



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, July 25, 2023, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall at One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the regular meeting to order at 4:33 P.M.

Members Present

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Susan McKee, MFA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James E. Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Shane Hood

Staff Present

Audrey Blank, Felicity Good, Caleb Rocha

Others Present

Carmen Warden, Tom Neal

2. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0472-2023 / 1425 E. 20th St.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas

Proposal:

1. Relocate gas meter to east side of structure

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. Commissioner Turner asked for the reason the meter must be relocated, but staff did not know. Commissioner Ellington stated that underground meters were typically not allowed anymore and were moved aboveground when replaced. Commissioner Ellington guessed that it was related to access for reading the meters.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1425 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Turner		Sanders
2. Ellington			Evans
3. Bumgarner			Hood
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			

2. **HP-0474-2023 / 1556 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 18, 2023

Applicant: Tom Neal

Proposals:

1. Replacement of columns on porch
2. Replacement of rail on porch
3. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report. Commissioner Parker reported that the HP Permit Subcommittee had found the application to be complete and the addition appropriate for the house. Commissioner Parker stated that the owners had preferred the version of the rail with thinner pickets and had preferred to leave the existing asbestos siding intact and install siding similar in appearance on the addition. Commissioner Parker reported that the subcommittee recommended approval of the application with either rail design. Commissioner Bumgarner asked how close the addition would be to the side property line, and the applicant, Tom Neal, replied that the walls would be approximately six feet (6'-0") from the property line. Commissioner Bumgarner asked if the eaves could project into the required setback, and Mr. Neal replied that the Tulsa Zoning Code allowed eaves to project up to two feet (2'-0") into the setback. Commissioner Grant asked about the basement, and Mr. Neal confirmed that a new basement would be dug to accommodate a soundproof room for the owner, who is a musician. Mr. Neal added that the owners are committed to staying in the house long-term and then noted that he did not believe the north side of the addition would be visible from the street.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application as presented with the condition that one-inch (0'-1") by two-inch (0'-2") balusters be used for the rail. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1556 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Sanders
2. Ellington			Evans
3. Bumgarner			Hood
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

3. **HP-0476-2023 / 1117 S. Norfolk Ave.** (Tracy Park)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None
Applicants: Carmen Warden & Jason Goltry
Proposal:

1. Substitution of windows

Application to amend HP-0432-3034 approved by Tulsa Preservation Commission on May 11, 2023, and HP-0465-2023 approved by Tulsa Preservation Commission on June 27, 2023

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Carmen Warden, stated that she had decided that she did not like the six-over-one (6/1) division scheme, which had been approved previously, and asked the commission to consider either a three-over-one (3/1) or two-over-two (2/2) division scheme. Commissioner Parker noted that the applicant had provided an example of a Tudor Revival style residence with the proposed 3/1 division scheme with only vertical divisions. Commissioner Turner asked which windows the applicants wished to amend, and Ms. Good stated that she understood the proposal to be a new division scheme for all windows. Commissioner Townsend asked about the smaller windows, and Ms. Warden stated that they would probably not have the same division scheme. Commissioner Grant asked about the diamond-pattern window on the front façade, and Ms. Warden clarified that it would remain. Commissioner Turner stated that he saw two different arguments—one for a more traditional approach with more panes and another for a more modern approach, recognizing the new house as a product of its own time, with fewer divisions. Commissioner Turner expressed a preference for the 2/2 or previously approved 6/1 division scheme. Commissioner Parker preferred the 3/1 division scheme for the double-hung windows. Commissioner Grant stated that in the example of a Tudor style house with a 2/2 division scheme, the house appeared to have newer replacement windows. Ms. Warden stated that both examples were from Florence Park. Commissioner Turner stated that the windows on the subject house would be large and the 3/1 “jailhouse” style would not be a good fit for the size of the windows. Ms. Warden stated the hung windows would be three feet (3’-0”) wide and suggested an additional vertical division in the top sashes, and Commissioner Turner agreed that the four-over-one (4/1) division scheme with only vertical divisions would make more sense for the width of the windows. Commissioner Grant agreed that the “jailhouse” style would be better with more than three (3) divisions. Commissioner Townsend asked if the window style was appropriate for a Tudor Revival style residence, and Commissioner Parker noted that the applicant had provided an example of that type of window on a Tudor Revival residence. Commissioner Parker then suggested that the applicant include vertical divisions in the fixed windows. After discussion, commissioners decided the casement windows should have vertical divisions but the smallest fixed windows should have no divisions.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the double-hung windows have three (3) vertical muntins and four (4) vertical panes in the top sashes and no muntins in the bottom sashes (4/1 division scheme); that the three-foot (3’-0”) wide, square casement windows have three (3) vertical muntins and four (4) vertical panes; and that the eighteen-inch (1’-6”) wide, fixed windows have no muntins. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1117 S. Norfolk Ave. (Tracy Park)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Sanders
2. Ellington			Evans
3. Bumgarner			Hood
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work completed without an HP Permit at 1233 South Newport Avenue, 1609-1611 East 17th Place, 1629 South St. Louis Avenue, and 1901 South Norfolk Avenue.

Staff reported on staff-approved HP permits:

- a. **1231 E. 20th St. (HP-0473-2023)**
Repair and replacement in-kind of porch ceiling
- b. **1145 E. 16th St. (HP-0475-2023)**
Replacement in-kind of wrought iron fencing panels in the street yard
- c. **1623 S. Trenton Ave. (HP-0477-2023)**
Repair and replacement of damaged triangular knee braces, fascia, exposed rafter tails, siding, and roofline with in-kind materials
- d. **1132 E. 20th St. (HP-0478-2023)**
Removal of existing non-historic tiles from front porch

Felicity Good announced that Lee Anne Zeigler had resigned as Historic Preservation Planner. Felicity Good asked commissioners about streamlining the 2024 regular meeting schedule to a standard date and time, and Commissioner Townsend offered some background information about the current schedule.

2. Chair Report

Commissioner Parker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee was reviewing draft amendments to the Unified Design Guidelines that would apply to work within City of Tulsa parks and that it would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission soon.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Parker adjourned the regular meeting at 5:12 P.M.