



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, May 23, 2023, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:36 P.M.

Members Present

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Shane Hood*
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James E. Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Chris Bumgarner
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Susan McKee, MFA

*Arrived late

Staff Present

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank*, Jeremy Banes

*Arrived late

Others Present

Julie Coats, Candidate for Yorktown Neighborhood Representative
Liz Murry, Tracy Park Neighborhood Representative
Chip Atkins, Swan Lake Neighborhood Representative
James "Kelly" Henning
Blas Gaytan
Linda Lichty
Bhadri Verduzco
Bethanie Verduzco

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, May 11, 2023

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on May 11, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Bumgarner
2. Sanders			Evans
3. Ellington			Hood
4. Grant			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0430-2023 / 1720 St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: February 21, 2023; April 6, 2023; May 4, 2023
Applicant: James “Kelly” Henning
Proposal:
 1. Construction of residence

Staff directed commissioners’ attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. The applicant, Kelly Henning, was present and had nothing to add to the staff report. Commissioner Sanders thanked Mr. Henning for his cooperation and reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had worked with the applicant over three sessions and recommended approval of the application with the condition that the full commission make a final decision on the design of the small bathroom window on the front façade. Staff informed the commission that the proposed small window would have frosted glass and that the subcommittee had at one point suggested a diamond muntin pattern in the window. According to the applicant, after investigating other houses in the neighborhood, he could not find any examples of Craftsman style house with a diamond pattern, though there were examples of Tudor homes with that design. Commissioner Turner clarified that the suggestion had been made in an effort to make the small window stand out as a decorative detail. Commissioner Parker indicated no preference for one window over another. Commissioner Grant asked about the material of the front door, and Mr. Henning stated that it would be solid wood. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant about the transom window on the front elevation, and the applicant said that the subcommittee preferred the single-pane transom window instead of a transom window with divisions, and that he did as well. Commissioner Parker said that the single-pane transom window would be historically accurate, and having a transom window reflecting the divisions of the windows below was a more modern look. Commissioner Grant indicated a preference for a divided transom to match the mullion locations on the windows beneath it, and Commissioner Turner pointed out that the ceiling of the porch would be vaulted. Chip Atkins stated that the configuration reminded him of a Palladian window, which would typically have an arched transom, and Liz Murry pointed out that, if the transom window were divided, both the mullions and vertical muntins should match the windows below. Commissioner Sanders stated that he was amenable to the applicant’s preference on both the small bathroom window and the transom window. Mr. Henning expressed a preference for the frosted bathroom window with no divisions and a single-pane transom window, as shown in the front elevation. Commissioner Sanders found that adding a different muntin

pattern on the small window might be too busy, especially on a Craftsman style residence.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sanders and passed unanimously. Commissioner Grant noted a preference for a divided transom window.

Vote: 1720 St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Bumgarner
2. Sanders			Evans
3. Ellington			McKee
4. Grant			
5. Hood			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

2. HP-0453-2023 / 1135 S. Newport Ave. (Tracy Park)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Applicant: Linda Lichy

Proposals:

1. Replacement of awnings
2. Replacement and expansion of driveway
3. Replacement and expansion of walkways

Staff presented its report. The applicant, Linda Lichy, was present and added that she would like to add a small concrete pad on the north side of the driveway to accommodate someone exiting a vehicle from the driveway. Ms. Lichy also stated that the proposals would be dependent on the cost of other necessary repairs to the house and the replacement of the detached garage. Finally, Ms. Lichy stated that the proposed replacement and expansion of the driveway was also dependent on the location of the water line. Commissioner Sanders asked if the applicant intended to expand the whole driveway and maintain the existing taper, and Ms. Lichy replied that the plan was to have a uniform width across the new driveway. Commissioner Parker noted that would make the overall maximum width of the driveway approximately nine feet and ten inches (9'-10"). Commissioner Grant asked if the apron of the driveway between the sidewalk and street would be altered, and Commissioner Turner asked how far up the driveway would be widened. Ms. Lichy answered that she intended only to replace the driveway from the back of the sidewalk and that the widened driveway would extend eastward all the way to the detached garage and noted that new foundation for the garage would be poured. Commissioner Turner suggested that the applicant wait until the other projects were completed if she was not sure about the timeline for the driveway, and Commissioner Townsend further explained that an Historic Preservation Permit would only be valid for two years. Ms. Lichy preferred to continue the application at this time. Commissioner Sanders asked the applicant if she used the awnings regularly. Ms. Lichy responded affirmatively. In response to an inquiry from Commissioner Hood, Ms. Lichy explained some of the history of the house and how the outdoor areas had been designed. Commissioner Sanders stated that awnings would be a historically appropriate feature. Commissioner Turner asked staff if the replacement of awning material could be approved at the staff level, and staff stated that it could be

considered replacement in-kind except that the pattern on the material was changing. Commissioner Parker indicated approval of the proposal for the driveway. Commissioner Townsend asked if the driveway transition from the narrower curb width to the wider driveway width would look unusual, but Commissioner Parker noted that the difference in width would not be significant. Commissioner Townsend asked for clarification on the proposed concrete landing pad where the driveway would meet the walkway. The applicant said she preferred a square or rectangle rather than the triangular pads that existed. Commissioner Grant suggested a rectangular piece of concrete eighteen inches (1'-6") deep and twelve inches (1'-0") wide could be added to each side of the proposed walkway where a driver would typically exit a vehicle.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application with the following conditions:

- That the driveway be expanded to the retaining wall on the south side;
- That the driveway be expanded up to fourteen inches (1'-2") on the north side where it meets the walkway;
- That the driveway extend west in a straight line to meet the sidewalk; and
- That an eighteen-inch (1'-6") by twelve-inch (1'-0") landing be added on either side of the walkway where it connects to the driveway.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1135 S. Newport Ave. (Tracy Park)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Bumgarner
2. Sanders			Evans
3. Ellington			McKee
4. Grant			
5. Hood			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

3. HP-0425-2023 / 1624 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: May 4, 2023

Applicant: Dariela Gonzalez

Proposals:

1. Removal of walls around porch
2. Replacement and construction of columns on porch
3. Replacement of floor and skirting on porch
4. Installation of siding
5. Installation of vent in gable
6. Replacement of door on east façade
7. Replacement of windows on east façade
8. Replacement of trim around windows, door, and eaves
9. Removal of eight (8) windows on south façade
10. Installation of four (4) windows on south façade
11. Removal of seven (7) windows on north façade
12. Installation of five (5) windows on north façade

Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Staff presented its report, and the new owner, Blas Gaytan, was present and had nothing to add to the staff report. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had worked with the applicant for one session and

that the applicant had incorporated the recommendations from that meeting; however, as there was not a quorum for the subcommittee meeting on May 16, 2023, the application had not been reviewed since. Commissioner Grant observed that there was still work to be done on the proposal, and Commissioner Sanders stated that Mr. Gaytan had responded well to the initial concerns, so he was willing to consider the application. Commissioner Townsend asked if the piers should all be the same height, and Mr. Atkins stated that the piers were original to the house but expressed concern about mold or mildew if the original siding were not removed before new siding was installed. Commissioner Sanders asked about the vinyl siding shown in an earlier photograph, and Mr. Gaytan explained that it had been removed and the wood siding underneath exposed. Commissioner Grant stated that perhaps the application should return to the subcommittee. Commissioner Townsend asked staff how that recommendation could be made. Staff stated that if the applicant were willing, the application could return to the subcommittee for another review; otherwise, the preservation commission should make a decision about the application as presented. Commissioner Parker asked Mr. Gaytan if he would be willing to return to the subcommittee on June 1, 2023, and he agreed. At staff's request, the commissioners offered several suggestions for consideration, including retention of the original siding, treatment of the columns and piers to resemble their original appearance, and the expression of mullions between windows on the east elevation. Commissioner Hood asked if a handrail would be required on the porch, and Commissioner Parker replied that it would not be required since the porch floor was less than thirty inches (2'-6") above grade.

4. **HP-0431-2023 / 1747 S. Quincy Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 21, 2023

Applicant: Bhadri Verduzco

Proposal:

1. Construction of retaining wall

Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit

Application to Amend HP-0405-2022 denied by Tulsa Preservation Commission on November 10, 2022

Staff presented its report, and the owners, Bhadri Verduzco and Bethanie Verduzco, were present and added that the gravel blocking the driveway had been removed and that the application of a concrete skim coat and then a layer of stucco helped the retaining wall blend in with other walls in the neighborhood. Mr. Atkins stated that he had seen the mock-up of the wall with stucco applied in person and thought it looked good. Commissioner Parker asked if a cap would be added, and the applicants confirmed it would. Commissioner Grant asked if the stucco retained the stepped look of the underlying tiers of bricks, and Ms. Verduzco stated that the slope of the wall was minimal with the stucco added. Commissioner Grant expressed concern about the infiltration of moisture through the seams, and Mr. Verduzco explained that a French drain and water barrier had been installed behind the wall. Commissioner Parker noted that the method of applying stucco to the wall was an untested approach but expressed hope that it would be successful. Commissioner Turner said he did not like the appearance of the wall and expected that the stucco would crack as the wall shifted and that moisture would be an issue as well. Commissioner Sanders stated that he was more optimistic, thought the wall resembled a lime-plastered stone wall, and found the application of stucco to be an inventive solution. Commissioner Sanders further stated that, because this style of retaining wall was present elsewhere in historic preservation overlays, he was sympathetic to the owners' predicament and appreciated their efforts to make the wall appear to be historic.

Commissioner Parker said that she considered the stucco treatment as a holdover until the retaining wall needed to be replaced in the future and found the proposed wall to be a better option than the railroad ties that were previously present. Commissioner Parker suggested using a mesh lath to strengthen the wall. Ms. Murry also noted that the type of concrete might be a factor in its durability. Commissioner Grant asked the applicants if they had consulted a mason who specialized in stucco. Ms. Verduzco thought they had received a quote but had not considered hiring someone to build the wall because of the cost. Commissioner Grant recommended that the owners consult with someone with expertise who could recommend a particular mix of stucco and treatment of the substrate.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to approve the application with the condition that a mesh lath be integrated into the stucco. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1747 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Grant		Bumgarner
2. Sanders	Hood		Evans
3. Ellington	Turner		McKee
4. Townsend			

5. **HP-0451-2023 / 1352 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)**

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: none

Applicant: Karla Ricard, Oklahoma natural Gas

Proposal:

1. Relocation of meter

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was not present. The commissioners discussed that it was difficult to see from the diagram if the proposed location of the meter would be visible. Mr. Atkins stated that the meter could not be placed directly under a window. Commissioner Hood expressed disappointment that the applicant was not present to address the application. Commissioner Parker suggested approving the application with the condition that the meter be placed as far behind the corner of the house as possible.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the meter be placed at least as far back in relation to the house as indicated in the diagram provided by the applicant. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and passed with a majority.

Vote: 1352 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Hood		Bumgarner
2. Sanders			Evans
3. Ellington			McKee
4. Grant			
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

6. **Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative**

Julie Looper Coats, Yorktown Neighborhood Association

Staff introduced Julie Looper Coats, who had been nominated by the Yorktown Neighborhood Association to serve as Neighborhood Representative. Ms. Coats stated that she and her husband had moved to the neighborhood about one year ago and that she looked forward to serving as Yorktown’s Neighborhood Representative.

Commissioner Sanders stated that he recently spoke with the previous representative for Yorktown, Matt McAfee, who had moved out of the district, and that Mr. McAfee spoke very highly about Ms. Coats.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to confirm the appointment of Julie Looper Coats as Neighborhood Representative for the Yorktown Neighborhood Association. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and passed unanimously.

Vote: Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Bumgarner
2. Sanders			Evans
3. Ellington			McKee
4. Grant			
5. Hood			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit at 1030 East 19th Street, 1202 East 18th Street, 1215 South Newport Avenue, 1571 East 19th Street, and 1709 South Trenton Avenue. Ms. Murry stated that she believed the owner of 1215 South Newport Avenue intended to paint the masonry on the house. The commissioners and representatives then discussed the use of stop work orders and fines. Staff explained the process for addressing Work completed without an historic preservation permit, which included a letter to the owner, then a Notice of Violation, and then potentially a criminal citation and issuance of fines if no response was received by that point. The commissioners asked who was responsible for delivering the notices, and Audrey Blank explained that the Working in Neighborhoods Department (WIN) typically handled zoning and nuisance violations and prioritized working with property owners to bring properties into compliance. Ms. Blank explained that the Development Services department could issue stop work orders for unauthorized work without a permit. Commissioners asked staff to request that the Development Services Department issue a stop work order for the property at 1215 South Newport Avenue since work was currently in progress and there was concern that a building permit might also be required.

Staff reported on staff-approved historic preservation permits at the following locations:

- a. **1231 E. 20th St. (HP-0452-2023)**
Repair and replacement in-kind of damaged masonry on walkway, steps, and

stoop at front entry

- b. **2127 E. 19th St. (HP-0454-2023)**
Replacement in-kind of porch floor, steps, and walkway
Removal and re-installation of existing rail on porch

Staff reported reminded Commissioners that the 2023 Preservation Awards would be held at 6:00 pm on May 24, 2023, at the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture, 633 South Boston Avenue.

2. Chair Report
None

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Parker adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:25 P.M.