



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 26, 2016, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:33 P.M.

Members Present

Shears (Chairman)
Craddock (Vice-Chairman)
Schoell (Secretary)
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

Members Absent

Birkes
Pounds
Reeds
Snyder

Staff Present

Edmiston, Hulse, Porter

Others Present

Keith Dalessandro
Nathan Pickard
Dani Widell
Jesse Widell
Molly Jones
Greg Helms
Katelyn Parker
Brian Adler
Stephen Poleman

2. Approval of Minutes from April 14, 2016
Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.

Vote: Minutes, April 14, 2016

In Favor

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
McKee
Neal
Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Grant

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-021 / 640 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)
Applicant: Jones Design Studio for Nathan and Kristin Pickard
HP Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: March 3/ April 7/ April 19, 2016
Request:
 1. Construct new multi-use building according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application. The applicant was present and provided a sample of rammed earth for inspection by the Commissioners and staff. Commissioner Neal presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the project had been reviewed on three occasions, that the issues had been addressed, and that the recommendation for approval was unanimous.

Staff read the correspondence from the president of the Brady Heights Neighborhood Association which endorsed the application and encouraged its approval. During the discussion, issues about the role of rammed earth as a material were raised. The applicant responded that achievement of certification by the Living Building Challenge required use of material free of toxins and that rammed earth performs well as insulation. Commissioner Turner observed that rammed earth was not present as a material in Brady Heights, expressed concern about compliance with the Unified Design Guidelines, and inquired about the resemblance of rammed earth to stucco, which is present in the district. The applicant responded that the appearance of stucco could be replicated. Commissioner Neal noted that substitution of materials, such as HardiePlank Siding, for other projects had been approved. Commissioner Turner wondered whether other facades with stucco were as smooth as the surface of the sample. Ms. Parker noted that the surface was as smooth as other surfaces

within the district. Commissioner Schoell inquired about repair of the rammed earth. The applicant responded that, although the rammed earth would contain a sealant, new material could be inserted to fill cracks. Commissioner Turner inquired about the treatment of the concrete, and the applicant responded that the surface will be finished. Mechanical equipment, such as the condensers, will be concealed behind a wall.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock.

Vote: 640 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

In Favor

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
McKee
Neal
Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Grant

2. HP-16-015 / 915 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Dani Widell for Amber and Shaun Williams

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Construct driveway in front yard according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application. Commissioner Shears expressed regret that the alley had not been maintained. The applicant noted that the alley was not passable, and Ms. Parker added that many of the alleys in the district have been abandoned. Commissioner Neal observed that many of the driveways seemed more narrow than the proposed driveway. The applicant responded that her driveway is eight feet in width, which cannot accommodate a full-sized truck. Commissioner Neal proposed a compromise on the width and suggested that the driveway be ten feet wide. Other commissioners agreed and suggested that the width be ten feet to the edge of the residence with an increase in width to twelve feet beyond that point.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the width of the driveway be ten feet to the edge of the residence and twelve feet beyond that point. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.

Vote: 915 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

3. HP-16-020/1004 E. 17th Pl. (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Gregory Helms for Brian Adler

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: April 7/ April 19, 2016

Request:

1. Replace original Masonite siding and trim with James Hardie Fiber Cement siding and trim
2. Remove original vinyl window shutters
3. Construct front porch according to plans submitted

Items 1 and 2 were completed without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application. Commissioner Neal expressed appreciation for the applicant's cooperation throughout the reviews by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the surface of the vault would be smooth or would be constructed with tongue-and-groove members. The applicant responded that the vault would be constructed with bead board or panels.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock.

Vote: 1004 E. 17th Pl. (N. Maple Ridge)

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

4. **HP-16-025 /1123 E. 20th St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Keith Dalessandro for Cory and Candice Davis

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 19, 2016

Request:

1. Construct front porch steps according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application. The applicant mentioned that the new brick would match the existing brick as requested by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Discussion of the application addressed the material for the caps and the treatment of the surface of the masonry. Commissioner Schoell noted that, although Missouri Carthage Stone was the material for caps in the district, cast-concrete caps have been approved. The applicant indicated that the cast-concrete caps would match the appearance of stone caps and be painted. Commissioner Craddock expressed reservations about the approval of the application due to its apparent conflict with Guidelines A.6.1 and A.6.2. Several commissioners expressed concern about the application of paint to masonry but concluded that, without paint, the newly constructed stairs would not be visually compatible. The applicant noted that the owners wish to improve the appearance of their residence and the conditions on the steps as they have a young child and added that similar steps have been constructed elsewhere in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner.

Vote: 1123 E. 20th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

In Favor

Schoell
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

Opposed

Craddock

Abstaining

Shears

5. **HP-16-027/1207 E. 21st St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Keith Dalessandro for Lea Wolfe

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: April 19, 2016

Request:

1. Remove door and replace with stone to match existing material
2. Install new French Doors

Staff presented the application. The applicant declined to comment.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock.

Vote: 1207 E. 21st St. (N. Maple Ridge)

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

6. HP-16-028/1755 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Sarah and Stephen Poleman

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Reduce number of windows in approved design

Alteration completed without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application. The applicant indicated that assumptions about dimensions were erroneous, as the contractor discovered the façade would not accommodate the number of windows approved for installation. The applicant directed the contractor to complete the installation with fewer windows to ensure that the residence would be weather-tight and notified the Historic Preservation Officer.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner.

Vote: 1755 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Shears
Craddock
Schoell
Grant
McKee
Neal
Turner

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Chairman Shears read the response from the Drummonds contained in their letter dated April 21, 2016, and expressed his satisfaction with their response. Staff was directed to provide a copy of the correspondence to the commissioners.

2. Staff Report

No staff approvals have been granted since the previous Regular Meeting.

Mr. Edmiston reported that the Supreme Court ruled in favor of the City of Tulsa in the litigation with the owner of the Sinclair Building.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:04 P.M.