



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, February 11, 2016, 11:00 AM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:15 AM.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Chair
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Jim Turner
John Snyder
David Pounds

Members Absent

Charles Sottong
Pam Deatherage
Ted Reeds

Staff Present

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Travis Hulse, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Sharon Coleman, Louis Coleman, Aaron Sprik, Lindsey Perkins, Jason Coffin, Jeff Selco, Jeff Hoos

2. Approval of Minutes from January 26, 2016.

Commissioner Pounds made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes January 26, 2016.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears		Turner	Sottong
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			Deatherage
4. Pounds			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
Commissioner Neal stated the applicants at 1804 South Quaker Avenue are his clients, and he will recuse during their application.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-008 / 1156 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)
Applicant: Jason Coffin for ZYX, LLC.
HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None
Request:
 1. Replace non-original asbestos roof with Landmark Series, architectural shingles submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Jason Coffin, was present. Commissioner Neal stated he believed the roof material is original. Commissioner Shears agreed. The applicant stated the original deck is rotten, and there is water intrusion throughout the house.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Pounds seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.5.6, A.5.7.

Vote: 1156 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Sottong
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			Deatherage
4. Pounds			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			
8. Turner			

2. **HP-16-001 / 2312 E. 17th St.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Aaron Sprik

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 7 / January 19, 2016

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Aaron Sprik, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee report. The applicant stated when he changed the second story plate line and the roof pitch; the second story was pushed back. He stated the wall appeared too high, so added the gable over the front door and still allowed a covered entry.

Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the door is recessed and the wall protrudes around it. The applicant replied the second story wall moved, but the first story did not change. The ridge line was too high, so the second story wall was pushed back and took away the covered porch. The proposed porch will have cedar columns and the same Tudor-style treatment for the gable.

Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the wall could be recessed to make it appear that the house has an addition. Commissioner Neal asked Commissioner Turner if he meant the section after the Breakfast Room windows. Commissioner Turner replied the applicant could do a slight offset around the windows.

Commissioner McKee expressed concern about the expanse of the roof and noted that, in the examples provided, the houses do not have large expanses of roof. Commissioner McKee stated the house could have a detached garage and allow a courtyard. Commissioner Schoell stated in the examples provided, the two-story houses feature attic windows, and it is possible to incorporate a similar feature into the front elevation. Commissioner Neal suggested the applicant could add a dormer or duplicate a dormer on the side. The applicant stated the HP Permit Subcommittee requested a 12/12 roof pitch since the 10/12 appeared too flat. When the roof pitch was changed to a 12/12, it pushed the roofline back, but he is not opposed to adding a gable dormer. Commissioner Schoell stated a revision would address that concern, and he agreed with Commissioner Turner about a recess on the West Elevation.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with conditions the building feature two additional dormers on the front elevation and for the revised design to be reviewed by Preservation Staff and one (1) Preservation Commissioner. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

Vote: 2312 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	McKee		Sottong
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			Deatherage
4. Pounds			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Turner			

3. COA-15-065 / 1740 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicants: Jennifer Lorch and Jeff Selco

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 7 / February 4, 2016

Request:

1. Construct dormer additions according to drawings submitted
Completed without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Jeff Selco, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee report. Commissioner McKee stated she was not sure how the shed dormer will fit. Commissioner Neal replied the applicant is proposing to remove the gable roof. Commissioner Schoell asked if the shed dormer will be applied to both elevations. The applicant replied yes.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with conditions the dormers feature exterior muntins on all new windows and an asphalt roll roof to match the existing roof. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2.1.

Vote: 1740 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Sottong
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			Deatherage
4. Pounds			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			
8. Turner			

4. HP-16-004 / 1804 S. Quaker Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Louis and Sharon Coleman

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 19 / February 4, 2016

Requests:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted
2. Construct courtyard addition according to plans submitted

Commissioner Neal recused himself from the application. Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicants, Louis and Sharon Coleman, were present. Commissioner Turner presented the HP Permit Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3. G.1.3, G.1.5.

Vote: 1804 S. Quaker Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

In Favor

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Pounds
5. McKee
6. Snyder
7. Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Sottong
Reeds
Deatherage

5. Review of the Memorandum of Understanding with Oklahoma Historical Society

Staff presented the draft of the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the Oklahoma Historical Society (OHS) and request approval by the Preservation Commission. After approval by the Preservation Commission, the MOU draft will be relayed to OHS for their review. Commissioner Craddock expressed concern about the termination clause and inquired if a time period could be added. Staff recommended adding "within 30 days of written notification". Commissioner Turner asked Staff if the homeowners have a part in this process. Staff stated the MOU is an understanding between the grantees and the intention of the document is perpetual. If the ownership changes, the MOU would continue. Commissioner Neal asked Staff whether, once the MOU is adopted, the Preservation Commission advises OHS about changes implemented at McBirney Mansion. Staff replied yes. Commissioner Turner asked Staff if a request is denied, what the recourse is. Staff replied the recourse would be an appeal to District Court.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the Memorandum of Understanding between the Oklahoma Historical Society and the City of Tulsa for the review process for projects at McBirney Mansion. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Memorandum of Understanding between the Oklahoma Historical Society and the City of Tulsa

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Sottong
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			Deatherage
4. Pounds			
5. McKee			
6. Snyder			
7. Turner			
8. Neal			

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

Rules and Regulations Committee – Commissioner Pounds stated Staff has contacted them about setting a meeting.

Outreach Committee – Commissioner Turner stated the Outreach Committee is moving forward with the Education Lecture Series.

B. Staff Report

Staff Approval – Staff stated there are no staff approvals since the last regular meeting.

Application Continuances- None

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:26 PM.