



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, August 25, 4:30 P.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:44 P.M. As permitted by the temporary amendment of the Open Meeting Act, the Regular Meeting was conducted as a videoconference due to the concern about COVID-19.

Members Present

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair*
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair*
Joy Jones, Secretary*
Holly Becker*
Chris J. Bumgarner*
Susan J. McKee, MFA*
Katelyn C. Parker, RA*
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA**
David W. Schoell, P.E., S.E.**
Robert L. Shears, ASLA*
James E. Turner, AIA**

Members Absent

Staff Present

Mark Swiney*, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr.**, Felicity O. Good**

Others Present

Ryan Scamehorn**, Craig Zietlow*, Lindsey Gravender-Alexander*, Dale Davis*, Matthew D. McAfee McAfee*, Pam Crandall*, Mary Kollmorgen*

* Participation via Remote Access

** Attendance in South Conference Room

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 13, 2020

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved by majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 13, 2020

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant		Parker	Bumgarner*
2. Townsend		Turner	
3. Jones			
4. Becker			
5. McKee			
6. Reeds			
7. Schoell			
8. Shears			

*Present but unable to vote due to technical difficulties with GoToMeeting

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0210-2020 / 1767 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 18, 2020
Applicants: Craig and Lindsey Zietlow
Proposal:
 1. Installation of caps on chimneys

Staff presented its report, noting that the caps would conceal the flues, prevent the infiltration of moisture, and deter vermin. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had requested details about the color, material, and the connections of the caps to the chimneys, all of which were provided by the applicants. Commissioner Turner inquired about the color and was informed that the caps would be black. Commissioner Townsend added that each chimney cap would be custom-made.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.1, A.5.2

Vote: 1767 S. St. Louis Ave. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Bumgarner*
2. Townsend			
3. Jones			
4. Becker			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			
10. Turner			

*Present but unable to vote due to technical difficulties with GoToMeeting

2. **HP-0203-2020 / 2326 E. 17th St.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: June 16, 2020; July 21, 2020; August 18, 2020
Applicant: Creative Home Designs
Proposal:
 1. Construction of residence

Staff presented its report, sharing the revisions of the North Elevation and images of other residences along 17th Street in Barnard Trace. According to the applicant, the client had requested that the residence be designed in the style of the Garden District of New Orleans. Upon request of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, the applicant offered an alternative proposal for the north façade, replacing the first-story French Doors on either side of the entrance with windows. Commissioner Townsend directed attention to a message from Randy Wagner, the Yorktown Neighborhood Association’s president, in opposition to the proposal. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee grappled with the style of the residence because no examples of this style exist in the Yorktown Historic District but noted that the applicants refined the design and completed requested alterations, including enlarging the shutters to be proportional to the windows. Although the subcommittee did not resolve the underlying issue of the style, the application was forwarded with a recommendation of approval. At the request of Commissioner McKee, Staff read aloud the Unified Design Guidelines concerning the construction of new residences, and afterward Commissioner Parker emphasized Guidelines C.1.2 and C.1.4, which encourage consistency and continuity with the characteristics of historic structures in the district and respect to the scale of structures along the same street.

Commissioner Grant requested that the architects on the commission provide their opinions about the appropriateness of the proposed style. Commissioner Parker stated that the Yorktown Historic District mostly features Craftsman Style bungalows with a few Tudor Revival and Colonial Revival residences, so the style and scale of the proposed residence and its features, including the overall height of the residence and the size of the columns, were inappropriate for the neighborhood. Commissioner McKee agreed. Commissioner Reeds stated that the applicants had made numerous improvements, such as the removal of the dormers from the north façade, and noted that the residence was true to the style of the Garden District in New Orleans. Commissioner Reeds commented that Barnard Trace has an eclectic array of styles compared with the Yorktown and the Gillette Historic Districts and noted that the latter, which is adjacent to Barnard Trace, has larger homes than Yorktown. Commissioner Reeds directed attention to the Moderne Style residence in Barnard Trace and added that the proposed residence would fit within the context of Barnard Trace. Commissioner Turner agreed, noting that the residences within Barnard Trace fill their lots almost entirely. Although no Garden District style residences with second-story balconies can be found in the Yorktown or Gillette Historic Districts, Commissioner Turner stated the proposed residence was a fine example of a historical style and addressed most of the relevant Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner Turner expressed a preference for the proposal that included two sets of French Doors on the first story of the north façade.

The applicant's representative, Ryan Scamehorn, then responded to comments by the commissioners. Mr. Scamehorn indicated a preference for the first proposal for the north façade and addressed the concerns about the height of the residence, stating that the structure would be twenty-seven feet and four inches (27'-4") in height. According to Mr. Scamehorn, the rendering of the North Elevation made the residence appear larger than it actually would be, and there would be two-story residences in proximity on either side. Commissioner Parker stated that the residence appeared to be nearly thirty-three feet (33'-0") in height after review of the scale of the elevation.

Commissioner Grant opened the floor to comments and questions from commissioners. Commissioner McKee expressed concern about the precedent of the introduction of a new style on the overlay districts. Commissioner McKee emphasized that the residence does not draw upon architectural details on any other residence in the district and, therefore, does not comply with the Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner Jones agreed with the concern about precedent, noting that the style is not appropriate for the district and that future proposals could draw on the details of the Garden District style if the residence were constructed. Commissioner Turner disagreed, stating that the guidelines do not prohibit the introduction of new architectural styles for new residences, but Commissioners Parker and McKee emphasized that the residence did not draw upon common characteristics or architectural features of other residences in the district.

Commissioner Grant then recognized members of the public who wished to comment on the proposal. Mr. McAfee, Representative of the Yorktown Neighborhood Association, expressed disapproval of the proposal, stating that no example of a second-story covered porch or the proposed roof pitch exists in the district. Ms. Crandall stated that the residence would appear out of place in the neighborhood and could pose problems in the future. Ms. Kollmorgen objected to the application.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny the application. The motion to deny was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved by majority.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.1.6, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3, C.5.4

Vote: 2326 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	Grant		
2. Jones	Schoell		
3. Becker	Reeds		
4. Bumgarner	Turner		
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Shears			

3. Amendment of the Regular Meeting Schedule of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

Staff presented the request to amend the location of the Tulsa Preservation Commission’s Regular Meetings for the remainder of the year. Staff wishes to rely on the South Conference Room because of the ease of conducting virtual meetings.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to amend the Regular Meeting Schedule by changing the location to the South Conference Room for the remainder of the year. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved by majority.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Bumgarner*
2. Townsend			
3. Jones			
4. Becker			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			
10. Turner			

*Present but unable to vote due to technical difficulties with GoToMeeting

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at the residence located at 1819 East 17th Place. The owner has removed the Trex Composite Decking from the porch and replaced it with tongue-and-groove planks.

Staff reported on a project at 1104 North Cheyenne Avenue. Staff conducted a Site Visit and anticipates an application for an Historic Preservation Permit.

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:33 P.M.