



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, October 12, 2023, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall at One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the regular meeting to order at 11:01 a.m.

Members Present

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Peter Grant, GMR, CAPS
Shane Hood
Jackie Price Johannsen
Susan McKee, MFA
James E. Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

Staff Present

Audrey Blank, Caroline Guerra Wolf, Skylar Marlow-Fuson, Rebecca Surber-Cantu,
Felicity Good

Others Present

Bill Powers, Julie Craig, Blas Gaytan, Michael Schulz, Mitch Myers, Randie Lewis

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 10, 2023

Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on August 10, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hood and passed unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 10, 2023

In Favor

1. Parker
2. Evans
3. Grant
4. Hood
5. Johannsen
6. McKee
7. Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Sanders
Ellington
Townsend

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Parker disclosed a conflict of interest for the project at 1709 South Trenton Avenue and announced she would recuse herself from discussion and action on that application.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0458-2023 / 1709 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: June 20, 2023; October 5, 2023

Applicant: Myers Property Investments, LLC

Proposals:

- 1. Replacement and relocation of windows
- 2. Replacement of French doors with windows on west side of residence
- 3. Replacement of door on west side of residence
- 4. Repair and replacement of siding and trim

Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Commissioner Parker exited the meeting during the discussion and voting on this item. Commissioner Grant acted as Chair in her absence.

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. The applicant, Mitch Myers, was present but had no additional comments. Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee felt that the changes to the front of the house and the relocation of windows were generally acceptable but had asked the applicant to change the windows on the north side of the residence to single-hung windows, which were an improvement over the previously installed fixed windows. Commissioner Turner reported that the subcommittee had asked the applicant to add trim at the corners and to look for signs of a water table. He also noted that the house may not have had a water table, but a future discovery item might be to install one.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application as revised. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1709 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

Motion to approve application

In Favor

- 1. Evans
- 2. Grant
- 3. Hood
- 4. Johannsen
- 5. McKee
- 6. Turner

*Recused

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

- Parker*
- Sanders
- Ellington
- Townsend

Commissioner Parker re-entered the meeting.

2. **HP-0500-2023 / 1539 S. Detroit Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 5, 2023
 Applicant: Bill Powers
 Proposal:
 1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report. Commissioner Turner reported that the addition would be minimally visible from the street, so the HP Permit Subcommittee did not have much discussion about the design. Commissioner Turner reported that he had suggested that the applicant not cut off the eave on the west side. Commissioner Parker noted that was one of the only areas that might be seen from the street. The applicant, Bill Powers, was present and explained that he considered the adjustment of the eave to a hip on the west side but it would present an anomaly in which there was a wedge of siding inconsistent with other areas of the house. Mr. Powers stated that, as proposed, the eave matches the roof of the porch.

Commissioner Hood asked if the columns on the side porch had been replaced, and Mr. Powers responded that they were rebuilt approximately five (5) years ago. Mr. Powers stated that several features had been added over time and the owners had wished to return the house to its original architectural style. Commissioner Hood asked for clarification about the hip of the roof toward the back of the house, and Mr. Powers replied that the intent was to blend in with the existing porch cover on the north side.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant, and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1539 S. Detroit Ave. (North Maple Ridge)
 Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Sanders
2. Evans			Ellington
3. Grant			Townsend
4. Hood			
5. Johannsen			
6. McKee			
7. Turner			

3. **HP-0501-2023 / 1859 E. 17th St.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 5, 2023
 Applicant: Randie Lewis
 Proposals:
 1. Replacement of trim around windows and door
 2. Replacement of siding
 3. Removal of shutters
Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Randie Lewis, was present. Commissioner Turner reported that the HP Permit Subcommittee had discussed that textured rather than smooth Hardie trim boards had been used, which was not preferable. Commissioner Turner reported that the subcommittee had also discussed that the top

trim had already been cut so that it would not overhang the trim on the sides of the windows and doors and that the trim on the sides would be flush with the sills. Commissioner Parker asked if the sills would be extended, and Ms. Lewis answered affirmatively. Ms. Lewis stated that the house across the street also had the same textured trim. Commissioner Parker said the trim boards could be turned around because they are smooth on the back side. Commissioner Grant stated that the neighbor probably did not have a permit for their trim because the material would not be historically accurate for the home. Ms. Lewis stated that she had to use cedar for the drip edge along the headers and that the rough trim was selected to match that. Ms. Lewis stated that the texture would smooth out some once painted, so the textured trim would look better visually from the street. Commissioner Grant stated the carpenter could make the drip edge out of dimensional cedar and that the original trim on the house would have been smooth.

Commissioner Parker asked why the new trim was wider than the original sills, and Ms. Lewis replied that the wider trim looked better once the shutters had been removed. Commissioner McKee expressed concern about the construction of the drip edge, but Commissioner Parker stated that the appearance of the trim was more important than the construction technique and felt that putting the drip edge on top of the header trim may look too wide. Commissioners then discussed its construction, and Ms. Lewis clarified that the drip edge would wrap around the top trim and would be made to look like the original trim on the door. Commissioner Parker noted that metal flashing would be necessary, and Ms. Lewis stated that flashing was present and would be retained.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Johannsen and passed unanimously. Commissioner Hood stated that he was happy to see the removal of shutters that did not fit the windows.

Vote: 1859 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)
 Motion to approve application

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Sanders
2. Evans			Ellington
3. Grant			Townsend
4. Hood			
5. Johannsen			
6. McKee			
7. Turner			

4. **HP-0505-2023 / 1624 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)**
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: N/A
 Applicant: Blas Gaytan
 Proposals:
 1. Replacement of steps and walkway
 2. Replacement of driveway
 3. Application of paint to unpainted masonry
Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Blas Gaytan, was present and stated that he had not known that the previous owner had not applied for the replacement of the

driveway and the steps and added that they were in bad shape. In reference to the paint, Mr. Gaytan said he did not know he needed an application, but on Troost Avenue most houses have painted masonry, and the masonry on the columns on his residence were extremely damaged. Mr. Gaytan said that removing the paint would be difficult and cause further damage to the columns and retaining wall. Commissioner Parker stated that the process of removing paint from masonry is the reason why the preservation commission has guidelines that prohibit applying paint to unpainted masonry; it cannot be easily undone.

Commissioner Parker then asked for information about previously approved columns. Mr. Gaytan stated that the columns were still in progress, but Commissioner Parker stated that the rebuilt columns on the house were out of proportion. Commissioner Parker also mentioned that a visible beam on the porch should have been reproduced. Mr. Gaytan said he was open to any suggestions about the columns. Commissioner Grant stated that the columns should have a slighter taper. Audrey Blank stated that the columns and beam were not on the agenda for consideration.

Commissioner Hood stated that the application was presented piecemeal and should be discussed by the HP Permit Subcommittee because there are items not on the agenda that needed to be discussed. In response to a request for clarification from Commissioner Grant, Commissioner Parker stated the subcommittee had already worked through issues with the application. Ms. Good stated that a previously approved application addressed the reconstruction of the porch, and there were some items, such as the columns, that need to be fixed to match what was approved by the preservation commission. Ms. Good clarified that the three (3) items on the current agenda were new and had not been addressed in a previous application. Commissioner Turner asked staff to work with the applicant to correct those items that were incorrectly built.

Commissioner Grant asked about the dimensions of the steps and the walkway, and Mr. Gaytan stated that the size of the steps had not changed. Commissioner Evans observed that the bulkheads had been removed. Commissioner Grant asked about the driveway, and Mr. Gaytan stated it was slightly smaller than it previously was. Commissioners Turner asked if the apron of the driveway would be replaced, and Mr. Gaytan replied that it would be replaced in the same size.

Commissioner Grant stated he was supportive of the first two (2) proposals in the application. Commissioners then considered the third proposal. Commissioner Turner noted that the stem wall, piers, and retaining walls were all varied materials, and the paint did visually tie things together, although he did not think the guidelines should allow for the application of paint to masonry. Commissioner Parker stated that limewash would have been a better option than latex paint. Commissioner McKee suggested denying Proposal 3: Application of paint to masonry.

Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve Proposal 1: Replacement of steps and walkway and Proposal 2: Replacement of driveway, and to deny Proposal 3: Application of paint to unpainted masonry, citing Guideline A.2.5. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1624 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

Motion to approve Proposal 1: Replacement of steps and walkway and Proposal 2: Replacement of driveway, and deny Proposal 3: Application of paint to unpainted masonry

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Hood		Sanders
2. Evans	McKee		Ellington
3. Grant			Townsend
4. Johannsen			
5. Turner			

5. **HP-0502-2023 / 1571 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: N/A

Applicant: MERH, LLC

Proposal:

1. Replacement of windows

Application to amend HP-0466-2023 denied by Tulsa Preservation Commission on June 27, 2023

Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Staff presented its report. The applicant's representative, Markus Engelke, was not present. Commissioner Parker stated that she believed the window manufacturer would have options for wider mullions. Commissioner Hood asked if they had previously discussed the additional trim on the windows, noting the absence of brickmould. Ms. Good stated that the mullions had been the main topic previously discussed. Commissioner Grant observed it was difficult to tell the dimensions of the previous brickmould. Commissioner Parker mentioned egress requirements may also pose a challenge. Commissioner Parker asked about the size of the windows, and Ms. Good stated that the size of window presented by the applicant would fit all the windows except for three (3) bay windows on the front façade. Ms. Good read aloud the applicant's description of the mullions, and Commissioner Parker stated that the visible portion of the mullion would appear much smaller than the dimensions labeled on the manufacturer's drawings.

Commissioner Hood stated that the guidelines are clear; applicants need to restore windows based on historic photographic evidence of the house. He stated that the preservation commission was not given enough information and the applicant did not show up again, and suggested denying the application. Commissioner Parker suggested sending the application back to the HP Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Grant said that the applicant was missing the original framing and agreed with Commissioner Hood. The preservation commission decided to refer the application to the subcommittee for further consideration and directed staff to request that the applicant be present at that review, investigate non-standard mullion options, and propose an attached brickmould trim.

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on staff-approved HP permits:

a. **1132 E. 20th St. (HP-0479-2023)**

Repair and replacement in-kind of original porch floor

- b. **1716 S. Norfolk Ave. (HP-0506-2023)**
Replacement in-kind of driveway

Staff announced that Dr. Matthew Pearce, National Register Coordinator for the State Historic Preservation Office, would offer a National Register of Historic Places training following the November 9, 2023, preservation commission meeting.

- 2. Chair Report
None

- D. New Business
None

- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

- F. Public Comment
None

- G. Adjournment
Commissioner Parker adjourned the regular meeting at 12:05 p.m.