



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, June 28, 2016, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - South Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Robert Shears, Chairman  
Mike Craddock, Vice Chairman  
David Schoell, Secretary  
Michael Birkes  
Peter Grant  
Tom Neal  
David Pounds  
John Snyder  
Jim Turner

#### **Members Absent**

Susan McKee  
Ted Reeds

#### **Staff Present**

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Ed Kaplan, Dani Widell, Juli Couch

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from June 9, 2016.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the Minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, June 9, 2016.**

| <u>In Favor</u>  | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|--|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Craddock<br>2. Schoell<br>3. Birkes<br>4. Grant<br>5. Neal<br>6. Pounds<br>7. Snyder<br>8. Turner |                | Shears            |                    |

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

**B. Actionable Items**

**1. HP-16-035 / 1109 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Dani Widell

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Requests:

1. Replace non-original door and sidelights with Craftsman Style door and sidelights according to documentation submitted
2. Construct Gothic Picket Fence according to Site Plan submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Turner inquired about the feature above the door, and the applicant responded that it resembled trim with dentils and that it would be retained. Commissioner Neal inquired whether the new door would be specifically constructed to fit the doorway, and the applicant responded that the door and sidelights would be manufactured according to her specifications.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Neal and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.3.1, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.8, G.1.3, G.1.4

**Vote: 1109 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

- | <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Shears       |                |                   |                    |
| 2. Craddock     |                |                   |                    |
| 3. Schoell      |                |                   |                    |
| 4. Birkes       |                |                   |                    |
| 5. Grant        |                |                   |                    |
| 6. Neal         |                |                   |                    |
| 7. Pounds       |                |                   |                    |
| 8. Snyder       |                |                   |                    |
| 9. Turner       |                |                   |                    |

**2. HP-16-036 / 919 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Dani Widell

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Remove non-original chain-link fence and replace with Gothic Picket Fence according to Site Plan submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Birkes inquired about the color, and the applicant responded that the fence would be painted white and added that the fence would be forty-two inches (42") in height. Commissioner Turner inquired whether panels would be installed, and the applicant indicated that panelized construction would not be adopted.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.1.3, G.1.4

**Vote: 919 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

- | <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Shears       |                |                   |                    |
| 2. Craddock     |                |                   |                    |
| 3. Schoell      |                |                   |                    |
| 4. Birkes       |                |                   |                    |
| 5. Grant        |                |                   |                    |
| 6. Neal         |                |                   |                    |
| 7. Pounds       |                |                   |                    |
| 8. Snyder       |                |                   |                    |
| 9. Turner       |                |                   |                    |

3. **HP-16-037 / 1140 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Dani Widell

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Construct Gothic Picket Fence according to Site Plan submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Shears inquired about the width of the gate, which was indicated as eighty inches (80”) on the Site Plan. The applicant responded that the width of the gate corresponded to the width of the sidewalk. Commissioner Craddock inquired whether a single gate was in fact proposed, and the applicant indicated that, although only a single gate had been considered, other proposals would be welcome. Commissioner Neal recommended installation of a pair of gates with a rod to secure the center. Discussion about the role of the property as an investment and the length of the project followed. Commissioner Shears commented on the direction of the swing of the gates proposed in the previous and current applications and indicated a preference for a swing inward toward the entrance. Commissioner Turner inquired about the proximity of the sites, and the staff responded that they were not immediately adjacent.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the solution features two gates. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Neal and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: G.1.3, G.1.4

**Vote: 1140 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

**In Favor**

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Grant
6. Neal
7. Pounds
8. Snyder
9. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

4. **HP-16-038 / 716 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Dani Widell for William Widell

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 21, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct wood porch rail and add metal bar to comply with code

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Craddock presented the report from the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee and noted that discussion had focused on the requirement of the code and that the applicant had cooperated with the subcommittee to seek a satisfactory solution. Commissioner Shears inquired whether the construction of the rail had been required by the Permit Center. The applicant responded that the columns displayed evidence of the previous installation of a rail and that enclosure would be a proactive solution, since the porch was fairly high. Commissioner Shears wondered whether the guidelines would supersede the code in these circumstances and permit construction of the rail without addition of the bars. Staff noted that any new construction would be required to comply with the code.

Discussion about the design of the rail followed. Commissioner Craddock noted that several bars would be needed above the rail since a minimum distance of four inches (4") between them would be required. Commissioner Turner proposed that the review focus only on the design of the wood rail and made a motion for its approval. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the dimensions of the elements of the rail, and the applicant indicated that not every dimension had been noted on the sketch provided by the staff. Several commissioners expressed concern about approval of the application without further details.

Commissioner Turner declined to withdraw his motion to approve the design of the wood porch rail only. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock and was approved by a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5

**Vote: 716 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

| <b><u>In Favor</u></b> | <b><u>Opposed</u></b> | <b><u>Abstaining</u></b> | <b><u>Not Present</u></b> |
|------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Shears              | Schoell               |                          |                           |
| 2. Craddock            | Neal                  |                          |                           |
| 3. Birkes              |                       |                          |                           |
| 4. Grant               |                       |                          |                           |
| 5. Pounds              |                       |                          |                           |
| 6. Snyder              |                       |                          |                           |
| 7. Turner              |                       |                          |                           |

5. **HP-16-033 / 1518 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: The Buckingham Group for Jamie Shilling

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 21, 2016*

Requests:

1. Replace porch siding with Western Red Cedar 18" PERFECTION Shingles
2. Replace screen with wood, double-hung Windsor Windows with eight-light over one-light configuration to match existing windows
3. Replace screen door with 15-light, wood door
4. Construct concrete steps

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's representative was present. Commissioner Craddock presented the report from the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee and noted that the revision with five eight-over-one windows had not been reviewed. Commissioner Pounds inquired whether shingles had been found on all facades, and the representative responded that only two locations had been investigated. Commissioner Pounds observed that shingles were placed on the upper story and siding was placed on the lower story.

Discussion focused on the selection of the windows. Commissioner Neal noted that, although the eight-over-one configuration matches the existing windows, the six-over-one configuration seems more appropriate for the style of this residence. Commissioner Turner inquired about the feature which resembled a water table, and the representative responded that the feature was a fascia board topped by a rolled asphalt roof. Commissioner Turner requested clarification about the scope of the review, and staff indicated that this application addressed only the treatment of the porch.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with conditions that the windows on all of the porch's elevations have a six-over-one configuration and that the screen door be replaced with an original, 15-light wood door salvaged from the residence. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.7, A.3.8, A.4.1, A.4.7

**Vote: 1518 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Grant
6. Neal
7. Pounds
8. Snyder
9. Turner

**6. HP-16-040 / 1703 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Juli Couch-Johnstone

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 21, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct driveway according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Craddock presented the report from the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee and noted that the earlier versions of the proposal failed to satisfy the requirements of the Zoning Code. The applicant commented that the brick for the edge had been salvaged from an historic building. Commissioner Shears inquired about the preparation for the edge, and the applicant responded that a concrete base would be provided.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application, and the motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock. The motion was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: B.2.5, G.2.2, G.2.3

**Vote: 1703 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Grant
6. Neal
7. Pounds
8. Snyder
9. Turner

**7. HP-16-041 / 1536 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicants: Mark and Sherri McMillan

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Replace five second-story windows with aluminum-clad, wood windows which match existing windows

Staff presented the application, and the applicants were not present. Commissioner Neal observed that the variety of windows contributed to the charm of the residence and noted that the damage did not seem severe enough to justify replacement. Commissioner Pounds requested the Window Survey and was informed that it had inadvertently been omitted from the Staff Report. Commissioner Schoell speculated that the infiltration of moisture could be due to failure in the flashing and that other strategies, such as repair of the flashing and siding and installation of storm windows, should be considered before replacement.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny approval of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and was approved by a majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7, A.4.8

**Vote:** 1536 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. **(Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Birkes
5. Neal
6. Pounds
7. Snyder

**Opposed**

Turner

**Abstaining**

Grant

**Not Present**

**C. Reports**

1. Chair Report

- a. Outreach Committee: Commissioner Turner reported that the final event in the Education Series was well attended.

2. Staff Report

Staff Approvals: Historic Preservation Permit 39 (HP-16-039) was issued for the removal of the non-original walkway and bulkheads and the replacement of steps and a walkway at 1008 N. Denver Ave.

**D. New Business**

No New Business was introduced.



E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

No Announcements or Future Agenda Items were presented.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:04 P.M.