



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, July 28, 2015, 4:30 PM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Vice Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:34 pm.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
David Schoell
Tom Neal
EX-OF Ted Reeds
Mike Craddock
Charles Sottong
Jim Turner
EX-OF Pam Deatherage*
*Late

Members Absent

David Pounds, Chair
John Snyder
Susan McKee

Staff Present

Jennifer Gates, Bob Edmiston, Kristin Pack, Travis Hulse

Others Present

Lynda Ozan, Douglas Peck, Paul Uttinger, Anita Bryant

2. Approval of Minutes from July 9, 2015.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Sottong seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes July 9, 2015.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Craddock			Snyder
4. Neal			
5. Sottong			
6. Turner			

4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Actionable Items

1. **Review of National Register Nomination, Belmont Apartments**
1314 South Denver Avenue
Paul Uttinger, AIA

Paul Uttinger presented the National Register Nomination for Belmont Apartments by PowerPoint presentation, and the owner of the property, Anita Bryant, was present. A copy of the PowerPoint presentation was retained by Historic Preservation Staff.

Commissioner Shears asked the owner what was preserved during the remodel. The owner stated everything left in the building was preserved including flooring, fireplace mantels, hardware, original windows, doors, and so on. The owner stated she did not know it would qualify for the National Register of Historic Places until they talked to the Oklahoma State Preservation Office. Commissioner Reeds asked the owner if she applied for State and Federal Historic Preservation Tax Credits. She answered yes.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to the property eligible for the National Register. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: National Register Nomination, Belmont Apartments

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Craddock			Snyder
4. Neal			
5. Sottong			
6. Turner			

2. **COA-15-33 / 657 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Douglas Peck

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Construct picket fence in front yard according to site plan submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission and the applicant, Douglas Peck, was present at the meeting.

Commissioner Reeds asked the applicant if the fence posts are still in good condition. The applicant replied no since the posts were not pressure treated, they rotted over time. Commissioner Neal asked the Commission if the guidelines restrict post materials for fences. Staff read the guidelines. The applicant stated the pickets will be spaced 1 in. to 1 ½ in. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the posts are wood. The applicant replied the posts are 4 in. by 4 in. wood posts cemented into the ground.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.1.3, G.1.4.

Vote: 657 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Craddock			Snyder
4. Neal			
5. Sottong			
6. Turner			

3. COA-15-36 / 1748 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Calum Raffle

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Replace non-original door with Craftsman door submitted
Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff presented the application to the Commission and the applicant, Calum Raffle, was absent. Staff stated the applicant recently moved into the Yorktown Historic District and was unaware of the Historic Preservation Zoning requirements, and the applicant's wife designed the door. Staff stated they reached out to the applicant after the door was already installed and explained the Certificate of Appropriateness process with the owner. Staff stated there was miscommunication when he could attend a Preservation Commission regular meeting, and he could attend the regular meeting on August 25, 2015.

Commissioner Neal stated when work is completed with a Certificate of Appropriateness, it pressures the Preservation Commission since the work is already completed and requested more information if the Commission does not approve the request. Commissioner Neal stated the previous door was probably the original but the historic glass was changed to the decorative glass. Commissioner Craddock suggested continuing the application with a request for more information where the previous door is located. The Commission agreed to continue the application until the owner can be present to discuss why the door was changed, and where the previous door is located.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue the application until the owner is present to provide further information. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.8, A.3.4, A.3.5.

Vote: 1748 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Craddock			Snyder
4. Neal			
5. Sottong			
6. Turner			

4. Historic Preservation Applications

Staff presented the Certificate of Appropriateness Application and the Historic Preservation Zoning Application. Staff stated they added the “Staff Use Only” box, the Acknowledgement of Responsibility Section, and merged the former Certificate of Appropriateness Application and New Construction Application.

The Commission suggested minor edits in Acknowledgement of Responsibility Section on both applications. The Commission requested “Planning Department” be changed to “Historic Preservation Staff”. Commissioner Turner and Reeds requested architectural rendering be added as a requirement for new construction. The Commission agreed to add architectural renderings to the submittal list as an option and be strongly encouraged.

Commissioner Turner asked Staff why they would want to require the applicant and the owner to sign. Staff responded the owner is acknowledging the applicant is making decisions for them. Staff stated if the application is approved, staff can correspond with both the owner and applicant. The application will provide owner and applicant addresses, so COAs be sent to both applicant and owner. This will prevent confusion in the future when the owner or applicant applies for a

permit and only one received it. Staff asked if the proposed application is missing anything from previous applications. Commissioner Turner replied no.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness Application and the Historic Preservation Zoning Application. Commissioner Sottong seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Certificate of Appropriateness Application and Historic Preservation Zoning Application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Pounds
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Craddock			Snyder
4. Neal			
5. Sottong			
6. Turner			

5. Window Repair and Replacement Guide & Application

Staff presented the comments for the Window Repair and Replacement Guide and Application from Commissioners since the last regular meeting. Commissioner Turner stated an applicant researching his/her own house to find pictorial evidence would be too difficult for a window replacement and suggested listing it as a resource. Commissioner Schoell stated house research would fall under Section B Repair or Replace Evaluation Steps. Commissioner Turner recommended using a general statement to research for pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Turner noted the Commission has discussed energy audits in the past and stated some of houses have no insulation in the walls and attics or have air infiltration, and he recommended removing energy audits. Commissioner Schoell stated he does not see property owners paying for energy audits and reading the audit. Commissioner Reeds noted window manufacturers sell energy as a reason for window replacement.

Commissioner Turner stated he likes the window survey requirement and the list of online resources. Commissioner Turner stated the Commission needed to address the safety issue as a reason for window replacement.

Staff referred to comment stating applicants know the condition of their windows, and some applicants do not want to restore their windows. Commissioner Turner stated he does not believe the Commission should advocate restoration over replacement. Commissioner Neal disagreed and stated the guidelines indicate restoration. Commissioner Turner stated if an applicant presents an application for

window restoration, the Preservation Commission is limited. Commissioner Neal disagreed and stated replacement is not necessary except for deterioration.

Commissioner Schoell stated he like using the National Park Service [NPS] evaluation process as listed in NPS Preservation Brief 9. Preservation Brief 9 indicates three classes of repairs with maintenance items for each class. Commissioner Neal agreed. Commissioner Schoell recommended under Section B.5(a) renaming the classes to the classification listed in Preservation Brief 9. Commissioner Craddock recommended moving Section B.5(a) at the beginning of the Window Repair and Replacement Guide. Commissioner Turner recommended moving Section B.5(a) to Section B.1.

Staff asked if the Commission had any comments on Section C Replacing and Adding New Windows. Commissioner Turner suggested adding depth of existing windows since some new windows appear flatter than traditional wood windows. Staff presents the remainder of the Window Repair and Replacement Guide. Staff stated they will put another draft together for the next regular meeting.

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

None

Committee Reports

None

B. Staff Report

Staff stated there were no Staff Approvals since the last regular meeting.

Staff stated they need resumes and year of appointment and/or reappointment.

Staff stated need to schedule an Outreach Subcommittee and will contact Commissioner Turner later in the week.

D. New Business

Commissioner Reeds stated the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture is hosting a historic district bus tour this fall.

E. Announcement and Further Agenda Items

Window Replacement Guide, Second Draft

F. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Vice Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:23 pm.