



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, August 23, 2016, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Chairman
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman
David Schoell, Secretary
Susan McKee*
Tom Neal
John Snyder*
Ted Reeds
Peter Grant
Michael Birkes

Members Absent

David Pounds
Jim Turner

*Late

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Kristin Pack, Bob Edmiston*

Others Present

Brandon Cooper, Myles Norman

2. Approval of Minutes from August 11, 2016.

After discussion, Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the Minutes with the condition to strike comments shown under New Business. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, August 11, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock		Shears	Pounds
2. Schoell		Reeds	Turner
3. Neal			McKee
4. Grant			Snyder
5. Birkes			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-055 / 1401 E. 17th St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Muselmann

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace siding on east and south facades of addition with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding to match exposure on primary structure

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, John Muselmann, was absent. Commissioner Neal noted the addition does not have any siding as of yesterday, and he asked whether the applicant sought to match the existing material in a previous project. Commissioner Neal commented that the original window trim seemed to be slanted or slightly angled. Staff agreed. The Commission discussed whether the application included window trim.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

Vote: 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Turner
2. Craddock			Pounds
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			
8. Grant			
9. Birkes			

2. **HP-16-056 / 1824 E. 16th Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicants: Amanda and Brandon Cooper

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Replace two (2) original, Prairie-Style windows on north facade with double-hung aluminum windows with matching muntins
2. Replace six (6) original, Prairie-Style windows on east and west facades with single-hung aluminum, one-over-one windows
3. Replace non-original panel door and original, Prairie-Style sidelights with Craftsman-Style, six-light, two-panel door and aluminum sidelights with matching muntins

Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Brandon Cooper, was present. Mr. Cooper stated he was not aware of any guidelines, or he would have submitted an application. Mr. Cooper stated the dining room floor was recently replaced and will be replaced again after water leaked into the house during a storm. He stated he and his wife were concerned about lead-based paint on the windows around their young child. They wish to provide more efficiency by using double-pane windows but wanted to match the window trim.

Commissioner Shears asked the applicant when he purchased the house, and the applicant replied three years ago. Commissioner Shears asked the applicant if the realtor notified the applicants that they were in a historic district, and the applicant replied the realtor told him the house was in a historic district, but he did not know what that entailed. Mr. Cooper stated that he intends to submit an application to repair and replace siding in the future and that some windows were replaced by a previous owner after a fire. Commissioner Neal noted some of the windows on the east facade were replaced without a Historic Preservation Permit. Commissioner McKee informed the Commission that the contractor was notified of the requirement of a Historic Preservation Permit and the violation of the Zoning Code, after which the contractor relayed the information to the homeowners. After the owners were informed, they then instructed the contractor to proceed with the window installation. Commissioner Reeds asked Staff to clarify which windows are visible from the public right-of-way, and Staff identified the windows. Commissioner Neal noted some of the windows are obscured due to vegetation and a fence.

Commissioner Schoell stated he did not see enough deterioration in the windows and no deterioration in the sidelights, but he does not see an issue with replacing the door. Commissioner Neal noted the original door may have been a full-glass door with muntins. Commissioner Reeds asked the applicant if the window contractor asked him if he was in a historic district. Mr. Cooper

replied yes and added that the contractor had replaced windows along the same street with aluminum windows. Commissioner Craddock noted that the bid sheet includes an entry with the owner's initials which indicates the customer is aware they are in an historic district, although the district is incorrectly identified.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny Items 1 and 2 of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6.

Vote: 1824 E. 16th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	Craddock		Turner
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. McKee			
4. Neal			
5. Snyder			
6. Reeds			
7. Grant			
8. Birkes			

Commissioner McKee requested separation of Item 3 into two parts. Commissioner Neal requested the applicant provide a better cut sheet for the proposed door. Commissioner Grant recommended that the applicant not replace the existing sidelights since an aluminum sidelight would detract from the existing opening.

With the applicant's agreement, Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue review of Item 3 of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.8.

Vote: 1824 E. 16th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Craddock			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			
8. Grant			
9. Birkes			

3. HP-16-058 / 1819 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Myles Norman

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Construct concrete porch rail with stucco finish
2. Construct concrete block bulkheads, concrete steps, and concrete porch deck and cover with tile

Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Myles Norman, was present. Mr. Norman stated he believes the steps and deck of the porch were changed in the late 1990s and are not original since the material was treated wood. He kept the original beams underneath the deck.

Commissioner McKee asked the applicant if he changed the porch from wood to concrete. Mr. Norman replied the porch has a plywood base covered with a cement board. Commissioner Schoell recommended using brick bulkheads instead of concrete block but would not recommend tile over the steps and bulkheads. Commissioner Craddock requested close-up pictures of the porch and proposed features. Commissioner Neal recommended having the application reviewed by the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee and using stucco for the railing and bulkheads. Commissioner Shears recommended the applicant file a new application and proceed with the HP Permit Subcommittee.

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3.

Vote: 1819 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Turner
2. Craddock			Pounds
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			
8. Grant			
9. Birkes			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report - None
2. Staff Report - No staff approvals since the last meeting. Staff informed the Commission of three violations of the Zoning Code with one application still under review by Staff.

D. New Business

In response to comments made by an applicant in his presentation earlier this afternoon, Commissioner Neal suggested that it would be appropriate if the Staff could keep up with ownership changes in our Historic Preservation Overlay Districts and, upon determining that a new property owner has moved in, supply that new owner by mail or otherwise information about the Tulsa Preservation Commission and its role (desire) to assist the owner to preserve, protect, and enhance the historical elements of the property revered by the entire community.

Staff commented that annual notifications are presently made explaining the role of the Preservation Commission and reminding the HP District residents of the unique nature of their ownership and the special support it receives in the Zoning Code.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:42 P.M.