



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, January 27, 2015, 4:30 PM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

David Pounds as Chairman called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:31 p.m.

Members Present

David Pounds, Chair
Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Susan McKee
Ted Reed, EX-OF
Michael Craddock
Tom Neal*
Jim Turner*
John Snyder*
*Late

Members Absent

Pam Deatherage, EX-OF
Charles Sottong

Staff Present

Amanda DeCort, Bob Edmiston, Kristin Pack

Others Present

John Kratzert, Amy Fehl, Lynnwood Moore, Jim Edwards

2. Approval of Minutes from January 8, 2015.

Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the request.
Commissioner Pounds seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes December 11, 2014.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears		Pound	Neal
2. Schoell		McKee	Snyder
3. Craddock			Sottong
			Turner

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-14-40 / 2131 E. 17th Place** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Amy Fehl

COA Subcommittee Review Date: October 21, 2014

Request:

Replace original wooden windows with aluminum clad-exterior, wood-interior windows except original façade windows

Kristin Pack presented a summary of the property to the board and read applicable guidelines. The applicant was present for the meeting. The applicant explained her and husband's intention was to keep the façade windows, but the side windows are frosted and the film is not removable. The impact on the applicant living in the house is high.

The applicant stated the house is drafty and explain which windows would remain and which would be replaced. The windows designated for replacement are the side and rear windows. It was noted the rear windows are exempt from review.

Commissioner Shears asked the applicant why she wants to replace the windows.

The applicant replied the windows are leaky, and the windows make the house cold. She noted the irremovable film, and the windows are hazardous in case of emergency for small children, because they are hard to open. She stated the windows would have to be taken apart completely and put back together, and they may or may not be operable. She stated the cost would be expensive with an uncertain outcome.

Commissioner Pounds noted when referring to the criteria: A.4.1 is negligible and A.4.5 does not sound like the windows are deteriorated to the state that they could not be repaired. There was no evidence to show the windows cannot be repaired.

The Board noted that this guideline has been applied in varied ways in the past.

The applicant stated she is open to suggestions for a window that will work better.

It was noted there are historic storm options for windows a child could open. The applicant stated her child is eight years old.

The applicant mentioned the irremovable film, and the Commission suggested the glass can be replaced with clear glass, and the applicant can replace them as closely as possible.

The Commission discussed the A.4.5 guideline for the replacement of historic windows. The applicant stated the windows are not rotted, but they do not function. She noted the wood is warped in some places, and she cannot open the window, but her husband can open them with difficulty.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny the request. Commissioner Pounds seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.4, and A.4.5.

Vote: 2131 E. 17th Place (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	Snyder		Sottong
2. Shears	Turner		
3. Schoell	Craddock		
4. McKee			
5. Neal			

2. COA-14-44 / 1545 S. Yorktown Avenue (Gillette)

Applicant: David Ferrin for John L. Kratzert
COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

Replace original windows with Fibrex windows

Kristin Pack presented a summary of the property to the Board and noted it was continued from the last meeting. The applicant was present for the meeting, and presented new information during the meeting for the Commissioners including a contractor statement and photographs. The Commission proceeded to review the documents.

The applicant stated he chose Renewal by Anderson, because he wanted the muntins to match.

Commissioner Pounds reiterated what was stated previously about the guidelines, and stated he will not argue with the price of the windows. Commissioner Turner asked was it deemed “necessary” and noted the guidelines do not say “beyond repair”. The Commission discussed what is considered necessary for replacement. The Commission asked if the windows are irreparable. Commissioner Schoell stated that is considered to be “irreparable” and “reparable” is to be determined by that Commission, and the guidelines rely on the expertise of the Commissioners to make the judgment. Commissioner Turner stated he does not think the guidelines try to eliminate replacement as an option. Turner noted the Commission would like people to repair their windows if they are capable. Commissioner McKee noted the Commission has approved window replacement when the windows could have been fixed or repaired under the old guidelines. Commissioner Pounds noted Guideline A.4.4 states efficiency is not a reason to replace your windows.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny the request. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.4, A.4.5.

Vote: 1545 S. Yorktown Avenue (Gillette)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	Turner		Sottong
2. Shears			
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Snyder			
6. Craddock			
7. Neal			

Amanda DeCort informs the applicant, he does have the right to appeal within ten calendar days. The applicant asks is the appeal information to be included with the letter.

3. COA-15-01 / 1723 S. Madison Ave (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jim Edwards for Bruce and Lizbeth Hudkins

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

Replace existing walkway and sidewalk with new walkway and sidewalk according to plans submitted

Kristin Pack presented a summary of the property to the board and applicant was present at the meeting.

Commissioner Neal noted the Hudkins were his clients in the past. He apologizes and asked to reclused himself at 5:40 p.m.

The applicant (Edwards) jokingly stated he is happy with the windows, and noted his father was the President of the Maple Ridge Association and helped stopped the Maple Ridge expressway. He discussed the unique properties of concrete. He noted all the jobs he completed in Maple Ridge, he avoided fresh concrete. The applicant did a site match, and his contractor in Tulsa confirmed the balustrade is cast stone.

Commission Pounds asked the Commission how to repair concrete. Commissioner Schoell stated original paving is simply concrete with varied thickness based on Model T loading. It was noted Commission Schoell lives on the same street.

The Commission noted the concrete is spalling and asked if any holes are greater than a quarter of an inch. The Commission noted the spalling would retain water and continue to spall, and there was not a good repair method.

The Commission discussed the walkway design. It was noted the Commission has previously approved concrete with brick walkways. The applicant stated he found a brick that matches the house and believes a cast stone border with a concrete or brick interior would look great and the homeowner would accept it.

The Commission noted the idea of cast stone border inlaid with brick, and the cast stone would match the existing porch steps. The Commission stated they would like to see the proposed brick.

Commissioner Shears asked if the public right of way remained the same then it might provide better consistency along the street. The applicant stated he believed the homeowner would not mind if the walkway did not extend to the street.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to continue the applicant's request and application to the next COA Subcommittee Meeting. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.2.1, G.2.2, and G.2.3.

Vote: 2131 E. 17th Place (Yorktown)

In Favor

1. Pounds
2. Shears
3. Schoell

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Sottong

- 4. McKee
- 5. Snyder
- 6. Turner
- 7. Craddock

8. **COA-15-02 / 1625 S. Norfolk Avenue** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Robert Spurlock

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

- a. Construct dry-stack limestone retaining wall around west and south side of property
- b. Construct decorative iron fence with gate along west and partial south yards and replace existing fence with a semi-private cedar plank fence

Kristin Pack presented a summary of the property to the board and applicant was absent from the meeting.

Amanda DeCort noted the Commission does not review the wall and fence behind the front building line.

Commissioner Shears made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting with conditions the applicant brings details of the bulkheads, a section of the retaining wall, maximum heights, interface between the fence and the wall, the iron fence gate and wall, and to be present to answer questions. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.1.4 and G.1.5.

Vote: 1625 S. Norfolk Avenue (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds			Sottong
2. Shears			
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Turner			
8. Craddock			

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

a. Committees

Commissioner Pounds stated the Commission has three committees: Outreach, Rules and Regulations, and COA Subcommittee. Prior to

the retreat, the Commissioners need to think about on which committee they want to participate. During the retreat, new committee assignments and chair will be decided.

b. Retreat Date

The Commission agreed the retreat date to be set for Saturday, February 21, 2015. It was noted the retreat will probably be held at Cyntergy's conference room from 9 a.m. to 12 p.m. Commissioner Schoell will check with the council meeting room.

B. Staff Report

a. Staff COAs

Amanda DeCort thanks Kristin Pack for all her hard work.

C. New Business

Commissioner Neal discussed the issue of window applicants and asked the TPC staff to prime applicants. Kristin Pack asked what they would like to see before she meets with a new applicant. Commissioner Pounds suggested specifics for each window, deficiencies with photos. The Commission agreed to discuss the window issue further at the retreat.

Amanda DeCort announced the zoning code update meeting for Wednesday, February 18 at 11:00 a.m.

Commissioner Turner stated he has the February 4th CAT meeting.

D. Announcements and Further Agenda Items

None.

E. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 6:39 pm by Chairman Pounds.