



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, November 24, 2015, 4:30 PM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Pounds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 PM.

Members Present

David Pounds, Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Jim Turner
Mike Craddock

Members Absent

Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
Charles Sottong
John Snyder
EX-OF Ted Reeds
EX-OF Pam Deatherage

Staff Present

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Janine Van Valkenbergh, Audrey Blank

Others Present

Randy Shelley, Orpha Harnish, Sylvia Brown

2. Approval of Minutes from November 12, 2015.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes November 12, 2015.

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Pounds | | McKee | Shears |
| 2. Schoell | | | Sottong |
| 3. Craddock | | | Snyder |
| 4. Neal | | | |
| 5. Turner | | | |

- 3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Actionable Items

- 1. **COA-15-53 / 1702 S. Rockford Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Tom and Sylvia Brown
COA Subcommittee Review Date: November 17, 2015
Request:
 - 1. Install porch canopy according to drawing submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Sylvia Brown, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. The applicant stated she was open to any questions from the Preservation Commission.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.3, B.5.1.

Vote: 1702 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Pounds | | | Shears |
| 2. Schoell | | | Snyder |
| 3. Craddock | | | Sottong |
| 4. McKee | | | |
| 5. Neal | | | |
| 6. Turner | | | |

2. **COA-15-55 / 1603 S. Newport Ave.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Randall Shelley for Orpha Harnish

COA Subcommittee Review Date: November 17, 2015

Request:

1. Construct sunroom according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Orpha Harnish and her representative, Randall Shelley, were present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report and commented on an error by the COA Subcommittee since the addition will project into the yard more than expected. Mr. Shelley stated, if the addition projected 7 feet, then it will be aligned with houses along the same side of the street, and, if the addition projected 10 feet, it will be aligned with the porches along the same side of the street. Commissioner Pounds asked the Commission if the addition would obstruct the view of the porches and if it will detract from the existing structure and neighborhood. Commissioner Neal replied the Commission will need to find a balance between the desire of the homeowner and the Unified Design Guidelines.

Commissioner Turner stated he was concerned with the addition projecting even though it was set back from the corner and with the arrangement of the windows. Commissioner Neal noted that on the south elevation there are groupings of windows. Commissioner Craddock stated he believed at the COA Subcommittee Meeting the proposal would be revised to have two groups of three windows. Mr. Shelley stated the revision would allow enough light for the plants.

Commissioner Schoell asked Mr. Shelley if the proposed roof will extend from the existing roof. Mr. Shelley replied that it would extend and that the eave overhang could be reduced if needed. Commissioner Neal stated it would be appropriate if the eave overhang matched the existing building.

Commissioner McKee asked Mr. Shelley if he had considered reducing the addition from 10 feet to 8 feet. Mr. Shelley replied 10 feet will allow more usable space, and the applicant intends to landscape along the addition. Commissioner McKee asked Mr. Shelley if the addition will extend to the drop in the landscape. Mr. Shelley replied the addition will be 15 feet away from the drop in the landscape.

Commissioner Schoell stated he was not sure if the applicant has provided enough information. Commissioner Neal suggested a revised drawing. Commissioner Schoell stated he does not foresee an issue with the proposal, but there is not enough information to hold the applicant accountable to the project. Mr. Shelley asked the Commission to clarify whether they wanted two sets of three windows. Commissioner Turner suggested incorporating accent windows typically found in ranch style residences. Commissioner Schoell requested the applicant provide two sections with dimensions of the overhang and elevations. Commissioner Turner requested a rear elevation with window sizes.

After the discussion, the applicant requested the continuation of the review. Commissioner Craddock made a motion to continue the application with this approval from the applicant. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guideline cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, & E.1.4.

Vote: 1603 S. Newport Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Pounds | | | Shears |
| 2. Schoell | | | Snyder |
| 3. Craddock | | | Sottong |
| 4. McKee | | | |
| 5. Neal | | | |
| 6. Turner | | | |

3. “Approved Project” Signs for Staff Approved Projects

Commissioner Schoell stated “Approved Project” signs for staff approvals will allow residents in the district and Commissioners to know if an ongoing project was approved or in violation. Commissioner McKee stated “Approved Project” signs will allow residents to know about the process. Commissioner Turner recommended writing the COA number on the sign.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve requiring “Approved Project” signs for Staff Approved Projects. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was passed unanimously.

Vote: “Approved Project” Signs for Staff Approved Projects

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | <u>Not Present</u> |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Pounds | | | Shears |
| 2. Schoell | | | Snyder |
| 3. Craddock | | | Sottong |
| 4. McKee | | | |
| 5. Neal | | | |
| 6. Turner | | | |

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

Holiday Party – Staff relayed that if the Holiday Party were held in Dresser Mansion, there will be additional expenses. The Commission discussed other possible venues.

Committee Reports

None.

B. Staff Report

Staff stated there are no staff approvals since the last Preservation Commission Meeting, and staff is waiting for confirmation of the reappointment of Commissioner Shears.

Status of application for porte-cochère at McBirney Mansion –

Staff reminded the Commission that the previous report on October 27 mentioned the lack of notification about the projects to the Oklahoma State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) and the absence of any documentation submitted to SHPO. These concerns were relayed to the owners by SHPO in correspondence dated October 26. Within the second week of November, SHPO received the proposal for the flag pole and porte-cochère; however, an earlier version of the proposed porte-cochère was submitted by the contractor. When staff became aware of the discrepancy, they notified SHPO. SHPO contacted the owners via Certified Mail with a letter dated November 9 and expressed concerns about the contractor acting as the owners' representative, the discrepancy in the porte-cochère drawings, and the consistency between the proposal and the terms of the easement. Meanwhile, the letter dated October 26 was returned to SHPO unopened.

Staff and SHPO have also received a proposal for treatment of the ponds from the owners' contractor. SHPO expressed concern about the impact on the landscape. Currently the aforementioned issues have been relayed to Dr. Bob L. Blackburn, the State Historic Preservation Officer for his attention.

Commissioner Schoell asked staff for clarification about approval of the porte-cochère. Staff stated the latest version of the porte-cochère was approved by the COA Subcommittee, but it has not been submitted to the Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner asked staff if the letter was returned due to an error with the address. Staff stated it was only sent by Certified Mail. Commissioner Neal expressed concern about the lack of neighborhood support for these projects and the impact of the landscaping on the property. Commissioner Turner asked staff if there was photographic documentation with the easement. Staff replied the documentation existed but its quality was poor and added that SHPO retained the same documentation. Commissioner Pounds recommended to the Preservation Commission to continue this discussion as an agenda item for the next Preservation Commission Retreat.

D. New Business
None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None.

F. Adjournment
Chairman Pounds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:28 PM.