



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 14, 2023, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall at One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the regular meeting to order at 11:02 a.m.

Members Present

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Peter Grant, GMR, CAPS
Shane Hood
Jackie Price Johannsen

Members Absent

Susan McKee, MFA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James E. Turner, AIA

Staff Present

Caroline Guerra Wolf, Caleb Rocha, Skylar Marlow-Fuson, Rebecca Surber-Cantu,
Felicity Good

Others Present

Jeff Bier, Mike Schulz, Mike Murnan

2. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0512-2023 / 1607 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 21, 2023

Applicant: Ashley Yancey

Proposals:

1. Substitution of clipped eaves for extended eaves on dormers
2. Construction of rail on porch
3. Installation of door
4. Installation of light fixtures

Alteration of Approved Proposal, Related to HP-0119-2019 approved by Tulsa Preservation Commission on September 12, 2019, and HP-0300-2021 approved by Tulsa Preservation Commission on August 12, 2021

Staff presented its report. The owner, Michael Murnan, was present to represent the application. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee had mainly been concerned with the dormers. Commissioner Sanders stated that the proposed door, as revised, seemed to fit the subcommittee's recommendation. In response to a question from Commissioner Parker, Rebecca Surber Cantu clarified that the subcommittee had recommended approval of the dormers as presented. Felicity Good provided background information about the previous HP Permit applications on the property, noting that a design and construction company had handled the previous applications on behalf of the owner but were no longer involved in the project, so the owner was now trying to find a way to move forward.

Commissioner Grant stated that an overhang on the eaves would not be difficult to achieve and asked about the appropriateness of the clipped eaves. Commissioner Parker replied that the eaves should be extended and asked if that would require the roof of the dormers to be reconstructed. Commissioner Grant confirmed that the change would probably require replacement of the rafters in the dormers, and Commissioners Ellington and Evans agreed. Commissioner Grant guessed that the eaves on the main roof structure probably had an overhang between eighteen inches (1'-6") and twenty-four inches (2'-0"), and noted that going from that to no overhang on the dormer eaves was extreme. Commissioner Parker stated that it made the house appear Colonial rather than Craftsman in style. Ms. Good noted that the dormers as constructed were closer together than they were shown in the previous drawings. Commissioner Grant stated that it appeared the slope of the dormer roofs was also different.

Commissioner Sanders stated that the relatively large size of the windows in the dormers compelled the need for extended eaves to achieve balance. Commissioner Grant suggested the addition of a bargeboard and an eave overhang of approximately six inches (0'-6") on the front and sides of each dormer. Commissioner Parker asked if the dormer windows were functional, and Mr. Murnan confirmed that they served the living room at the front of the house. Commissioner Ellington stated that an overhang matching that of the neighbor's house would be ideal, but the placement of the dormers did not allow room for the eaves to be increased to that extent.

Commissioner Parker felt the clipped eaves on the dormers were not appropriate for the Craftsman style of the house, accepted the proposed door and lights, and stated that the spacing of the balusters on the porch rail may not meet building code requirements. Commissioner Evans stated that the floor of the porch was low enough that a rail would not be required. Commissioner Parker asked how tall the rail was, but Mr. Murnan did not know. Commissioners Parker and Grant estimated it was between twenty-four inches (2'-0") and thirty inches (2'-6") tall.

Commissioner Sanders wondered if it would be possible to change only the front trim board, but Commissioner Evans stated the commissioners had expressed a desire for a six-inch (0'-6") eave overhang on all sides of the dormers. Commissioner Parker stated that it was possible but felt it would look strange from the side. Commissioner Grant explained that the ridge board at the peak of each dormer held the structure together and would need to be extended for structural integrity of a bargeboard.

Commissioner Parker asked if any commissioners were willing to accept the dormers as constructed with clipped eaves. Ms. Good noted that Commissioner Turner had been present at the subcommittee review and had made the motion to recommend

approval of the dormers, but he was not present to comment. Commissioner Hood stated that the clipped eaves on the dormers stood out, and their extension had already been a condition of approval of the previous applications. Commissioner Hood wondered why they had not been built correctly in the first place. Commissioner Parker noted the originally approved drawing lacked detail but stated that the dormers as constructed were not architecturally correct. Commissioner Grant agreed that the dormers appeared odd on a small cottage-type house and emphasized that it had been critical to construct them correctly. Commissioner Sanders stated that the house would look a lot better with the small change of extending the dormer eaves. Commissioner Hood stated that this was an issue because there was not enough detail in the original drawings and expressed a need for revised drawings showing dimensions of the dormer eaves.

Commissioner Parker suggested approving Proposals 2, 3, and 4 and referring Proposal 1 to the HP Permit Subcommittee with a request for details on fixing the dormers. Commissioner Parker asked the owner who he was working with on the project, and Mr. Murnan replied that he was not working with anyone because the project had been completed already. Commissioner Parker stated that it was not within the purview of the commission to design the project, but Mr. Murnan replied that is what it seemed like the commission was doing.

Commissioner Evans suggested giving guidance on the minimum extension of the eaves that would be necessary for approval, but Commissioner Parker stated that the exact dimension could be discussed once revised drawings were submitted. Commissioner Grant suggested consulting a carpenter, who would develop the design and submit the revised drawings. Mr. Murnan asked what length the eaves should be, and Commissioner Parker replied that they should be proportional to the dormers. Mr. Murnan suggested that lengthening the eaves too much would cause them to touch, and Commissioner Parker stated that they should not touch. Commissioners Sanders and Grant estimated that eaves between six inches (0'-6") and one foot (1'-0") would be a good starting point. Commissioner Parker emphasized that a carpenter or architect should measure the existing conditions and create a drawing showing the dormers as constructed with extended eaves represented. Commissioner Sanders stated the drawings do not have to be professional but need specific details. Commissioner Grant added that a detail of the depth of the front gable overhangs would also be necessary.

Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve Proposal 2: Construction of rail on porch, Proposal 3: Installation of door, and Proposal 4: Installation of light fixtures. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously. The applicant agreed to extend the period of review for Proposal 1: Substitution of clipped eaves for extended eaves on dormers and to return to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee with revised drawings.

Vote: 1607 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

Motion to approve Proposal 2: Construction of rail on porch, Proposal 3: Installation of door, and Proposal 4: Installation of light fixtures

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Hood			
7. Johannsen			

2. **HP-0518-2023 / 1623 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 7, 2023

Applicant: Michael Schulz

Proposal:

1. Removal and installation of light fixtures

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Michael Schulz, was present but had no additional comments. Commissioner Sanders reported that the HP Permit Subcommittee had complemented the applicant on the reuse of the front light fixture. Commissioner Sanders stated that the pendant light looked fine over the front entry, but the proposed light fixtures on either side of the front door were tasteful and historically appropriate in style. Commissioner Sanders reported that the subcommittee had understood the need for security lights, as the owner had experienced a recent break-in. Commissioner Sanders added that the proposed security lights were a sensitive treatment because they would not be placed on the front of the house and would barely be visible once painted to match the trim they would be installed on. Commissioner Parker appreciated the mockup provided by the applicant.

Commissioner Ellington made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans. Commissioner Hood expressed concern about removing the light fixture at the front of the house if it were original. Mr. Schulz stated that it was not original to the house. Commissioner Ellington pointed out that the light fixture had not been present in the photo of the house from 2000.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker called for the vote. The motion passed unanimously.

Vote: 1623 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Hood			
7. Johannsen			

3. **HP-0523-2023 / 1539 S. Gillette Ave. (Gillette)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: November 21, 2023;
December 7, 2023*

Applicant: Jeff Bier, Creative Home Designs

Proposal:

1. Construction of residence

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Jeff Bier, stated that the builder had built several houses in the Barnard Trace development in Yorktown. Mr. Bier stated that he had added brick sills and shake siding as details since the last subcommittee meeting. Commissioner Sanders reported that the HP Permit Subcommittee had reviewed the application twice and that the applicant had made dramatic improvements to the proposal each time. Commissioner Sanders stated that at the last subcommittee review the application lacked detail, including elevations and specifications on the windows, but they had honored the applicant's request to move the application along by forwarding it to the preservation commission with no recommendation.

Commissioner Parker stated that the three windows on the left side of the front elevation should be mulled with wood trim rather than brick. Mr. Bier agreed and stated he would change that detail. Commissioner Parker asked about the sills on the windows, and Mr. Bier pointed out the presence of a brick sill. Commissioner Parker asked about the mechanical equipment, and Mr. Bier replied that it would not be visible from the street. Commissioner Parker stated that the front setback should be aligned with adjacent houses and stated that the twenty-seven-foot (27'-0") overall height of the proposed structure seemed to be acceptable. Mr. Bier noted that the tallest ridge line would be set back from the front of the house.

Commissioner Sanders stated that the house to the south was not historic, so the front setback should align with the historic house to the north. The builder, Luke Summers, stated that they intended to retain the large oak tree in the front yard, so it would at least be set back enough to avoid that. Commissioner Parker advised that the zoning code allowed for contextual setbacks.

Commissioner Grant wondered about the selection of vinyl windows. Commissioner Parker stated that the proposed windows were present on several homes in Barnard Trace and had a better profile and shadow lines than typical vinyl windows and would have external muntins. Commissioner Grant asked if the windows on the front façade would be fixed, and Mr. Summers confirmed they were. Commissioner Evans stated that most houses on the street appeared to be approximately twenty-five feet (25'-0") from the sidewalk, so the proposed setback should align with them. Commissioner Grant stated that the proposed design was attractive and fit perfectly in Gillette. Commissioner Parker complimented the applicant on the style of the house.

Commissioner Grant exited the meeting at 11:49 a.m. and reentered the meeting at 11:51 a.m.

Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that trim, not brick, be present between the three (3) windows on the left side of the front elevation and that the front setback of the house be in line with the historic house to the north (1535 South Gillette Avenue). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1539 S. Gillette Ave. (Gillette)
Motion to approve application with conditions

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Hood			
7. Johannsen			

4. **HP-0526-2023 / 1169 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights/The Heights)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: N/A

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas

Proposal:

1. Relocation of meter

Staff presented its report. The applicant's representative, Karla Ricard, was not present. Commissioner Ellington stated there did not seem to be a better location for the gas meter. Commissioner Sanders hoped vegetation would be planted to obscure the meter.

Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1169 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights/The Heights)

Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Hood		McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Johannsen			

5. **HP-0525-2023 / 769 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights/The Heights)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 7, 2023

Applicant: Chandra Valkyrie

Proposal:

1. Replacement of light fixture on porch

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Chandra Valkyrie, was not present. Commissioner Sanders reported that the HP Permit Subcommittee had found that the applicant was replacing a bad light fixture with a good one.

Commissioner Hood made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans and passed unanimously.

Vote: 769 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights/The Heights)
Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Hood			
7. Johannsen			

6. Nomination and election of officers for the 2024 calendar year

Commissioner Johannsen exited the meeting at 11:57 a.m. and reentered the meeting at 12:00 p.m.

On behalf of the Nominating Committee, Commissioner Parker announced the slate of officer candidates for the 2024 calendar year. Commissioner Sanders had accepted a nomination as Chair, Commissioner Hood as Vice-Chair, and Commissioner Parker as Secretary. Commissioner Parker then invited additional nominations from the floor.

As no other nominations were presented, Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the nominations presented by the Nominating Committee and elect officers for the 2024 calendar year. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Vote: Nomination and election of officers for the 2024 calendar year

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			McKee
2. Sanders			Townsend
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Hood			
7. Johannsen			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported that the proposed amendments to the Tulsa Zoning Code and Unified Design Guidelines for Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Structures would be reviewed by City Council on December 20, 2023. Staff reported that the City Council initiated an Historic Preservation Zoning Map Amendment to add Tracy Park to the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay District on December 13, 2023.

Staff requested that commissioners share their availability for potential dates for the Annual Retreat, which would be in January or February.

Staff reported that Felicity Good had attended the PastForward Conference, hosted by the National Trust for Historic Preservation, on November 8 through November 10, 2023, in Washington, D. C.

Staff reported that a contract would soon be completed with a consultant to continue surveying the Maple Ridge Historic Residential District.

Staff reported that additional Certified Local Government funds may be available for additional activities since the survey came under budget, and suggested hosting a Commission Assistance and Mentoring Program training offered by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions.

In response to a question from Commissioner Parker, staff stated that a window workshop would be planned in the spring.

Staff reported that the Annual Retreat would be held after the beginning of the year and asked commissioners to email discussion requests if they had any.

2. Chair Report

Commissioner Parker stated that she enjoyed serving as Chair and reflected on the commission's accomplishments in 2023.

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Parker adjourned the regular meeting at 12:09 p.m.