



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, March 28, 2023, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chair, Commissioner Sanders called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:35 P.M.

Members Present

Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Shane Hood
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Chris Bumgarner
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Susan McKee, MFA

Staff Present

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank, Jeremy Banes

Others Present

Matt Emmons, Daniel Gingerich, Joel Collins, Joel Carr, Cassia Carr, Chip Atkins

2. Staff introduced Shane Hood, who had been appointed as the allied commission member for the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission.

3. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, February 28, 2023, and Regular Meeting, March 9, 2023

Staff noted that a draft of the minutes from March 9, 2023, was not yet available but would be presented for review and approval at the next regular meeting on April 13, 2023.

Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on February 28, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and passed with a majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, February 28, 2023

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders		Hood	Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Townsend			McKee
5. Turner			

4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
Commissioner Sanders disclosed that he had a conflict of interest in HP-0440-2023 at 1214 East 17th Place but noted that the review of the application would be postponed to the next Regular Meeting due to a lack of quorum for that item.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0437-2023 / 1638 E. 17th PI.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 21, 2023

Applicant: Chip Atkins

Proposals:

1. Replacement of roof shingles
2. Installation of copper flashing on roof
3. Installation of copper cladding on dormers

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found the proposal thorough and appropriate, had some questions about the copper cladding on the dormers, and ultimately recommended approval of the application. The applicant, Chip Atkins, said that the existing shingles were made of asbestos and concrete and could not be replaced, so the proposed slate composite tiles were a quality alternative. Mr. Atkins explained that work on the addition in 1991 included installation of trim molding that matched the original structure, and a combination of that leftover trim and newly cut trim pieces would be used to replace the fascia in-kind. Commissioner Grant asked if the copper cladding and flashing was meant to replicate what was already present on the east addition, and Mr. Atkins answered affirmatively. Commissioner Sanders pointed out that samples of the existing and proposed roof materials were available.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1638 E. 17th PI. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Hood			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

2. **HP-0441-2023 / 1207 E. 21st St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 21, 2023

Applicant: Joel V. Collins

Proposal:

1. Installation of French doors on south facade

Staff presented its report, noting that the proposal had previously been approved in 2016 but the approval had expired before the project was initiated. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended approval of the application based on the previous approval and the fact that no major changes had been made to the proposal. Commissioner Turner inquired about the whitewash on the walls of the house, and the applicant, Joel Collins, explained that that it had not been removed but had weathered more heavily on some sides of the house and was still mostly intact at the back of the house.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hood and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1207 E. 21st St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Hood			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

3. **HP-0443-2023 / 1517 S. Owasso Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 21, 2023

Applicant: Daniel Gingerich

Proposal:

1. Replacement and expansion of driveway and walkway
Project initiated without an historic preservation permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the owner had responded promptly with an historic preservation permit application once he was informed of the requirement by an inspector from the City of Tulsa. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found the previously proposed twelve-foot (12'-0") wide walkway to be too large and felt it should not be large enough to accommodate a car parked directly in front of the house. Commissioner Sanders noted that the subcommittee recommended approval of the application with the conditions that the width of the walkway in front of the steps be reduced from twelve feet (12'-0") to five feet (5'-0"), that a corresponding curve be retained, and that the curve had a maximum radius between six feet (6'-0") and seven feet (7'-0") between the driveway and walkway. Commissioner Grant inquired about the driveway behind the house, and Commissioner Turner noted that the chimney on the south side of the house made it difficult to get a vehicle through. Upon inquiries from Commissioner Grant, the applicant, Daniel Gingerich, stated that no changes would be made to the retaining wall and that the curb on the north side of the driveway would remain. Commissioner Grant stated that a ninety-degree (90°) angle between the driveway and walkway

would be most historically appropriate but deferred to the architect members of the commission for their opinion on the curve. Commissioner Sanders and asked the applicant if he preferred a curve or a ninety-degree (90°) angle between the driveway and walkway, and Mr. Gingerich expressed a preference for a curve. Commissioner Townsend asked if the curve between the walkway and driveway would improve any conditions for the future owners of the home and noted it would not be very visible from the street, and Commissioner Turner stated that the curve would make access to and from a vehicle much easier. Commissioner Sanders expressed a willingness to accommodate the request for a curve.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application as presented in the site plan. However, the site plan was found to incorrectly portray the radius of the curve recommended by the subcommittee, and the commissioners discussed an appropriate design for the walkway. Commissioner Sanders amended his motion to approve the application with the condition that the walkway be five feet (5'-0") wide and that the curve between the walkway and the driveway have a radius of six feet (6'-0"). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1517 S. Owasso Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Hood			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

4. HP-0445-2023 / 308 W. King St. (The Heights/Brady Heights)

Applicants: Joel & Cassia Carr

Proposals:

1. Installation of light fixture in porch ceiling
2. Installation of rail on porch

Application to amend HP-0380-2022 approved in part by Tulsa Preservation Commission on August 23, 2022

Staff presented its report, noting that the application had been forwarded to the Tulsa Preservation Commission without a review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee since the scope of work was limited. Joel Carr, the applicant, stated that cedar dominated the appearance of the porch, so they requested an amendment to the previously approved rail to use wrought iron instead of cedar. Mr. Carr stated that the proposed rail would tie in with the panels on the front door and garage door. Cassia Carr, also the applicant, added that the photos of interior rails that had been provided reflected the proposed wrought iron material but that the pattern would be a two-over-one (2/1) configuration as shown in the drawings. Upon inquiries from Commissioner Turner, Mr. Carr confirmed that the trim on the columns and the skirting around the porch would be added before completion of the project. Commissioner Turner agreed with the change in the material of the railing and the 2/1 pattern. Upon inquiries from Commissioners Grant and Turner, Mr. Carr stated that the details shown in the drawings of the posts and caps would be constructed, that the columns were constructed from a 4 x 4 wrapped with one-inch (0'-1") boards, and that the top rail would be approximately two and one-half inches (0'-2 1/2") or three

inches (0'-3") wide with two-inch (0'-2") balusters. Commissioner Grant expressed concern that the metal rail might appear too delicate next to the larger columns, and Mr. Carr explained that the wrought iron is at least two inches (0'-2") thick and added that the columns would be difficult to reconstruct since they are structural elements on the porch. Commissioner Turner agreed that the columns might seem large compared with the metal rail but understood the applicants' rationale. Commissioner Sanders stated that the applicants had made significant improvements to the house and that, because the house would never fully look like it is from the period of significance due to alterations that had been made over time, his primary concern was that the applicants used quality materials. Commissioner Hood asked whether the frame overall would be smaller than the interior pattern, and Mr. Carr answered affirmatively. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, Ms. Carr stated that her grandfather had purchased the house in the 1980s and made several changes over time. Commissioner Grant complimented the applicants on the success of the project thus far.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application per the rail detail submitted. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hood and passed with a majority.

Vote: 308 W. King St. (The Heights/Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders	Ellington		Parker
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Hood			Evans
4. Townsend			McKee
5. Turner			

5. **HP-0440-2023 / 1214 E. 17th Pl.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 21, 2023
 Applicants: Adam Doverspike
 Proposal:
 1. Construction of addition on south side of residence

Because of Commissioner Sanders's recusal there would not be a quorum for this item, so the review of the application was postponed until the next regular meeting on April 13, 2023.

6. **HP-0442-2023 / 2132 E. 20th St.** (Yorktown)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: March 21, 2023
 Applicant: Matt Emmons
 Proposals:
 1. Removal of chimney and shed roof on south side of residence
 2. Construction of addition on south side of residence

Staff presented its report. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application with the condition that the new siding on the east façade be installed up to the door on the east side of the house so that no seams would be visible. Commissioner Sanders added that the chimney proposed for removal was not original. The applicant, Matt Emmons, stated he believed the chimney dated to the 1970s. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the proposed windows, and Commissioner Sanders stated

they would be hung windows matching those presently on the house. Commissioner Grant stated that the chimney was clearly a later addition to the house and guessed that the shed roof proposed for removal had been a porch that was later enclosed. Commissioner Grant found that the proposal was well designed and would improve the overall condition of the house by correcting modifications from decades ago.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application per the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's recommendation, with the condition that the new siding on the east façade be installed up to the door on the east side of the house. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and passed unanimously.

Vote: 2132 E. 20th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Hood			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

7. Review and approval of the amended 2023 regular meeting schedule of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

Staff presented the amended schedule, noting the date and deadline for the second meeting in November had been incorrect.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the amended regular meeting schedule. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sanders and passed unanimously.

Vote: Amended 2023 regular meeting schedule of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Parker
2. Ellington			Bumgarner
3. Grant			Evans
4. Hood			McKee
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported that she had participated in a site visit at Booker T. Washington High School, and there was interest by some alumni to pursue a National Register of Historic Places nomination. Staff reported that a television producer had reached out to her for recommendations of individuals restoring historic homes in Tulsa. Commissioners suggested Commissioner Parker and Jeremy Brennan. Staff reported that the Window Restoration Workshop would take place April 15-16, that nominations for the 2023 Preservation Awards were open through April 30, and that

the 2023 Preservation Awards ceremony would be held on May 24, 2023.

2. Chair Report
None

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
Chip Atkins stated that he was glad that Shane Hood would serve on the preservation commission.

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Sanders adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:40 P.M.