



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, January 26, 2016, 4:30 PM**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:31 PM.

#### **Members Present**

Robert Shears, Chair\*\*  
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chair  
David Schoell, Secretary  
Ted Reeds  
Susan McKee  
Tom Neal  
Jim Turner\*

\*Late

\*\*Left Early

#### **Members Absent**

John Snyder  
Pam Deatherage  
Charles Sottong  
David Pounds

#### **Staff Present**

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Travis Hulse, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Rick Maranon, Jordan Ward, Joan Crager, Chip Atkins, Jerry Hall

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from January 14, 2016.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes January 14, 2016.**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Turner
2. Craddock			Snyder
3. Schoell			Pounds
4. McKee			Deatherage
5. Neal			Sottong
6. Reeds			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
None.

**B. Actionable Items**

1. **HP-16-003 /2210 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Jerry Hall

*HP Subcommittee Review Date: January 7 / January 19, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Jerry Hall, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee report.

The applicant apologized for not being able to attend the last Preservation Commission Regular Meeting. Commissioner McKee expressed concern the Commission is not following the guidelines by using the context of the Gillette Historic District and stated the guidelines advises to use characteristics within the same district. Commissioner Shears asked Commissioner McKee if the guidelines state on the same side of the street. Commissioner McKee stated the guidelines advise the same district, and she noted the majority of the district is composed of Bungalows and Tudor-Revival residences. Commissioner McKee read the percentages of the architectural styles listed on the Yorktown National Register Nomination.

Commissioner Craddock asked Commissioner McKee to read the covenants regarding garages. Commissioner McKee stated the covenant mandated the garages be enclosed, and garages can be attached or detached. Commissioner Craddock noted the builders for these lots have to follow the covenants set by the developers; however the Preservation Commission does not have to abide by the covenants. Commissioner Craddock stated the Barnard Trace development is unique to this area. Commissioner McKee disagreed and emphasized the guidelines apply to all the Historic Preservation Overlay Districts. Commissioner Shears stated knew when Barnard Trace applications were submitted, the houses would be larger than houses within the district, and the Commission has to interpret the guidelines for each application. Commissioner Shears asked the

Commission how many houses in the Yorktown Historic District are more than 3,300 square feet. Commissioner Craddock estimated one percent. Commissioner McKee stated she could accept the proportions and size if they houses appeared smaller and draw upon the common characteristics of the Yorktown Historic District. Commissioner McKee stated if economics are a concern then why nothing is presented as part of the application as a reason a smaller house is not economically feasible. Commissioner Neal stated we have public statements regarding the cost of the lots. Commissioner Reeds stated the lot appears smaller because of the large house, but these lots have an alley instead of street. There will not be a garage facing the street which is good compromise, and the houses will not look alike. Commissioner McKee expressed concern the next house will appear like a house in the other districts and should draw on the common characteristics within its own district. Commissioner Turner stated the guidelines advise the common characteristics but not the style of the house, and the Commission may not want a bungalow on every lot. Commissioner Turner stated he could not see why the Commission would not draw upon contributing houses near the development. Yorktown and Gillette Historic District are different districts, but the Commission should consider what is nearby. The Commission also does not regulate square footage or size but lot coverage, scale, and rhythm.

Citizen, Joan Crager at 1620 South Lewis Avenue and is owner of a duplex at 1610-1612 South Lewis Avenue. Ms. Crager stated she lived in Yorktown Historic District for 33 years and could not imagine 4,000 square foot houses in on the proposed lots. Ms. Crager stated she interprets the phrase "same street" in the Unified Design Guidelines as along East 17<sup>th</sup> Street and East 17<sup>th</sup> Place. Ms. Crager stated the common characteristics in the Yorktown Historic District include detached garages and porches.

Citizen, Chip Atkins at 1628 East 17<sup>th</sup> Place and owner of residence at 2212 East 18<sup>th</sup> Street, stated he agrees with Commissioner McKee and disagrees with the economics since the City of Tulsa does not review economic hardship as issue. Mr. Atkins stated the Commission has never ventured outside a district for design characteristics. Commissioner Turner stated the comment was using contributing houses near a potential development. Mr. Atkins expressed concern about using the Gillette Historic District for architectural context.

Commissioner Schoell stated the in the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee report, there was a suggestion for a lower pitch roof. Mr. Hall stated after the preliminary review, he redrew the roof at the request of the first meeting and tried using different roof pitches. After review, Mr. Hall decided the 12/12 roof pitch appeared as the best option. Commissioner Schoell asked if this was an example of the proposed brick. Mr. Hall stated he would use sample brick if he could not find clinker brick. Commissioner Schoell asked Mr. Hall for clarification about clinker brick-imitation. Commissioner Craddock stated if Mr. Hall could not find cost-effective clinker brick then he would use a brick to mimic

clinker brick, but it would not be a veneer. Commissioner Shears asked is the chimney is stucco or brick. Mr. Hall replied stucco. Commission Schoell asked if the areas where there is stucco instead of brick, will there be additional detailing. Mr. Hall stated the whole front is brick, and on the south elevation there was a lot brick, and tried break up the brick with stucco. Commissioner Turner stated he suggested at the HP Permit Subcommittee to use a wainscot to make the house appear to have an addition and break up the brick. Commissioner Shears stated he asked about the stucco chimney, because the rendering shows the chimney as brick. It would be more appropriate as brick. Mr. Hall agreed.

Commissioner Reeds asked Mr. Hall how many lots he bought. Mr. Hall replied he would like them all, but he would not build a bungalow, because he does not like them. Mr. Hall stated the proposed design would fit within neighborhood. Commissioner Reeds asked Mr. Hall about the fence and gate. Mr. Hall stated it will appear like the rendering with a fence on both sides with a gate. Commissioner Neal stated there is a furnace door on the side elevation, and the HP Permit Subcommittee recommended using a solid gate to mitigate its view. Mr. Hall stated there will be solid wooden gate.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with conditions the fireplace feature a brick veneer in lieu of stucco. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

**Vote:** 2210 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	McKee		Snyder
2. Craddock			Sottong
3. Turner			Pounds
4. Neal			Deatherage
5. Reeds			
6. Schoell			

**2. Discussion of the treatment of the landscape at McBirney Mansion**

Staff presented the correspondence from Mr. and Mrs. Drummond to Preservation Staff from November 12, 2015, from Preservation Staff to Mr. and Mrs. Drummond from December 18, 2015, from the Oklahoma State Historic Preservation Office to Mr. and Mrs. Drummond from December 18, 2015, and from the Riverview Neighborhood Association to the Preservation Commission from December 31, 2015.

Commissioner Shears stated he was a resident of the Riverview Neighborhood, currently has an office in the Riverview Neighborhood, and served on the Riverview Neighborhood Association in the past. Commissioner Shears stated in the future he may have to recuse himself; however, he does not see a conflict of interest. Commissioner Shears stated on a previous proposal, there was comment about planting evergreens around the perimeter of the property. Within the name of the easement the intent was to look at the topography and natural feature, and the definitions of topography include the land and natural features. If one looks east and south on the property, the trees are meant as a screen. Commissioner Shears stated he believed the homeowners' insurance company required a fence, but they used a vegetation screen instead. The property was meant to be seen with the open area, and the mansion is meant to be seen.

Commissioner Neal stated a landscape plan was never presented to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. The easement is a stricter document, and it governs the grounds. Commissioner Neal expressed concern about the installation of the landscape features. Commissioner Shears state in the letter to Preservation Staff on November 12, 2014, it clearly states the homeowners were going to add plants, and staff recommended to present a proposal for the landscape features. The Commission and staff discussed interpretation of the easement and its preview over the planting of landscape features.

Commissioner Neal the issue with planting on the McBirney Mansion grounds was commented by a citizen at a previous Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee, and plans were never submitted. Citizen, Chip Atkins, stated as part of the ponds proposal, the homeowners were going to submit a landscape plan. Commissioner Neal stated the HP Permit Subcommittee has not seen any plans. Commissioner Neal expressed concern about the citizens unable to see the river due to the tress, but the Commission may be able to agree to compromise between the homeowners and the neighborhood's concerns. Commissioner Shears recommended a follow-up letter from Staff about the Commission's concern about the plants and request a landscape plan.

Commissioner Craddock asked if the Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Tulsa and the Oklahoma Historical Society has been completed. Staff replied no. The Commission and Staff discuss the content for the letter, and how the Commission will proceed.

Commissioner Neal made a motion for Staff to create a letter to the property owners of McBirney Mansion with a summary of the history of correspondence and communicate the Preservation Commission's interpretation of the Deed of Scenic, Open Space, and Architectural Façade Easement, and invite the homeowners to discuss existing and proposed modifications with conditions all landscape proposals and site improvements are reviewed by the Preservation Commission and discuss the Preservation Commission's interpretation of the

easement and invite the public and homeowners to a discussion. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved by unanimously.

**Vote: Staff Letter to the Homeowners of McBirney Mansion**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Snyder
2. Craddock			Pounds
3. Schoell			Sottong
4. McKee			Deatherage
5. Neal			
6. Reeds			
7. Turner			

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

Annual Retreat – The annual retreat is schedule for February 6, 2016.

Outreach Committee – There will be presentation at the Brady Heights Neighborhood Association on February 20, 2016. The Outreach Committee is proceeding with the Lecture Series.

B. Staff Report

Staff Approval – Staff presented the staff approvals since the last regular meeting.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Vice-Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:03 PM.