



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, September 26, 2023, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall at One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10<sup>th</sup> Floor, South Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the regular meeting to order at 4:32 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair  
Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair  
Royce Ellington, Secretary  
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA  
Peter Grant, GMR, CAPS\*  
Jackie Price Johannsen  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

#### **Members Absent**

Shane Hood  
Susan McKee, MFA  
James E. Turner, AIA

#### **Staff Present**

Audrey Blank, Caroline Guerra Wolf, Caleb Rocha, Skylar Marlow-Fuson, Rebecca Surber-Cantu, Felicity Good, Gary Schellhorn, Stacie Martin

#### **Others Present**

Chip Atkins, Mark Galbraith, Shelley Almeida, Ryan Bary

\*Late arrival

#### 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 10, 2023

Commissioner Ellington made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on August 10, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker but failed due to a lack of majority. The item was continued to the next regular meeting of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

#### **Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, August 10, 2023**

#### **In Favor**

1. Parker
2. Ellington
3. Townsend

#### **Opposed**

#### **Abstaining**

- Evans  
Johannsen  
Sanders

#### **Not Present**

- Grant  
Hood  
McKee  
Turner

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Evans disclosed a conflict of interest in the application at 1323 East 21<sup>st</sup> Street and announced that he would recuse himself during discussion and action on that item.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0495-2023 / 1619 S. Trenton Ave.** (Swan Lake)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 7, 2023; August 19, 2023*

Applicant: Shelly Almeida

Proposals:

1. Reconstruction of porch on west side of residence
2. Repair and alteration of roofline
3. Repair and alteration of chimney on north side of residence
4. Installation of decorative trusses in gables
5. Replacement of windows
6. Replacement of door on west side of residence
7. Replacement of light fixtures on porch
8. Construction of addition on east side of residence

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. The applicant, Shelley Almeida, was present and had no additional comments. Commissioner Sanders stated that the proposal had changed three (3) or four (4) times and that the version presented at the current meeting was different from what was recommended for approval by the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Sanders summarized the changes made to the previous version. Felicity Good added that the new masonry on the porch and chimney would match the existing masonry, which was currently painted, and the porch floor would be concrete.

Commissioner Townsend asked if any muntins were present in the windows, and Ms. Good clarified that they were not. Commissioner Sanders stated that the subcommittee had felt that, even though the existing windows were vinyl, they had depth, and they were comfortable approving the windows as existing features, which had been installed by a previous owner.

Commissioner Grant asked about the location of the front door and porch lights, and staff stated that the proposal was for the front door to be off-center and for a light fixture to be installed on either side of the door. Commissioner Parker wondered if there would not be enough space for a light fixture to the right of the door since side lites would be included on either side of the door. Commissioner Grant suggested the installation of only one light to reflect the asymmetrical placement of the front door. Commissioner Sanders asked if the applicant was willing to install only one light fixture, and Ms. Almeida agreed. Upon a question from Commissioner Ellington, Ms. Almeida confirmed that canned lights would be present in the porch ceiling. Commissioner Ellington also clarified that the subcommittee had been amenable to a front door with either six (6) or nine (9) panes of glass.

Commissioner Townsend stated that the 3-D renderings were helpful. Commissioner Parker stated that she would accept the piecemeal drawings presented but asked if anyone else had trouble understanding them. Commissioner Townsend asked about the number of windows on the front elevation, and Ms. Good stated that the proposal was for two (2) windows on the front elevation.

Chip Atkins stated that he felt there would be enough room for a light and suggested allowing the applicant to make the change should there be enough space. Commissioner Sanders stated that his concern was that the light fixture would look cramped and the installation of a single light fixture would provide balance. Mr. Atkins stated that the proposal to use lap siding in the gable was common throughout the neighborhood. Commissioner Sanders acknowledged that but noted that he had also liked the previous proposal for shake shingles in the gables. Mr. Atkins also noted that a cricket may be required for the chimney, and Commissioner Ellington stated that the subcommittee had not addressed or made any recommendations about chimney supports. Commissioner Parker stated that a chimney cricket would probably be necessary but would probably not be visible from the street.

Commissioner Townsend asked about the proposed electronic door lock, and Commissioner Parker stated that the style of the handle was acceptable. Commissioner Townsend asked if the deadbolt would be all-black, and Commissioner Johannsen said it would be black until the screen was touched. Commissioner Sanders stated that the same type of lock was currently on the front door. Commissioner Parker stated that the original hardware was not present and the hardware would be hard to see.

Mr. Atkins observed the chimney height, and Commissioner Parker stated that the chimney should be built to the height required by the building code and fire code. Ms. Almeida noted that the fireplace would be gas, and Commissioner Parker stated that the chimney would still be required to be a certain distance from the roofline. Commissioner Grant asked about the existing chimney, and Ms. Almeida stated that it had been knocked down in the June windstorm. Commissioner Grant estimated that the chimney would probably need to be around four feet (4'-0") from the roofline and should be as low as the code would allow.

Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that a single light fixture be installed to the left of the front door and that the rectangular light fixture Option 1 be used. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

**Vote: 1619 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Motion to approve application with conditions

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Hood
2. Sanders			McKee
3. Ellington			Turner
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. Johannsen			
7. Townsend			

2. **HP-0497-2023 / 1573 Swan Dr. / Swan Lake Park (Swan Lake)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: August 19, 2023*

Applicant: City of Tulsa, c/o Gary Schellhorn

Proposals:

1. Replacement of concrete/stone fountain in Swan Lake
2. Replacement of chain link fence

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Gary Schellhorn, was present and had no additional comments. Commissioner Sanders gave the HP Permit Subcommittee report, noting that the Parks Department was striving successfully to replicate the historic look and spray pattern of the fountain, which had a singular jet with a circular ring of water.

Commissioner Sanders stated that he was not a fan of Ameristar hollow metal fencing and thought that chain link fencing might be more forgiving of dents and damage but noted that neighbors had apparently requested the upgrade. Mr. Schellhorn confirmed that was the case. Commissioner Parker felt that the Ameristar fence would look better than a chain link fence. Commissioner Evans also preferred Ameristar to chain link and added that it could be replaced panel-by-panel as needed. Commissioner Evans asked if any consideration had been given to inseting the posts in the masonry columns or attaching the fencing to the columns with brackets. Mr. Schellhorn stated that they intended to keep them separate and clarified that the columns would remain in place. Commissioner Sanders asked if any of the columns would be repaired, and Mr. Schellhorn replied that their repair was not part of the current project. Mr. Schellhorn stated that funding was limited, so the fencing was considered an "add/alternate" item, and added that the primary focus was the fountain.

Commissioner Evans stated he was happy they would be matching the spray pattern for the fountain. Commissioner Ellington pointed out that the nozzles may be larger so that they did not clog as quickly. Mr. Atkins stated that he had been part of the original committee who had considered repairs to the fountain in 2000 and recalled that the committee had recommended keeping original spray ring, which was still present at the time. Mr. Atkins provided additional background information about the work done by that committee and stated that the footing of the foundation would be replaced so that the fountain could more easily be repaired in the future. Commissioner Evans liked the proposal for the fountain. Commissioner Ellington stated he loved the history of the park and was glad to see that the fountain would be put back together.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously. Commissioner Grant asked when construction would begin, and Mr. Schellhorn stated that he expected the work would probably begin in February but did not have an exact date yet. Stacie Martin, Deputy Director of the Parks Department, stated it could be later than February.

**Vote: 1573 Swan Dr. / Swan Lake Park (Swan Lake)**

Motion to approve application

**In Favor**

1. Parker
2. Sanders
3. Ellington
4. Evans
5. Grant
6. Townsend

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

Hood  
McKee  
Turner

3. **HP-0499-2023 / 1323 E. 21<sup>st</sup> St. / Woodward Park Apartments (Swan Lake)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: N/A*

Applicant: Mark Galbraith

Proposal:

1. Replacement of windows

Commissioner Evans exited the room during the discussion and voting on this item.

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Mark Galbraith, stated that, in a previous application he made, the HP Permit Subcommittee had recommended composite windows rather than vinyl, but he found composite windows to be cost prohibitive. Mr. Galbraith stated that he now proposed matching the material of the existing windows, which were aluminum but in poor condition. Commissioner Parker asked if the proposed windows would be thermally broken, and Mr. Galbraith replied that they would be. Mr. Galbraith also added that aluminum-clad wooden windows would not be possible due to cost. Commissioner Parker stated that the aluminum windows would probably last longer than vinyl windows, and Ms. Good recalled that some subcommittee members had been concerned about black-finished, vinyl windows melting if installed on the south façade.

Commissioner Parker stated that the divisions in a few windows had strange proportions, resulting in horizontal panes of glass, and recommended adding another vertical muntin division in those windows. Mr. Galbraith was concerned that the panes would be too small if a vertical division was added to some windows and acknowledged that the dimensions of the windows posed a challenge in determining the muntin divisions. Commissioner Grant suggested a general rule that the width not exceed the height in any of the lites, and Commissioner Parker agreed since the building most closely resembled the Tudor style. Commissioner Sanders also agreed that the smaller panes would fit more with the Tudor style. Commissioner Grant stated that square panes would also be fine. Mr. Galbraith expressed doubt that adding vertical divisions to some of the windows would look better, and Commissioner Parker stated that a horizontal division could be removed instead to achieve the same effect. After consideration of several individual windows, commissioners agreed that the width of each lite should not exceed its height.

Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the width not exceed the height of each lite. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Johannsen and passed unanimously.

**Vote: 1323 E. 21<sup>st</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**  
Motion to approve application with condition

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Evans*
2. Sanders			Hood
3. Ellington			McKee
4. Grant			Turner
5. Johannsen			
6. Townsend			
*Recused			

Commissioner Evans re-entered the meeting.

- C. Reports
  - 1. Staff Report  
Staff announced that Dr. Matthew Pearce, National Register Coordinator for the State Historic Preservation Office, would offer a National Register of Historic Places training following the November 9, 2023, preservation commission meeting.
  - 2. Chair Report  
None
- D. New Business  
None
- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None
- F. Public Comment  
None
- G. Adjournment  
Commissioner Parker adjourned the regular meeting at 5:33 P.M.