



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 13, 2024, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall at One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Sanders called the regular meeting to order at 11:02 a.m.

Members Present

Mark D. G. Sanders, Chair
Shane Hood, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Peter Grant, GMR, CAPS
Susan McKee, MFA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James E. Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Katelyn Parker, RA, Secretary
Jackie Price Johannsen

Staff Present

Audrey Blank, Rebecca Surber-Cantu, Skylar Marlow-Fuson, Caleb Rocha, Caroline Guerra Wolf

Others Present

Juli Couch, Jayde Dzierba, Robert 'Clay' Holk, Diane Russell

2. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0587-2024 / 1767 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date(s): June 7, 2024

Applicant: Craig & Lindsay Zietlow

Proposals:

1. Replacement of windows
2. Replacement of front door
3. Replacement of French doors
4. Replacement of door hardware

Continued, by request of the applicant.

2. **HP-0589-2024 / 1532 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date(s): June 7, 2024

Applicant: Diane Russell

Proposals:

1. Replacement of windows

Staff presented their report. The applicant, Diane Russell, was present. Commissioner Hood noted that the subcommittee initially understood that only part of the window was being replaced, not the entire window. He expressed that it is difficult to determine if it needs to be replaced entirely or repaired, other than what the applicant has mentioned and pictures they have provided. Commissioner Evans stated that based on the evidence provided by the applicant, they recommended approval.

Diane Russell explained that repairs have been made many times, but the issues continue to arise. She indicated that all the windows are permanently shut, the glass is bowing, and the hardware is missing. She assured the commission that they will replace everything with like-for-like materials. Commissioner Sanders asked how aggressively she pursued the alternative of repairing the windows given that modern wood and material is not the same quality as the original is. Ms. Russell confirmed that they have done extensive research to contract an appropriate company to guarantee the best outcome.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the exterior muntins be a putty profile at (0'-7/8") wide and tall. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1532 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders	McKee		Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

3. **HP-0591-2024 / 1602 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date(s): June 7, 2024

Applicant: Jayde Dzierba

Proposals:

1. Expansion of driveway

Staff presented their report. The applicant, Jayde Dzierba, was present. Commissioner Hood reported that the driveway would be in keeping with the neighborhood. Mr. Dzierba explained that the existing driveway is too narrow to accommodate their vehicle while using their stroller. The Commission did not express any issues with the application.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1602 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

4. **HP-0596-2024 / 1599 Swan Dr. (Swan Lake)**
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date(s): N/A
Applicant: Robert 'Clay' Holk
Proposals:
1. Construction of gazebo in street yard

Staff presented their report. The applicant, Robert 'Clay' Holk, was present. Commissioner Sanders asked if the gazebo was going to be largely inside the fence and Mr. Holk confirmed it would be. Commissioner Ellington asked if the gazebo was going to be on concrete or decking, and Mr. Holk said that it would be on a concrete slab. The commission expressed that they had no issues with the application as presented.

Commissioner Ellington made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1599 Swan Dr. (Swan Lake)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

5. **HP-0585-2024 / 1540 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)**
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date(s): June 7, 2024
Applicant: Juli Couch, LAR Investments
Proposals:
1. Installation of door hardware
2. Installation of mailbox
3. Installation of house numbers
4. Repair of brick mortar
5. Repair and replacement in-kind of damaged windows
6. Replacement of existing windows

- 7. Removal of windows
 - 8. Installation of historical ribbon driveway
- Project initiated without an historic preservation permit*

Staff presented their report. The applicant, Juli Couch, was present. Commissioner Hood reported that the subcommittee moved to approve the installation of new hardware since none of the originals were functional. He stated that they did not have an issue with replacing the mailbox and installing the house numbers, acknowledging that they were not original. He noted repairing the brick mortar was acceptable if it matched the original color and profile. Commissioner Hood expressed that the windows that were repaired and replaced in-kind met the standards of the commission; however, there was no proof the windows needed to be repaired, but they took the applicant's word. He stated that the installation of the historical ribbon driveway was not an issue but there was a concern with unknown property lines between both homes. Commissioner Hood mentioned that the most contentious issue was the removal of windows, with no recommendation from the subcommittee. He stated that the windows have already been removed, with only a photograph to indicate that they were once there.

Commissioner Sanders asked Ms. Couch why the work was completed before receiving approval. Ms. Couch mentioned that she did not know the home was in a historic overlay. Commissioner Sanders asked if the home was her personal home or an investment property, and Ms. Couch said that it is an investment property.

Commissioner Sanders expressed that he was disturbed by the removal of the windows, noting that the alignment of windows on the side of the home is a distinctive historical element of the house. Ms. Couch noted that the windows had been removed and were beyond repair. Commissioner Sanders asked how many windows were removed and Ms. Couch estimated two or three based on an original photo of the house. Commissioner Grant suggested that the request for the removal of windows should go back to the subcommittee to get clarification on how many windows need to be re-installed and where they should go, and Ms. Couch agreed to do so.

Commissioner Turner left the meeting at 12:06 p.m.

Commissioner Sanders suggested that they should vote on each proposal separately.

Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve item 5 as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1540 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)
 Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			

Commissioner Sanders criticized the mailbox and house numbers as not historically appropriate. Ms. Couch offered to change them to whatever the commission wanted, but Commissioner Sanders replied that wasn't the role of the commission to design for the applicant. Commissioner Evans pointed out that adjacent houses have the exact house numbers and mailboxes that the applicant is requesting. Commissioner Grant suggested placing the numbers on the right pier of the home. Commissioner Sanders asked why painting the numbers on the steps was not considered, to which Ms. Couch replied that it is unattractive and historically inaccurate. Commissioner Sanders pointed out that that the proposed numbers are more historically inaccurate.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve items 1-3 with the recommendation that the house numbers be posted on the right brick pier. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1540 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Hood	Sanders		Parker
2. Ellington			Johannsen
3. Evans			Turner
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			

Commissioner McKee asked Ms. Couch how she was going to repair the power-washed brick, since it was now chewed up. Ms. Couch proposed re-pointing with matching mortar to hide the white paint. Commissioner Sanders noted that the remaining problem is the face of the bricks and asked how she was going to resolve that issue. Ms. Couch mentioned that they have rubbed a small amount of the mortar onto the brick as a test sample and it matches exactly with the brick.

Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve item 4 with the condition that the mortar color would match the mortar color on the south side. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1540 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			

Commissioner Grant left the meeting at 12:29 p.m.

Regarding item 8, Commissioner Evans explained that the only thing that will be installed is the ribbons for the driveway where the cars would be. Commissioner Ellington seconded with what Commissioner Evans stated.

Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve item 8 as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1540 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Hood			Johannsen
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			Grant
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			

Commissioner Hood pointed out which windows were replaced. Commissioner Sanders asked if there were any original pictures of the windows or if the applicant knew what they looked like. Ms. Couch stated that she had no pictures, saying that most of the windows were either broken or boarded up. The commission and the applicant continued trying to determine where the windows were located on the north side of the house. Commissioner Townsend voiced that she does not believe that there is enough information to proceed or give relief on something that cannot be properly identified by the pictures or the applicant. Commissioner Sanders said that he was unsure which windows were visible from the street and which were not. Ms. Couch offered to take better pictures. Commissioner Evans recommended the applicant return to the subcommittee to discuss the replacement and removal of windows on the north and south sides of the house. Ms. Couch agreed to return to the subcommittee to bring clarity to the matter.

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on staff-approved HP permits:

a. **1715 S. Madison Ave. (HP-0592-2024)**

Repair and replacement in-kind of damaged/rotting wood on fascia, trim, eaves, and porch balusters

b. **1851 E. 16th Pl. (HP-0597-2024)**

Repair and replacement in-kind of damaged soffit, fascia and beam

Commissioner Townsend left the meeting at 12:49 p.m.

2. Chair Report

None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:49 p.m. due to the lack of quorum.