



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, September 8, 2016, 11:00 AM**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:01 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Robert Shears, Chairman  
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman\*  
David Schoell, Secretary  
Jim Turner  
David Pounds  
John Snyder  
Ted Reeds  
Peter Grant  
Michael Birkes

#### **Members Absent**

Tom Neal  
Susan McKee

\*Late

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Kristin Pack, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Greg Simmons, Tim Contreras

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from August 23, 2016.

Staff stated the minutes will be ready for review at the next regular meeting.

## B. Actionable Items

### 1. **HP-16-060 / 204 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jana M. Simmons

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Replace 23 original, jailhouse-style windows with SDL, double-hung vinyl, Simulated-Divided-Light windows with matching muntins  
*Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Greg Simmons, was present. Staff notified the Commission that the applicants proceeded with their project without a Historic Preservation (HP) Permit; however, the applicants submitted an HP Permit Application using the fax number listed on the Tulsa Preservation Commission (TPC) website. Staff did not receive the application. When the owners were notified of the violation, they halted the installation of the windows and resubmitted their application. Staff has since removed the fax number from the website.

Commissioner Reeds asked Staff if a site plan was submitted with the application. Staff responded it was requested but never received. Referring to the photographs shown in the presentation, Mr. Simmons explained he did not know the extent of the damage to the windows until the windows on the rear of the house were removed. Commissioner Pounds asked the applicant if he is replacing the window frame. Mr. Simmons replied yes, and when they submitted the application via fax, it was his responsibility to know if it was received before the project began.

Mr. Simmons explained that he could not provide a picture of the heat and sound difference between the installed windows and the original windows, and he and his wife wanted to upgrade the windows for some time. Commissioner Shears asked the applicant if he knew he was aware of the requirement for a HP Permit. Mr. Simmons replied when they submitted the application via fax and did not receive a reply, they believed they could proceed. Staff stated they had two conversations with Mrs. Simmons before the project began once reminding Mrs. Simmons of the requirement of a HP Permit and another during a site visit.

Commissioner Birkes asked the applicant if the replacement windows will feature matching muntins. Mr. Simmons replied most of the windows are four-over-one muntins with a few six-over-one muntins, and he wishes to match the original muntin pattern. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the replacement windows feature interior and exterior simulated divided light. Tim Contreras, Mr. Simmons's contractor, replied yes.

Mr. Simmons stated the eating area located in the back of the house is never used because it is too hot in the summer and too cold in the winter because of the west facing windows. The Commission, Mr. Simmons, and Mr. Contreras discussed energy efficiency between wood and replacement windows.

Commissioner Turner expressed in his opinion, there is deterioration in the upper and lower sashes and explained to Mr. Simmons that vinyl windows are not preferred since they do not replicate the historic elements of wood windows such as sash and design. Mr. Contreras stated the replacement windows are pocket replacements, and Commissioner Turner asked Mr. Contreras to clarify if they are keeping the window frames. Mr. Contreras replied yes. Commissioner Turner asked for the measurements of the sashes.

Commissioner Reeds asked the applicant if he would agree to a continuance, so he could provide more documentation for his application. Mr. Simmons replied yes. Commissioner Turner requested more information about the replacement windows such as dimensions, cut sheet and pictures. Commissioner Schoell asked the applicant if he still has the original windows, and Mr. Simmons replied they were donated to Habitat for Humanity.

With the applicant's agreement, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to continue the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Birkes. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

**Vote:** 204 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears		Schoell	Neal
2. Craddock			McKee
3. Pounds			
4. Turner			
5. Snyder			
6. Reeds			
7. Grant			
8. Birkes			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report - None
2. Staff Report

Staff Approvals – Staff presented the staff approval since the last regular meeting.

Violations – Staff presented violations located in the HP Overlay Districts.

D. New Business

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None.

F. Adjournment  
Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:09 P.M.