



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, January 26, 2021, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Townsend called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:37 P.M.

Members Present

Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Chair
James E. Turner, AIA, Vice-Chair
Holly Becker
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
Mark D. G. Sanders

Members Absent

Joy Jones, Secretary
Chris J. Bumgarner
Susan J. McKee, MFA
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Robert L. Shears, ASLA²

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank¹, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Andrew M. Kern¹, Charles D. (Chas) Higgins¹, Craig Zietlow¹, David and Janice Connolly¹, Keith R. Dalessandro¹, Matthew D. McAfee¹, Sally H. Davies

¹ Participation via Remote Access

² Present via Remote Access but unable to participate due to the requirements of the Open Meeting Act

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 10, 2020

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Becker and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 10, 2020

In Favor

1. Townsend
2. Turner
3. Becker
4. Grant
5. Reeds
6. Sanders

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Jones
Bumgarner
McKee
Parker
Shears

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0239-2020 / 1540 S. Gillette Ave.** (Gillette)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 19, 2021

Applicant: Andrew M. Kern

Proposal:

1. Installation of solar panels on roof

While staff attempted to engage the PowerPoint Presentation, the applicant explained the proposal to install three (3) solar panels on the roof—a reduction from the six (6) panels originally proposed. Staff added that, according to the applicant, the three (3) panels would be visible from the street in only one direction and not in every season. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found little difference in visibility between the original proposal for installation of six (6) panels and the present proposal for installation of three (3) panels. The Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application with the condition that the panels be installed on the west side of the ridge, but the applicant had later noted that the placement of panels in that location would not be feasible. Commissioner Townsend inquired whether it was necessary for the panels to face south, and the applicant answered affirmatively, adding that the installation of the three (3) panels would allow his residence to rely completely on solar energy. Commissioner Sanders inquired about the length of ownership, and the applicant replied that the residence had been constructed for the previous owners in 2005 and that he had purchased the property in 2006. The applicant commented that, as an architect and engineer, he was sensitive to standards for historic preservation but was eager to incorporate new technology and added that, in his opinion, the installation of the panels would not adversely impact the neighborhood. Commissioner Sanders inquired about the structure previously on the site, and the applicant replied that the structure was a shed, not a residence. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether these panels could be placed at a ninety-degree (90°) angle at the ridge of the roof, and the applicant stated that any orientation on the southeast section of the roof would be acceptable. Commissioner Reeds replied that it would be an improvement but would not reduce the visibility of the panels. Commissioner Reeds then inquired whether the panels that were not visible from the street could be replaced with more efficient panels, and the applicant responded that the panels presently on the residence were already highly efficient and newly installed. Commissioner Becker announced that, although she understood other commissioners' hesitation to allow the installation of solar panels in their proposed location, the design of solar panels has improved over time and conservation of energy was a compelling reason to allow the installation of the solar panels.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to deny the application, citing Guideline A.7.6 in the Unified Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved by a majority. Commissioner Sanders noted that he voted in opposition to the motion because of the residence's status as a noncontributing structure.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.6, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1540 S. Gillette Ave. (**Gillette**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Becker		Jones
2. Turner	Sanders		Bumgarner
3. Grant			McKee
4. Reeds			Parker
5.			Shears

2. **HP-0241-2020 / 1767 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 19, 2021

Applicants: Craig and Lindsay Zietlow

Proposal:

1. Replacement of door on garage

Staff presented its report, and afterwards Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee felt the applicants had made a good attempt at replication of carriage-house doors and added that the panels would have a smooth surface. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Grant, Commissioner Turner confirmed that the doors would be hinged. The applicant added that the garage would be used as a workshop. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the reason for the doors to swing inward, and the applicant replied that the length of the driveway limited the ability of the doors to swing outward.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.6.3

Vote: 1767 S. St. Louis Ave. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Jones
2. Turner			Bumgarner
3. Becker			McKee
4. Grant			Parker
5. Reeds			Shears
6. Sanders			

3. **HP-0244-2020 / 1629 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 19, 2021

Applicant: Tom Neal Design

Proposals:

1. Replacement of rail on porch
2. Adjustment of height of gable on garage

Staff presented its report, noting that the detached garage extended into the street yard and, therefore, was subject to review by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found the adjustment of the height of the gable on the garage to be minimally intrusive and the porch to be compatible with the style of the residence and other porches

in the neighborhood. Commissioner Townsend commented on the apparent connection between the gable and the roof of the residence, but Commissioner Sanders clarified the presentation in the elevation, noting that the gable on the garage would not be connected to the residence.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5, B.6.1, B.6.2, B.6.3

Vote: 1629 S. Trenton Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Jones
2. Turner			Bumgarner
3. Becker			McKee
4. Grant			Parker
5. Reeds			Shears
6. Sanders			

4. **HP-0245-2020 / 1539 S. Gillette Ave.** (Gillette)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 19, 2021
Applicant: Pinnacle Home Design
Proposal:
1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, noting that a Site Plan had been provided at the request of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Turner reported that the addition would be barely visible from the street, and Commissioner Reeds added that the addition would have a minimal impact on the residence and neighborhood. Commissioner Turner recalled the discussion of the distance between the addition and the detached garage but noted that the owner's ability to access the garage should not be part of the Tulsa Preservation Commission's review of the proposal.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.2

Vote: 1539 S. Gillette Ave. **(Gillette)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Jones
2. Turner			Bumgarner
3. Becker			McKee
4. Grant			Parker
5. Reeds			Shears
6. Sanders			

5. **HP-0248-2021 / 706 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Charles D. (Chas) Higgins

Proposal:

1. Adjustment of height of porch

Application to amend previous approval of application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on September 22, 2020

Staff presented its report, sharing photographs showing the construction of the residence in progress. The applicant added that the topography on the site spurred the adjustment of the height of the porch. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Grant, the applicant stated that the front door was originally four inches (0'-4") above the porch and that the porch would not have been approximately five feet (5'-0") above grade. Staff inquired about the height of the porch compared to that of the residence to the south, and the applicant replied that they would be similar in height. Commissioner Turner observed that the porch would be higher than that of the adjacent residence, and Commissioner Reeds stated the porch ceiling would be lower. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Turner, the applicant confirmed that the entire residence would be higher. Commissioner Sanders inquired whether the roof of the porch could match that of the residence to the south, and the applicant replied that the height would be similar but observed that the height of the front door and floor of the balcony would limit the flexibility in the adjustment of the height of the roof over the porch. Commissioner Grant noted that the height of the stem wall had dramatically changed as a result of the adjustments and should have also been reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the applicant attempt to match the height of the porch ceiling on the residence to the south. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 706 N. Denver Ave. (**Brady Heights**)

In Favor

1. Townsend
2. Turner
3. Becker
4. Grant
5. Reeds
6. Sanders

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

- Jones
Bumgarner
McKee
Parker
Shears

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Townsend announced appointments to committees for the 2021 Calendar Year:

Historic Preservation Committee: James E. Turner (Chair), Holly Becker, Joy Jones, Susan J. McKee, Katelyn C. Parker, Mark D. G. Sanders, Chris J. Bumgarner (Alternate), Ted A. Reeds (Alternate), Robert L. Shears (Alternate)

Outreach Committee: Susan J. McKee (Chair), Holly Becker, Chris J. Bumgarner, Ted A. Reeds, James E. Turner

Rules and Regulations Committee: Katelyn C. Parker (Chair), Mark D. G. Sanders, Joy Jones, Robert L. Shears

Ad Hoc Committee on Process: Peter Grant (Chair), Chris J. Bumgarner, Joy Jones, Katelyn C. Parker

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on work in progress at The Joinery located at 640 North Denver Avenue. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the material of the facade and was informed that masonry has been used. Staff also reported on completion of Work at 739 North Cheyenne Avenue.

Staff proposed that events scheduled for the 2020-21 Fiscal Year, such as the Historic Homeowners Fair and a workshop on the treatment of wooden windows, be cancelled due to the threat posed by COVID-19 and that the Tulsa Preservation Commission consider using the funds allocated for contractual services to secure a consultant for a new survey of the Morningside Addition in the Maple Ridge Historic Residential District. The survey would be the first phase in the revision of the nomination of the Maple Ridge Historic Residential District, which did not identify every residence that could be considered a Contributing Resource. After discussion, the members of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and Neighborhood Representative Davies endorsed the proposal.

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Townsend adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:39 P.M.