



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, April 14, 2016, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:07 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Shears (Chairman)  
Craddock (Vice-Chairman)\*  
Schoell (Secretary)  
Birkes  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

#### **Members Absent**

None

#### **Staff Present**

Edmiston\*, Gates, Hulse, Porter

#### **Others Present**

Lynda Ozan  
Stephanie Ballard  
Catherine Montgomery  
Brad Phelps  
JoAnn Ryan  
Gail Runnels  
Brad Lewis  
Dani Widell  
John Muselmann

\*Late

2. Approval of Minutes from March 22, 2016  
 Commissioner Pounds requested revision of the Minutes to note his attendance at the Regular Meeting on March 22. Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Minutes with the revision. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds.

**Vote:** Minutes, March 22, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present for Vote</u>
Schoell		Shears	Craddock
McKee		Birkes	
Neal			
Pounds			
Reeds			
Snyder			
Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
 Commissioner Pounds indicated his acquaintance with Mr. Williams but noted it will not affect his review. Commissioner Birkes mentioned his projects with Ms. Ryan and added that his review will not be affected.

**B. Actionable Items**

1. **National Register Nomination for the Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oklahoma Building**

Catherine Montgomery, AIA – Preservation and Design Studio, PLLC

Ms. Montgomery, the author of the nomination, presented a summary to the Commissioners. Commissioner Turner inquired whether removal of the sign affected the integrity of the building. Ms. Ozan, the Architectural Historian for the Oklahoma State Historic Preservation Office, responded that the lack of the sign would not affect the integrity, since the criteria focus on the integrity of the architecture. Commissioner Turner noted the modifications of the interior, and Ms. Montgomery responded that, although secondary spaces have been modified, the primary spaces have remained intact.

Commissioner Reeds inquired about proposals for future use of the building. Ms. Runnels responded that the building has been used as a data center and for offices for sales and marketing and that its future role will include offices for the University of Tulsa School of Medicine.

Other discussion addressed the fenestration of the Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oklahoma Building. Commissioner Neal inquired about the alterations of the windows. Ms. Montgomery expressed regret about the removal of the original windows and added that the present single-pane windows retain the rectangular pattern. Commissioner Neal inquired about the windows on the floors

added in the later phase and wondered whether the nomination could reflect changes in the windows. Ms. Montgomery has been unable to determine the date of replacement of the windows and welcomed the suggestion about the entry.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the nomination of the Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oklahoma Building to the National Register of Historic Places. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.

**Vote:** Nomination of the Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oklahoma Building to the National Register of Historic Places

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes

**2. HP-16-018 / 1401 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: John Muselmann

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Remove decorative ornamentation from non-original metal railing

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Several commissioners expressed concern about safety and lack of compliance with the code after removal of the ornamentation. Commissioner Reeds proposed insertion of a horizontal element between the vertical pieces to provide some protection. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the applicant had considered installation of a wood column. The applicant responded that a wood column had been considered but had not been selected, since no decision about the treatment of the entry had been reached, and added that construction of a porch with a gable had been discussed. Commissioner Neal advised restoration of the original porch, rather than addition of a new porch.

Commissioner Reed made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.

**Vote: 1401 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Reeds  
Snyder

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes  
Pounds  
Turner

**3. HP-16-015 / 915 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Dani Widell for Amber and Shaun Williams

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Construct driveway in front yard according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Several commissioners expressed reservations about directions for the radius of the curb requested by the applicant, since the City of Tulsa maintains standards for construction. Commissioner Turner inquired about the location of the property line and expressed concern about the width of the driveway as a precedent for this neighborhood. The applicant responded that the width was determined by the width of the owners' vehicle—a full-sized pickup—and by the owners' desire to reduce contact with the lawn as they transport their children and added that her own driveway was too narrow to accommodate a vehicle of that size. A discrepancy in dimensions between those in the Staff Report and those in the Site Plan was noted by Commissioner Schoell. The applicant indicated the dimensions on the drawing were the current dimensions. Commissioner Neal proposed a driveway with two strips of pavement in the street yard—the only area subject to review—that would lead to an area wide enough to park vehicles. Commissioner Turner again expressed concern about the boundary. The applicant responded that without a survey no determination of the property line was possible.

Discussion about the width of the driveway resumed. The applicant observed that the configuration with two strips was not found in Brady Heights. Commissioner Shears inquired whether the wide driveway on the adjacent property had been approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner inquired about the amount of coverage created by the driveway and recommended review of Section B.2.4. and a survey of driveways in the neighborhood. The applicant offered to have her crew provide measurements immediately, but Commissioner Shears noted that the boundary would still not be established. Commissioners Schoell and Craddock recommended sources of information for the property line.

Commissioner Reeds noted that the issues cannot be addressed without more information, and Commissioner Shears proposed a continuation of the review to permit the applicant to provide enough information to address the issues. The applicant formally requested continuation, and the Commission approved the request with a motion by Commissioner Neal, which was seconded by Commissioner Schoell. The applicant was directed to provide this information—

- a Site Plan with indications of the boundary/property line,
- a calculation of the coverage of surface by the driveway to ensure compliance with Section B.2.4, and
- ten examples of driveways in the Brady Heights Historic District with an indication of dimensions.

**Vote:** 915 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes

**4. HP-16-016 / 916 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Dani Widell for Raynece and Rodney Million

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Install picket fence with gate in front yard according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. The applicant noted that the owners wished to construct a fence identical to the fence on the adjacent property located to the north at 920 North Cheyenne Avenue. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the gate would have a single panel or double panels, inquired about the width of the walkway, and inquired whether a system of panels for the pickets would be used. The applicant responded that only a single panel would be adopted, that the walkway was forty-eight inches (48”) in width, and that the fence would be constructed of wood without any decoration. Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the application, which was seconded by Commissioner Reeds.

**Vote: 916 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes

**5. HP-16-022 / 1231 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: Joyce Polkinghorne

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Replace original wood siding on front façade with HardiePlank Siding with matching exposure

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's husband was present as her representative. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the replacement of the trim around the windows and doors was anticipated. The applicant's representative responded that any damaged materials would be replaced in kind with cedar, the material recommended by the contractor. Other discussion addressed the present condition of the siding, which was confirmed to be warped, and the amount of exposure, which will match the present exposure. Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application, which was seconded by Commissioner Turner.

**Vote: 1231 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)**

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

McKee

**Abstaining**

Birkes

6. **HP-16-023 / 707 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: JoAnn Ryan for Philip Friedl

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Replace non-original door with six-lite, three panel door
2. Install wood vent attic

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the door was original. The applicant replied that the door was not original and that the objective was the restoration of the residence. Towards that objective, staff approval for removal of the asbestos siding had been granted. Commissioner Craddock inquired about the location of the vent. The applicant responded that the vent will be inserted in the dormer. Commissioner Neal commented that the location appears to be covered, and the applicant responded that it has been covered for some length of time. A single vent, rather than two vents, will be installed. Commissioner Neal observed that this style of residence would have had a fifteen-light door but that this proposal was acceptable. The applicant replied that this door was chosen after consideration of security and added a future application will address the placement of lamps.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.

**Vote:** 707 N. Denver Ave. (**Brady Heights**)

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

McKee

**Abstaining**

Birkes

7. **HP-16-011 / 1856 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Brad Lewis

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 3/ April 7, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. The applicant noted that the comments provided during reviews by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee have been addressed: although the base of the column was not raised, the appearance of the porch was adjusted by extension of the deck and separation of materials. Commissioner Neal commented that the applicant had been very responsive to suggestions, proposed

substitution of a more historically appropriate rail, and relayed the subcommittee's recommendation for approval. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the material for the siding and was informed that the siding will be smooth HardiePlank Siding with a four-inch (4") exposure. Discussion about the treatment of surface of the stem wall followed, as several commissioners recommended no treatment of the surface. The applicant accepted this recommendation and commented that the water table had been omitted from the final version of the design. Other discussion addressed the width of the driveway, which should be twelve feet (12'-0") in width between the curb and the porte-cochère and the size of windows in the bedrooms, which should be increased to a width of three feet (3'-0"), if necessary for compliance with the code.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner. Approval was granted with these conditions—

- the driveway should be twelve feet (12'-0") in width between the curb and the entry to the porte-cochère,
- the surface of the stem wall should remain unfinished,
- a historically appropriate rail, such as that recommended by Commissioner Neal, should be installed, and
- the width of the windows could be increased, if necessary for compliance with the code.

**Vote:** 1856 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes

**8. Review and Approval of Proposal for Projects with Funds from the Certified Local Government Program**

Staff presented a proposal for the allocation of the funds, which is nearly identical to the present budget. A major difference is the allocation of funds for software.

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell.



**Vote:** Approval of Proposal for Projects with Funds from the Certified Local Government Program

**In Favor**

Shears  
Craddock  
Schoell  
McKee  
Neal  
Pounds  
Reeds  
Snyder  
Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Birkes

**C. Reports**

**1. Chair Report**

Chairman Shears reported on the recent conversation with Mrs. Drummond. On April 8, Mr. Edmiston, Dr. Porter, and he met Mrs. Drummond at McBirney Mansion and were given a tour of the grounds and residence prior to their discussion of issues raised in a letter from the president of the Riverview Neighborhood Association. At the conclusion of the discussion, she agreed to provide a letter which would offer assurance that any vegetation which would interfere with the terms of the easement would be removed.

During discussion after this report, Chairman Shears commented on the Drummonds' investment and added that their Estate Gardener would be responsible for maintenance of the landscape. Commissioner Neal commented on the size of the Dwarf Magnolias upon their maturity, which would create a screen. Chairman Shears acknowledged that possibility and added that Mrs. Drummond seemed prepared to cooperate with the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

**a) Committee Reports**

Commissioner Craddock reported that the Historic Preservation Committee had reviewed the Unified Design Guidelines and that, after another review, the revisions should be ready for review by the commission. Commissioner Pounds reported that the Rules and Regulations Committee had likewise reviewed the rules and regulations and would conduct another review. Commissioner Turner of the Outreach Committee reported that the first event in the Education Series drew a diverse audience of over forty members.

2. Staff Report

a) Staff Approvals

Four projects have been approved by staff. After a summary of the projects, Mr. Edmiston offered several observations about the conversation with Mrs. Drummond, noting that only the Oklahoma Historical Society and the Tulsa Preservation Commission have the legal standing to engage in legal action, if any enforcement of the easement was necessary. Commissioner Neal wondered about the response from the neighbors. The neighbors have complimented the Drummonds' efforts, according to Mrs. Drummond. Commissioner Craddock commented on the attention to detail and remarked that the Drummonds should be commended for their investment in the restoration of McBirney Mansion. Chairman Shears mentioned that the project for treatment of the ponds will not be pursued immediately.

b) Review of the procedure and public outreach for the adoption of the Unified Design Guidelines

Staff reminded the Commissioners about the forthcoming Special Meeting on April 28. A PowerPoint Presentation will be prepared to assist with the review of the proposed reviews.

c) Announcement – Adoption of the Memorandum of Understanding

A fully executed copy of the Memorandum of Understanding has been received. Mrs. Drummond was provided with a copy during the visit.

D. New Business

*UNDER THE OPEN MEETING ACT, THIS AGENDA ITEM IS AUTHORIZED ONLY FOR MATTERS NOT KNOWN ABOUT OR WHICH COULD NOT HAVE BEEN REASONABLY FORESEEN PRIOR TO THE TIME OF POSTING THE AGENDA OR ANY REVISED AGENDA.*

Commissioner McKee requested information about the withdrawal of the Minor Amendment for the development of Barnard Trace. Dr. Porter relayed a message from Dawn T. Warrick, Director of the Department of Planning and Development, which indicated that Section 30.010-E.3 of the Zoning Code allows required open space to be provided on the lot containing the dwelling unit or units on which computed or in the common areas.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:55 P.M.