



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 13, 2015, 11:00 AM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Pounds called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:05 am.

Members Present

David Pounds, Chair*
Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Charles Sottong
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Jim Turner
John Snyder*
*Left Early

Members Absent

Mike Craddock
EX-OF Ted Reeds
EX-OF Pam Deatherage

Staff Present

Jennifer Gates, Bob Edmiston, Kristin Pack, Travis Hulse

Others Present

Katelyn Parker, Cecila Wilkins, Will Wilkins

2. Approval of Minutes from July 28, 2015.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Sottong seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes July 28, 2015.

In Favor

- 1. Shears
- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. Neal
- 5. Snyder
- 6. Sottong
- 7. Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

- Pounds
- McKee

Not Present

- Craddock

- 4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Actionable Items

1. COA-15-34 / 1024 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Will Wilkins

COA Subcommittee Review Date: July 2 / July 21/ August 6, 2015

Request:

- 1. Construct new duplex according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission and the applicant, Will Wilkins, was present at the meeting. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report for July 2 and 21, 2015 meetings. Commissioner Neal thanked the applicant for patience and the neighborhood representatives for making good points regarding the application. Commissioner Neal stated he was still uncomfortable with the design. Commissioner Turner presented the COA Subcommittee report for the August 6, 2015 meeting. Commissioner Turner stated the COA Subcommittee discussed the front and side setback which has not changed, and the applicant is still seeking a variance from the Board of Adjustment [BOA]. The COA Subcommittee discussed the windows and window placement, door, and light fixture. The COA Subcommittee discussed the front porch and possible option of landscaping but the applicant decided to keep the terrace. Commissioner Turner stated he did not know if it was intentional that Brady Heights Historic District allows vinyl windows in new construction but not for window replacement, but the COA Subcommittee had a long discussion about the proposed windows and how they are single pane and muntins are flatter than wood windows. The COA Subcommittee discussed whether the foundation wall should be concrete or brick, and the applicant decided to use brick to grade.

The applicant stated he filed with the Preservation Commission and the BOA at the same time, and he planned to file a change with BOA. The changes included moving the front setback from 11 ft. to 14 ft. to align with the houses along the same street, and move the side setback from 4 ft. 11 in. to 5 ft. The applicant stated the side setbacks within the same neighborhood vary from 5 ft. 4 in. to 7 ft. 7 in. from his measurements and references side setbacks along W. Latimer Ave. The applicant provided a sample of a modular brick and vinyl window for the

Commission to view. The applicant stated he could not bring a king size brick, but the difference between a king and modular brick is 2 in. in length and 3/8 in. in width.

Commissioner Schoell stated the utilities are located on the site plan in the application. The applicant replied it is located on the floor plan, and the utilities will be located in the rear of the house on the north side and will run underground to the pole. Commissioner Schoell asked the applicant to explain his process to match the scale and proportions along the same street. The applicant stated he reviewed the scale after the July 21, 2015 COA Subcommittee meeting, and he changed the roof pitch from 4/12 to 5/12 and raised the floor plate 1 ft. Commissioner Schoell asked the applicant if he considered doing a deeper house to compensate for the width of the house since the house is 5 ft. wider than houses along the same street are 26 ft. to 28 ft. wide. The applicant stated it was a consideration, and he was trying to accommodate a duplex unit.

Commissioner Neal asked the applicant what is the width of his proposal compared to the fourplex across the street. The applicant stated he did not have a measurement, but the difference should not be significant, and the applicant references the two commercial properties on W. Latimer Ave. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated she provided the site plan of Brady Heights given to the Commission. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated the four-plex across the street from the proposed duplex are 35 ft. wide and the porches are enclosed. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated she received concerns from citizens in the neighborhood about the side setback, and she has written a letter to the BOA.

Commissioner Turner stated the front yard setback along N. Denver Ave. look uniform. COA Subcommittee Member Parker agreed. Commissioner Turner stated the side yard setbacks vary within the district. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated the middle block of W. Latimer Ave. is a commercial corridor, and N. Denver Ave. has more uniform side setbacks. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated the foursquare style houses on corner lots emphasize the intersection with a bay window. The applicant stated the side setbacks within the district do not have uniformity, and stated the property on the corner of John Hope Franklin Blvd. and N. Denver Ave. is 5 ft. 6in. from the sidewalk, and the property on the John Hope Franklin Blvd. and N. Cheyenne Ave. is 5 ft. 6 in. from the sidewalk. The applicant stated he does not want to have a bay window. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated the flat, brick wall would feel differently if it had a bay window.

The applicant stated his mother will be the resident, and she does not want a one over one duplex. The applicant stated she does not want to hear music or stomping from the second floor, and they would have to add more insulation. Chairman Pounds stated there is a letter distributed from a neighbor and gave

the Commission a few minutes to read it. Staff stated it is the same letter presented at the August 6, 2015 COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commission Schoell stated he knows the guidelines do not address windows for new construction in the Brady Heights Historic District, but Brady Heights went at length to have historic windows in their guidelines, other districts do not have that specific language in the guidelines, and reinforces the district's sense of community to put a specific request such as historic windows in the guidelines. Commissioner McKee agreed. The applicant stated the windows were discussed at the COA Subcommittee meetings, and many new homes in the district have vinyl windows.

Commissioner Shears stated he recommended at the July 28, 2015 COA Subcommittee meeting a soldier course water table. The applicant stated he choose not incorporate the soldier course water table, because it would detract from the building, and there is only one house on N. Denver Ave. with a soldier course water table. Commissioner Shears stated a water table would add to the side elevation and asked the applicant to discuss the concrete porch. The applicant stated the COA Subcommittee at the August 6, 2015 preferred brick to grade.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

Vote: 1024 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	McKee		Craddock
2. Shears			
3. Schoell			
4. Neal			
5. Snyder			
6. Sottong			
7. Turner			

Staff stated the Board of Adjustment required a report or letter from the Preservation Commission regarding the front and side setback variance. The Commission discussed having Chairman Pounds draft a letter with Preservation Staff to the BOA.

Vote: Chairman Pounds to meet with Preservation Staff to draft a letter to the Board of Adjustment regarding the front and side setbacks of COA-15-34

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Craddock

1. Pounds
2. Shears
3. Schoell
4. Neal
5. Snyder
6. Sottong
7. Turner
8. McKee

2. Window Repair and Replacement Guide & Application

COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated several residents in Brady Heights Historic District ask why they have to use historic materials on existing buildings, but new buildings are allowed to use non-historic materials.

Staff stated after the Commission's comments from the July 28, 2015 meeting, they edited the Window Repair and Replacement Guide draft. Staff added the repair classes as listed in Preservation Brief 9: The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows, edited window types and materials, and edited the window survey form, and removed the signature line on the window survey form. Commissioner Schoell stated he liked the format. Commissioner Turner stated new construction should be added to the Window Repair and Replacement Guide.

Staff stated the current draft reference Section A in the Unified Design Guidelines, and they can draft a section for new construction. Commissioner McKee recommended adding "strongly discourage" to vinyl under the material section. Commissioner Pounds stated the guide will have to say "strongly discourage because..." Commissioner Neal recommended adding pictorial examples of historically appropriate replacements, and post it as a page on the website. The Window Repair and Replacement Guide and Application was continued until the next regular meeting.

3. Historic Preservation Zoning Discussion and the Application Process

Staff presented the process for applicants to submit to Tulsa Preservation Commission and Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission for a Historic Preservation Overlay. Staff stated the applicant would be required to meet the criteria as stated in Title 42 Chapter 10A §1054(B). Staff stated any amendments to the Unified Design Guidelines would be concurrent to the application for Historic Preservation Zoning. Staff stated if the Commission found the applicant met the criteria, staff would prepare a map, and would be required to list those who are or are not in favor of the zoning map amendment.

4. Zoning Code Update Status

Staff presented the changes incorporated and not incorporated into the Zoning Code Update draft as recommended by the Preservation Commission. The Commission stated they would like staff to send a letter to TMAPC, City Council, and the consultant regarding the recommend changes not incorporated into the draft.

Commissioner Neal asked the Commission if there was opposition to changing the demolition ordinance from 60 to 90 days. COA Subcommittee Member Parker stated the change from 60 to 90 days was discussed at public meetings. The commissioners identified 4 edits to include in the letter: Sections 20.010-C2; 70.060-E2; 70.060-E; 70.070-G.

Staff and Commission discussed the proposed parking exemptions for National Register properties, contributors to NR Districts, and HP Overlay Zoning. Commissioner McKee asked if the Zoning Code Update would effect on street parking. Staff stated it would not. The Commission agreed that the proposed exemption was an incentive for historic preservation.

Vote: Staff to address a letter in response to the Zoning Code Update

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Neal			Snyder
4. Sottong			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			

C. Reports

- A. Chair Report
None

Committee Reports

Outreach Committee is meeting on Friday, August 14, 2015.

B. Staff Report

Staff stated there were no staff approvals since the last meeting.

Staff stated there is new staff including Travis Hulse, Planner II, and the new Historic Preservation Planner, Jed Porter, will begin August 24, 2015.

D. New Business

E. Announcement and Further Agenda Items

F. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Vice Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:47 pm.