



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, September 29, 2016, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Vice-Chairman Craddock called the Special Meeting to order at 4:32 P.M.

Members Present

Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman
David Schoell, Secretary
David Pounds**
Jim Turner*
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Michael Birkes

Members Absent

Robert Shears, Chairman
John Snyder
Ted Reeds
Peter Grant

*Late

**Left Early

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Kristin Pack, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Cherie Cook, Pat Fox, Patrick Fox, Brandon Cooper, Greg Simmons, Chip Atkins, Rob Gallant, Kenneth Thornburgh

2. Approval of Minutes from August 23, 2016.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the Minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, August 23, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		McKee	Shears
2. Schoell			Snyder
3. Pounds			Turner
4. Neal			Reeds
5. Birkes			Grant

3. Approval of Minutes from September 8, 2016.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the Minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, September 8, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		McKee	Shears
2. Schoell			Snyder
3. Pounds			Turner
4. Neal			Reeds
5. Birkes			Grant

4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Neal stated he previously worked with Pat Fox's mother; however, he has no association with the project proposed in the application for HP-16-061.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-060 / 204 E. 19th St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jana M. Simmons

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace 23 original, jailhouse-style windows with double-hung vinyl, Simulated-Divided-Light windows with matching muntins
Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Greg Simmons, was present. Commissioner Schoell stated the window sashes appeared to be in good condition with most of the wood degradation on the window sill, which can be repaired or replaced with wood. Commissioner Neal agreed with Commissioner Schoell. Commissioner Schoell explained to Mr. Simmons various methods to weatherize and repair wood windows without replacement. Commissioner McKee recommended to the applicant that, if the

windows were determined to be unrepairable, they should be replaced with wood windows to keep the character of the house.

Citizen, Cherie Cook, stated if replacement is required, then the windows should be replaced with wood windows, since it is important for the integrity of the house and added there were some local contractors who can repair wood windows. Citizen, Chip Atkins, agreed with Ms. Cook.

Commissioner Neal asked Staff about the six windows that the applicant replaced prior to review. Staff stated the Preservation Commission does not have the authority to require removal; however, a violation of the Zoning Code would require Working In Neighborhoods Department to address violations.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

Vote: 204 E. 19th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Schoell			Turner
3. Pounds			Snyder
4. McKee			Reeds
5. Neal			Grant
6. Birkes			

2. HP-16-069 / 1876 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kenneth Thornburgh

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace west basement wall with smooth-face concrete block

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Kenneth Thornburgh, was present. Mr. Thornburgh stated the house had belonged to his grandmother since 1963, and the east basement wall was already replaced after the run-off from the elevated grade to the basement caused water damage. Mr. Thornburgh stated he was willing to use a cap or a similar cover to match the historic wall material, but rusticated blocks were difficult to find.

Commissioner Neal stated he was sympathetic to the applicant's dilemma, and there are companies who sell a similar material to the rusticated block. Mr. Thornburgh stated he had already received Staff Approval of a Historic Preservation Permit for replacement in-kind of the east basement wall.

Citizen, Chip Atkins, recommended salvaging some of the block to use above grade. Commissioner McKee recommended a veneer that could be applied to both basement walls for continuity. Commissioner Schoell stated smooth-face block does not have the historic integrity of the Yorktown Historic District and recommended a heavier stucco finish. Mr. Thornburgh stated he is willing to apply a veneer on the smooth-face block.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the application with the condition that a cast-concrete veneer was applied to the smooth-face concrete block on the west and east basement walls to match the existing pattern on the west basement wall. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Birkes. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.3, A.2.4.

Vote: 1876 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Turner			Snyder
4. McKee			Grant
5. Neal			Reeds
6. Birkes			

3. HP-16-066 / 1115 E. 16th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Rob Gallant

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: September 20, 2016

Request:

1. Reconstruct porch on east façade according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Rob Gallant, was present. Mr. Gallant stated he preferred to leave the second-story door operable for safety reasons, but he would need a rail to meet the requirements of the Building Code. Commissioner Craddock expressed his appreciation of the applicant's efforts to restore the house's historic porch.

Commissioner Birkes made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Neal. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5.

Vote: 1115 E. 16th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Turner			Snyder
4. McKee			Reeds
5. Neal			Grant
6. Birkes			

4. HP-16-061 / 1715 S. Peoria Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Patrick Fox for Dr. Randy McCormick

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: September 1, 2016/September 20, 2016

Request:

1. Construct new medical office according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's representative, Patrick Fox, was present. Mr. Pat Fox, the architect, stated he approached the project being mindful of the condition of the property, since the lot was located on an urban arterial street. A Special Exception from the Board of Adjustment has been pursued, since the property is zoned RM-2. Mr. Pat Fox stated he believed the Unified Design Guidelines recommended parking should be as remote as possible from residential areas, and he took that into consideration for locating the parking in the street yard, instead of the rear yard. Other considerations were the attempts to reduce the curb cuts on South Peoria Avenue and meet the requirements for parking in the Zoning Code and a desire to orient the building to the street.

Mr. Patrick Fox noted the buildings along the same block have paved parking in the street yard, and he has proposed the same conditions to keep parking away from residential buildings. He described the appearance of the building and noted the rear elevation will not have windows to respect the privacy of the residential buildings behind it. Commissioner Neal informed the Preservation Commission that, during the HP Permit Subcommittee reviews, the meetings were focused on the placement of the office on the site, rather than the design of the building.

Commissioner McKee expressed concern over screening the parking lot. Mr. Patrick Fox stated the fence will extend as close as possible without interfering with the sight triangle. Commissioner Turner expressed concern over the height of the proposed retaining wall with the difference of three feet in the topography. Mr. Patrick Fox confirmed there will be a retaining wall on the south and east edges of the property and a fence six feet in height on the retaining wall. Commissioner Turner asked where the mechanical equipment

will be located and was informed that it will be placed on the ground at the rear of the property.

Commissioner Neal stated that he believed the application does not meet Guidelines C.1.2, C.1.4, C.1.5, and C.2.1 and that the applicant failed to compromise with the HP Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Neal stated the parking could be addressed by making the front façade narrower and raised to two stories, which would provide enough parking. Mr. Patrick Fox stated they oriented the building to the street and placed parking in front like the other houses on the block. Commissioner Craddock agreed the HP Permit Subcommittee reviewed the orientation and site, but he noted the HP Permit Subcommittee agreed the parking could not be on the rear of the property. Commissioner Neal respectfully disagreed with Commissioner Craddock, since historically the neighboring properties would have had parking in the rear. Mr. Pat Fox stated he forwarded the HP Permit Subcommittee's comments to his client; however, the recommendation to orient the building differently was not followed, since it seemed to provide less parking.

Citizen, Chip Atkins, stated when the Swan Lake Historic District was in the process of review for the HP Zoning Overlay, there was heavy discussion about which buildings would be incorporated within the boundary, and commercial buildings were purposely removed from the district.

Commissioner Turner stated he did not oppose the site layout since the other option to turn the building would place parking next to residential buildings. Commissioner Turner stated he was more concerned with the height of the retaining wall on the rear of the property and its impact on the residential area. Mr. Pat Fox stated there is a significant drainage issue for the properties on the east and south, and, since the water flows through the rear yards, he attempted to divert the water to South Peoria Avenue. Mr. Atkins agreed there is a flooding issue and noted many of the garage apartments have flooded.

Commissioner Schoell noted in the HP Permit Subcommittee Notes that an elevation showing the new office with the rest of the buildings along the street had been requested and added it would be helpful to illustrate the mass of the new building and the existing buildings. Mr. Patrick Fox and Mr. Pat Fox stated the building on the adjacent lot is two stories in height. Commissioner McKee stated she did not have enough information about the parking lot, the screening wall, and the retaining wall. Mr. Pat Fox stated he was willing to lower the grade, but he believes the proposed building will meet the scale of the other buildings. Commissioner Schoell requested more information about the way the applicant would address the building, if it does not match the scale of the adjacent properties.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell. Acting as Chairman, Vice-Chairman Craddock called a ten-minute recess for Mr. Patrick Fox to confirm a continuance of the review with his client. Commissioner Neal withdrew his motion to deny the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the withdrawal.

Commissioner Turner requested the applicant return with a section or an elevation of the retaining wall and an illustration of the landscaping. Commissioner Schoell requested an elevation along the curb line to show the scale of the proposed building in comparison with the adjacent buildings. Mr. Patrick Fox stated he could provide an illustration of the entire block.

With the agreement of the applicant's representative, Commissioner Birkes made a motion to continue the review of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Neal and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.3.1, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3, G.2.4.1, G.2.4.2, G.2.4.3, G.3.1.

Vote: 1715 S. Peoria Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Turner			Snyder
4. McKee			Reeds
5. Neal			Grant
6. Birkes			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report – None.
2. Staff Report – None.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Vice-Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 7:11 P.M.