. Shears			

6. **HP-0260-2021 / 1568 S. Yorktown Ave.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 1, 2021
 Applicant: Elysia Erickson
 Proposal:
 1. Installation of solar panels on roof

Staff presented its report. Afterwards Commissioner Turner reported that the proposed location of the panels would be clearly visible from the street because the residence is located on a corner, so the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended the denial of the application in accordance with the Unified Design Guidelines.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.6

Vote: 1568 S. Yorktown Ave. **(Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Grant
2. Turner			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			
9. Shears			

5. **HP-0227-2020 / 2329 E. 17th Pl.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: October 20, 2020; March 16, 2021; April 1, 2021
 Applicant: Creative Home Designs
 Proposal:
 1. Construction of residence

Staff presented its report, sharing earlier versions of the design and describing the revisions made after each review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Turner reported that the subcommittee believed their concerns were adequately addressed in the final version of the proposal and noted that Neighborhood Representative McAfee's suggestion to relocate the second story toward the rear of the residence improved the south elevation and the perceived scale. Commissioner Turner expressed approval of the final version and added that the applicant had simplified the geometry of the roof and decorative details and had reduced the overall height since the first review. Commissioner Turner noted that the height of the retaining wall along the property line increased the appearance of the height of the residence. The applicant's representative, Ben Welch, added that the tallest ridge line is near the rear of the residence and would be less visible on the site than it appeared in the elevation, and Commissioner Turner observed that the dormers and the chimney on the sides of the residence would have the same effect. Valerie

O'Brien, 2136 East 17th Place, expressed her appreciation to the Tulsa Preservation Commission for its diligent review of the proposal and indicated disappointment in the scale of other residences in Barnard Trace. Neighborhood Representative McAfee expressed appreciation for the applicant's willingness to adjust the placement of the second story and to refrain from application of paint on the masonry. Upon inquiry from Commissioner Sanders, Mr. Welch stated that the overall height of the residence had been reduced by at least five feet (5'-0"). Commissioner Sanders indicated his approval of the proposal.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved with a majority.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.1.6, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3, C.5.4

Vote: 2329 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Parker		Grant
2. Turner			McKee
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Reeds			
6. Sanders			
7. Shears			

D. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Townsend reported that Commissioner Grant was no longer able to serve as Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee on Process, so Commissioner Reeds had accepted the role as Chair.

2. Staff Report

Staff reported that three (3) nominations for the National Register of Historic Places will be reviewed at the next Regular Meeting of the Tulsa Preservation Commission. A nomination for Hewgley Terrace, a nomination for Pioneer Plaza, and a Multiple Property Documentation for Tulsa Public Housing from 1966 to 1975 will be presented. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the Tulsa Boys' Home is included in the Multiple Property Documentation, and Staff offered to review the document and confirm whether the property was included.

Staff reported that Mayor Bynum selected Jillian Ihloff to fill the role of Realtor on the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Tulsa City Council will review the appointment on April 14, 2021.

E. New Business

Neighborhood Representative McAfee inquired when the Ad Hoc Committee on Process would convene, and Commissioner Townsend recommended his contact with Commissioner Reeds.

F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

G. Public Comment
None

H. Adjournment
Commissioner Townsend adjourned the Regular Meeting at 1:11 P.M.