



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, February 28, 2023, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor, South Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair  
Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair\*  
Royce Ellington, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner  
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA\*  
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS  
Susan McKee, MFA  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.  
James Turner, AIA

#### **Members Absent**

None

\*Late arrival

#### **Staff Present**

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank, Jeremy Banes

#### **Others Present**

Carmen Warden, Jason Goltry, Chip Atkins, Liz Murry

#### 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, January 24, 2023, and Regular Meeting, February 9, 2023

Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on January 24, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, January 24, 2023

#### **In Favor**

1. Parker
2. Bumgarner
3. Ellington
4. Grant
5. McKee
6. Turner

#### **Opposed**

#### **Abstaining**

Townsend

#### **Not Present**

Evans  
Sanders

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on February 9, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, February 9, 2023

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker		Grant	Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Bumgarner			
4. McKee			
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0427-2023 / 1508 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Christian Vaughan

Proposal:

1. Construction of carport on east side of residence

*Application to amend HP-0415-2022 denied by Tulsa Preservation Commission on January 24, 2023*

At the request of the applicant, the review of the application was postponed to a future Regular Meeting.

2. **HP-0428-2023 / 1117 S. Norfolk Ave.** (Tracy Park)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 21, 2023*

Applicant: Jason Goltry

Proposal:

1. Demolition of residence

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. Commissioner Parker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee heard from several neighbors in support of the project and noted that the house was built in the 1940s, which is outside the period of significance for the Tracy Park Historic District, but was constructed in a style appropriate for the period. Commissioner Parker reported that the subcommittee forwarded the application to the Tulsa Preservation Commission without a recommendation. The applicant, Jason Goltry, and his spouse, Carmen Warden, explained that the house is entirely constructed of concrete, which has made structural repairs and renovations difficult and extremely expensive. The applicants described recent estimates from contractors for a small addition to the home. Commissioner Townsend inquired whether the owners knew about the issues when they purchased the home, and Ms. Warden stated they did but emphasized that they love the neighborhood and the location of the house. Mr. Goltry stated that, as soon as the house is demolished, they planned to move forward with the construction of a new residence and noted that the plans would be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee on Thursday, March 2. Commissioner Townsend recalled that applications for demolition had previously, although rarely, been approved when nothing would be gained from denial and when a plan was in place for

an historically appropriate residence in its place. Commissioner Parker stated that there was not much left on the house that was historic. Commissioner Turner recalled that in the past the preservation commission had only approved applications for demolition when there was evidence that the building was structurally compromised. Ms. Warden stated that a beam in the house was structurally compromised. Commissioner Parker recited Guidelines F.1.1.1 and F.1.1.2, which state:

*F.1.1 Demolition of historic structures does not support the character of the district. Demolitions are strongly discouraged, but will be considered on a case-by-case basis provided that one or more of the following guidelines are met:*

- .1 The continued use of the property cannot be achieved through rehabilitation, modification, or alteration, according to documented evidence.*
- .2 The structure is listed as non-contributing to the historic character of the district in the National Register Nomination for the district.*

Chip Atkins, neighborhood representative for Swan Lake, stated that he supported the demolition proposal on the basis of the Unified Design Guidelines and Zoning Code and stated that he had considered purchasing the house in the 2000s but found it infeasible to rehabilitate at that time. Commissioner Parker inquired whether any of the wire-faced bricks would be salvaged, but Ms. Warden replied that they had inquired about reclaiming the masonry for use on the proposed new house but that the texture of the bricks would make it difficult to remove mortar. Commissioner Ellington inquired whether a structural engineer had been consulted, and Ms. Warden stated that in 2020 they had consulted a structural engineer, who gave an estimate of approximately \$50,000 to add a support beam.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application as presented on the basis of Guidelines F.1.1.1 and F.1.1.2. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed with a majority.

Guidelines cited: F.1.1.1, F.1.1.2

**Vote: 1117 S. Norfolk Ave.** (Tracy Park)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Turner		
2. Sanders			
3. Ellington			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Evans			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Townsend			

3. **HP-0417-2023 / 1701 S. Newport Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: January 17, 2023; February 21, 2023*  
Applicants: Connor & Madeleine Hasbrook  
Proposals:
  1. Construction of retaining wall
  2. Construction of fence and gates

Staff presented its report, and the applicants were not present. Commissioner Sanders gave the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee and explained that the current proposal was missing all of the changes suggested by the subcommittee. He listed the following:

- The addition of a column near the fire hydrant to make the front more symmetrical;
- The indication of a cap from limestone, concrete, or brick along the retaining wall and columns; and
- The consideration of a solid wrought iron fence rather than the hollow Ameristar fence proposed.

Commissioner Evans stated that the fence should have three more columns: one at the northwest corner of the site, and two more on either side of the west pedestrian gate at the corner where the fence and wall meet the sidewalk. Commissioner Turner noted that another option would be to move the two columns on either side of the pedestrian gate forward to be parallel to the other columns along the sidewalk. Commissioner Parker said the proposals still lacked adequate information for the preservation commission to make a decision. Felicity Good pointed out that the next regular meeting of the preservation commission would still be within the 30 days allowed for the commission to make a decision because the original proposal had been deemed incomplete at the last meeting.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to deny the due to the missing information and lack of response to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's recommendations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed with a majority.

**Vote: 1701 S. Newport Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker	Ellington		
2. Sanders	Townsend		
3. Bumgarner			
4. Evans			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Turner			

**4. Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative**

Elizabeth Murry, Tracy Park Neighborhood Association

Staff announced that the Tracy Park Neighborhood Association had nominated Elizabeth (Liz) Murry to serve as Neighborhood Representative for the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay. Ms. Murry stated that she was eager to learn and represent Tracy Park on the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, knew most people in the neighborhood, and was passionate about both sustainability and preservation. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Sanders, Ms. Murry stated she had lived in the district since 2019. Commissioner Parker stated that Ms. Murry had completed extensive restoration of her home, including restoring terrazzo tiles. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired how the neighborhood had felt about the proposal for demolition at 1117 South Norfolk Avenue, and Ms. Murry stated that one person she spoke to had been opposed but that most understood the challenges faced by the owners.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve Liz Murry's appointment as Neighborhood Representative for the Tracy Park Neighborhood Association. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed unanimously.

**Vote: Confirmation of Appointment of Neighborhood Representative**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			
2. Sanders			
3. Ellington			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Evans			
6. Grant			
7. McKee			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on a staff-approved historic preservation permit:

- a. **1816 E. 16<sup>th</sup> Pl. (HP-0429-2023)**  
Replacement in-kind of siding and trim

Staff reported on Work initiated without an historic preservation permit at 1121 East 19<sup>th</sup> Street and stated that an application had been submitted and would be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee on March 2.

Staff offered an update on possible amendments to the Unified Design Guidelines that would address parks within Historic Preservation (HP) Overlays. Commissioner Townsend stated that she learned that the fountain at Tracy Park was not an original feature. Mr. Atkins stated that the basin of the fountain was historic but the center portion was not and expressed concern that the Parks Board had not weighed in on the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay. Commissioner Sanders clarified that any new park-related guidelines would apply to all parks within HP Overlays, not just Tracy Park, and staff agreed. Commissioner Evans stated that it is hard to generalize guidelines for parks.

Staff reported that the Outreach Committee was working to plan a 2023 Preservation Awards ceremony, that the survey of the Maple Heights Addition had been completed and approved by the State Historic Preservation Office, that postcard notifications had been mailed to owners within HP Overlays, and that the spring Window Restoration Workshop had been scheduled for April 15 and 16. Staff then reported that the City of Tulsa had been allocated \$18,375 for its Certified Local Government program and proposals for use of the funds could be submitted until 4:00 P.M. on Wednesday, March 8.

2. Chair Report

None

D. New Business  
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None

F. Public Comment  
None

G. Adjournment  
Commissioner Parker adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:19 P.M.