



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, February 14, 2019, 11:00 A.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:03 A.M.

Members Present

David Schoell, Chair
Peter Grant, Vice-Chair
Ted Reeds
Chris Bumgarner
Holly Becker
Susan McKee
Katelyn Parker
Mary Lee Townsend
Robert Shears
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Joy Jones

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Audrey Blank, Amber Wagoner

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, January 22, 2019
Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, January 22, 2019

In Favor

1. Schoell
2. Turner
3. Reeds
4. Bumgarner
5. Becker
6. McKee
7. Parker
8. Townsend

Opposed

Abstaining

Grant
Shears

Not Present

Jones

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0058-201 / 1601 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019
Applicant: Jennifer Barcus-Schafer
Proposal:
 1. Construction of addition
 2. Installation of columns on porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the applicant had provided identification of materials as requested. The applicant stated that the columns to be installed on the front porch would replicate the dimensions of the columns on the back porch. Staff noted that the north and east facades of the proposed addition would be visible if the existing fence were to be removed. Commissioner Parker requested confirmation that a previous application for replacement of windows was not included in the present application, which was provided. Commissioner Schoell requested confirmation that the applicant would be utilizing an existing roof for the construction of the addition, which was confirmed. Commissioner Turner inquired about the height of the current fence, and the applicant responded that the fence is six feet (6'-0") in height. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the request by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee for the addition of a window on the east facade. The applicant stated that the new windows will match the current style on the residence but was unsure of the placement of the window on the east facade due to the location of the shower. Commissioner Turner requested confirmation that the trim on the beam and the siding below the beam would be used, and the applicant confirmed that as much of the existing porch as possible will be used. Commissioner Turner inquired if the window on the porch would be installed on the addition, and the applicant responded that the window's condition was too poor to be salvaged.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that a window be added to the east facade which would be of similar size to the window on the north facade and that both windows would match the windows presently on the residence or windows approved as the replacements. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1601 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

2. **HP-0059-2019 / 2120 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019

Applicant: Karen K. Freudenrich

Proposal:

1. Installation of columns on porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the applicant provided the requested dimensions. Commissioner Turner requested confirmation that the dimensions of the columns were similar to those on the columns on an adjacent residence. The applicant stated that they did not measure their neighbor's columns. Commissioner Reeds requested confirmation that the dimensions of the pier below the column were based on actual dimensions, which the applicant provided.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved unanimously.

Vote: 2120 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

3. **HP-0060-2019 / 1602 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer

Proposal:

1. Replacement of doors

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the requested dentil shelf was provided by the applicant. Commissioner Schoell indicated that it was unclear whether the doors were original but noted that doors uniform in appearance will be an improvement. The applicant stated that the preference was a door without the dentil shelf. Commissioner Parker noted that the dentil shelf would be a nice addition to the door on the primary residence, to which the applicant agreed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the condition that only the door of the primary residence would have a dentil shelf. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and was approved unanimously.

Vote: 1602 S. Trenton Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

In Favor

1. Schoell
2. Grant
3. Becker
4. Bumgarner
5. McKee
6. Parker
7. Reeds
8. Shears
9. Townsend
10. Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Jones

4. **HP-0061-2019 / 1215 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019

Applicant: John W. Cannon

Proposal:

1. Construction of addition
2. Removal of windows
3. Installation of French Doors

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the applicant provided additional clarification of existing materials. Commissioner Turner inquired which portion of the addition would be visible from the street and was informed that a site visit confirmed that the west facade of the addition would barely be visible from the street. The applicant stated that the northeast corner of the residence is visible from the street but that they have a privacy fence in place. Commissioner Turner then requested confirmation that all of the French Doors would have the same design.

The applicant confirmed that the doors would all have the same design and that vinyl windows would be removed to install the French Doors.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1215 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

5. **HP-0068-2019 / 1131 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019

Applicant: Shane Hood

Proposal:

1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the applicant provided additional information on materials. Commissioner Turner inquired if the siding was wood, and the applicant confirmed the selection of that material.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved by majority.

Vote: 1131 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell	McKee		Jones
2. Grant	Parker		
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Reeds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

6. **HP-0070-2019 / 1325 E. 18th St. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 7, 2019

Applicant: Jeffrey S Robinson

Proposal:

1. Construction of addition
2. Construction of pergola
3. Replacement of non-historical windows
4. Restoration of historic siding
5. Installation of lantern on porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the applicant provided additional information on materials, as well as the adjustment of the size of a window. Commissioner Turner requested confirmation that the applicant would restore the water table, and the applicant indicated that the element would be restored or replaced in kind. Commissioners Parker, Reeds, and Schoell stated their preference for a putty bead.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the addition of a putty bead. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1325 E. 18th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

7. **HP-0071-2019 / 1632 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas

Proposal:

6. Relocation of meter

Staff presented its report, noting that Oklahoma Natural Gas had agreed to relocate the meter behind the privacy fence. Commissioner Turner inquired about the treatment of the meter presently on the site, but the staff had not been informed by the applicant about any treatment.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the meter be located behind the fence and the subterranean vault be removed and the yard restored. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1632 S. Quincy Ave. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

8. **HP-0072-2019 / 1726 S. Yorktown Ave.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: S. Drew Word

Proposal:

1. Replacement of door
2. Replacement of tile on porch

Staff presented its report. Commissioner Parker stated that she had no issues with the door but felt that the tile pattern did not match the period for the style of this residence. The applicant stated that he had attempted to choose something appropriate but was unsure about the direction in the Unified Design Guidelines. Commissioner Townsend shared the guidelines with the applicant. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the dimensions of the tiles, and the applicant stated that they were 6"x6". Commissioner Parker suggested that brick tiles would be more appropriate. Staff informed the applicant that the issue would not be with the color of the tile but the pattern. The applicant stated that tile without a pattern would be acceptable.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application for the replacement of the door with a continuation of the review of the proposal for the replacement of the tile until the next Regular Meeting on February 26, 2019. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1726 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Shears			
9. Townsend			
10. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Schoell met with Staff and Susan Miller, Director of the Tulsa Planning Office, to discuss interaction between that agency and the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Susan expressed enthusiasm about the proposal for a Homeowners Fair, hosted by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Schoell inquired about progress on development of a prototype by Thermal Windows and requested that the staff contact Councilors Hall-Harper and McKee and invite them to Regular Meetings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

2. Staff Report

Staff informed the commissioners that they would meet with residents of the Lewiston Gardens, Gillette, and Yorktown Neighborhoods on Saturday, February 16, 2019, to discuss the Lewis Study and learn how the community would like the staff to respond. Staff felt their presence would be necessary as the Lewiston Gardens Neighborhood is not currently zoned as a Historic Preservation Overlay District, but the desire to pursue designation could be an outcome of the meeting.

D. New Business

Commissioner Becker inquired if anyone would attend the Statewide Preservation Conference and whether there were funds available to address expenses. Commissioner Schoell stated that the Tulsa Preservation Commission was able to assist with expenses previously. Staff stated that there were no funds available but that there could be funds available to address expenses for the conference in 2020.

Commissioner Turner relayed that the Greater Tulsa Area Realtors Association (GTAR) had requested a presentation from the Tulsa Preservation Commission and noted that the Home Builders Association (HBA) had also expressed interest in a presentation. Staff will contact these organizations and inquire about a schedule for presentations.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:11 P.M.