



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, January 14, 2016, 11:00 AM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:03 AM.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Chair
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chair*
David Schoell, Secretary
David Pounds
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
John Snyder*
*Late

Members Absent

EX-OF Ted Reeds
EX-OF Pam Deatherage
Charles Sottong
Jim Turner

Staff Present

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Travis Hulse, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Carol Shrout, Richard Dowdell, Charlie Bastyr, Jeff Weaver, Gavin James,
Jennifer Selco

2. Approval of Minutes from December 10, 2015.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes December 10, 2015.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Reeds
2. Craddock			Deatherage
3. Schoell			Turner
4. Pounds			Sottong
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None.

B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-15-62 / 823 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)
Applicant: Jeff Weaver
HP Subcommittee Review Date: January 7, 2016
Request:
 1. Reconstruct character-defining features to front façade according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Jeff Weaver, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.8, A.3.9.

Vote: 823 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Reeds
2. Craddock			Deatherage
3. Schoell			Turner
4. Pounds			Sottong
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			

2. **COA-15-63 / 1921 E. 17th Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Richard Dowdell

HP Subcommittee Review Date: January 7, 2016

Request:

1. Install exterior handrail to non-original bulkheads

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Richard Dowdell, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.2, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

Vote: 1921 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

In Favor

1. Shears
2. Craddock
3. Schoell
4. Pounds
5. McKee
6. Neal
7. Snyder

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Reeds
Deatherage
Turner
Sottong

3. **COA-15-64 / 1531 S. Madison Ave.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Liz and Gavin James

HP Subcommittee Review Date: January 7, 2016

Request:

1. Construct rear addition according to drawings submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Gavin James, and his representative, Charlie Bastyr, were present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee report. Mr. Bastyr stated the applicants wish to change the window material from aluminum-clad exterior, wood interior to wood. Commissioner Shears asked Mr. Bastyr if he considered reusing the existing windows. Mr. Bastyr replied the existing windows are true French windows with no insulation, and they leak.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with conditions the windows are wood in lieu of aluminum-clad exterior, wood-interior windows as stated by the representative, Charlie Bastyr. Commissioner Pounds seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.3, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

Vote: 1531 S. Madison Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Reeds
2. Craddock			Deatherage
3. Schoell			Turner
4. Pounds			Sottong
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			

4. HP-16-003 / 2210 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Jerry Hall

HP Subcommittee Review Date: January 7, 2016

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant's representative, Carol Shrout, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee report. Commissioner Shears asked why the HP Permit Subcommittee did not have a quorum. Staff stated two commissioners must be present to verify a quorum and indicated Commissioners Neal and Turner were present; however, Commissioner Turner had another engagement later that evening and departed after six o'clock.

Commissioner Craddock asked what the size of the house is. Ms. Shrout stated roughly 3,200 square feet. Commissioner Craddock asked Ms. Shrout if the Planned Unit Development (PUD) allowed the house to be built to 4,000 square feet. Ms. Shrout replied yes. Commissioner Craddock stated the house meets the Unified Design Guidelines and it is smaller than the limit. Since this application is the first new construction in Barnard Trace, it will be different than an infill house. Commissioner McKee stated she wished the proposed buildings would have detached garages since attached garages make the house appear larger. Commissioner Neal requested a copy of the PUD from staff. Commissioner Neal and Shears noted the houses would need a larger massing and building footprint due to the economics involved to sell the lots. Commissioner Shears stated even though the house will have a larger footprint, he would like to see more characteristics and features on the house that were taken more other styles within the Yorktown Historic District.

The Commission discussed the size of the proposed new houses and the house along East 17th Street. Commissioner Neal stated on the north side of East 17th Street there is a large English Revival with a large apartment and another Italian Renaissance house in the area. Commissioner McKee stated that East 17th Street has predominantly bungalows. Commissioner Shears stated the Unified

Design Guidelines advises designs to avoid duplication of houses within the district, but it also advises consistency and continuity within the district. Commissioner Shears asked Ms. Shrout what common characteristics this house has with other houses within the Yorktown Historic District. Ms. Shrout stated she was unsure since she was not involved in the preparation of the drawings, but Mr. Hall worked with the architect and the developer to find a design which would conform to the neighborhood. Commissioner Shears stated he would like to see consistency and continuity as stated in the Unified Design Guidelines.

Commissioner Neal stated at the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, Mr. Hall presented an option of stucco for the façade if he could not find clinker brick. Commissioner Schoell stated stucco is present in the neighborhood, and stucco may need more detailing than brick, or the stucco will look out of character for the neighborhood. Commissioner Shears asked Ms. Shrout if it would be true stucco. Ms. Shrout replied yes. Commissioner Shears asked for the applicant to provide a floor plan and section drawings.

Commissioner Pounds asked staff about the procedure for new construction and the subcommittee review since there was not a quorum and a recommendation could not be given. The Commission and staff discussed the procedure for subcommittee review for new construction.

Ms. Shrout asked the Commission what the applicant will need for the next HP Permit Subcommittee meeting. Commissioner Neal suggested having the architect present and exploring the Italian Renaissance style.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue the application to the HP Subcommittee at the next regular meeting and return with HP Subcommittee recommendation to the Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

Vote: 2210 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

In Favor

1. Shears
2. Snyder
3. Schoell
4. Pounds
5. McKee
6. Neal

Opposed

Craddock

Abstaining

Not Present

Reeds
Deatherage
Turner
Sottong

C. Reports

- A. Chair Report

Annual Retreat – Staff stated they are looking at January 23 or 30 as potential dates, and Committee appointments will be made at that time.

Rules and Regulations-- Staff will circulate an e-mail for upcoming Rules and Regulations Committee.

Committee Reports

Outreach Committee – There is a scheduled meeting for January 20 to review the lecture series.

B. Staff Report

Staff Approval – 1132 E. 20th St. was approved to replace the roof of house and garage with in-kind materials. The staff stated most of the work on the roof will be repair with some replacement tiles.

McBirney Mansion – The Oklahoma Historical Society (OHS) Board of Directors asked the City of Tulsa to act on its behalf and to prepare a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to outline a procedure for review. A draft was prepared and submitted to counsel for review. The MOU will be reviewed by the Preservation Commission and the OHS Board of Directors and afterwards will be circulated for internal review.

A letter was sent by the Riverview Neighborhood Association which voiced the neighborhood's concern regarding the landscape features added to the McBirney Mansion grounds. Landscape features including trees, shrubs, and flowers have been planted, and the Riverview Neighborhood Association asked for enforcement of the easement. There are several issues which can be addressed at the next regular meeting.

Sinclair Building – The sale of the Sinclair Building was set for December 2015. During the morning of the sale, the City of Tulsa received the \$274,561.32 which satisfied the City, and the sale was recalled.

D. New Business

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:19 PM.