



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, February 9, 2023, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Parker called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:02 A.M.

Members Present

Katelyn Parker, RA, Chair
Mark D. G. Sanders, Vice-Chair
Royce Ellington, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Susan McKee, MFA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS

Staff Present

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank, Jeremy Banes

Others Present

Daniel Flores, Michael Madsen, Jeremy Brennan

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, January 24, 2022

Staff noted that a draft of the minutes was not yet available but would be presented for review and approval at the next regular meeting on February 28.

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Parker disclosed that she had a conflict of interest as the architect for HP-0418-2023 at 1132 East 20th Street and that she would recuse herself during discussion and voting on that item.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0418-2023 / 1132 E. 20th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 17, 2023

Applicant: Stephanie Madsen

Proposals:

1. Removal of chimney on east side of residence
2. Construction of addition on east side of residence
3. Construction of rail atop porte-cochère on west side of residence

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. The applicant's spouse, Michael Madsen, was present to represent the application. Commissioner Ellington gave the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee report, noting that the only item they had questioned was the removal of the chimney. Commissioner Townsend stated she was initially skeptical about the chimney removal but changed her mind after reviewing the application. Commissioner Sanders agreed. Mr. Madsen pointed to the floor plan, which depicted how the chimney removal was necessary for internal circulation. Commissioner Sanders asked if any fireplaces were being removed on the interior, and the applicant replied that the existing fireplaces were being converted to ventless systems. Commissioner Turner asked about the requested rail construction on the porte-cochère. Mr. Madsen stated that the rail was proposed because of safety concerns, as the wall is very low, and that as far as he knew a rail had not previously been present. Upon further inquiry by Commissioner Turner, staff member Felicity Good clarified that the brick details on the low walls of the existing structure would be retained and restored as needed when the addition and rail were constructed. Commissioner Sanders asked for the rationale behind the stucco panels flanking the windows on the proposed addition, pointing out that the stucco panels gave the appearance of shutters in his opinion. Mr. Madsen said they had considered a full brick façade but decided to incorporate design elements from the front porch to reduce the overall weight of the addition. Staff member Felicity Good referenced discussion by the subcommittee that the stucco would tie in other architectural elements on the house without trying to portray the addition as original to the house. Commissioner Turner appreciated the frieze and stucco panels because the addition would emulate a sleeping porch that had been enclosed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.5.6, A.5.7, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.2.3, B.2.4, B.2.5, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, B.5.1, B.5.2, B.5.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1132 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Sanders			Grant
2. Ellington			Parker*
3. Bumgarner			
4. Evans			*Recused
5. McKee			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

2. HP-0421-2023 / 1523 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jeremy Brennan

Proposals:

1. Replacement of columns on porch
2. Replacement of rail on porch
3. Replacement of two (2) windows with four (4) windows on west façade
4. Removal of one (1) window on south façade

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant intended to return the front façade to its original appearance based on a photograph of the house from 1940 that the previous owner provided. The applicant’s spouse, Jeremy Brennan, was present to represent the application. Mr. Brennan explained that they originally planned to remove three (3) windows on the south façade and install them on the front façade but had since decided to remove only one (1) window on the south façade. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Parker, Mr. Brennan confirmed that the new windows on the south façade would be custom-built from wood to match other windows on the house. Commissioners discussed the proposed replacement of windows on the west façade and agreed that the proposed windows and porch columns based upon the photo presented from the 1940s would likely be more accurate than what was currently installed. Commissioner Sanders asked about the size of the mullions, and Mr. Brennan replied that he believed other mullions on the house were approximately five and a half inches (0’-5 1/2”) wide and that the new mullions would match the existing dimensions. The commission then discussed the two versions of the rail that were submitted. Commissioner McKee preferred Example 2 with thinner balusters, and Commissioner Townsend agreed. Commissioner Turner stated that the spacing between balusters should match that in the photograph from 1940 and commissioners then discussed the rail and columns in the photograph. Mr. Brennan said he was willing to build the rail according to any specifications the commissioners recommended. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Turner, Mr. Brennan confirmed that the columns would include crown molding and square trim around the bases. Commissioner Sanders indicated approval of the project and applauded the applicant’s efforts to restore the house to its original appearance.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the rail be constructed in the style of Rail Example #2 with a 2x6 top rail, that the space between the balusters and the height of the rail match that in the photograph of the residence from 1940, and that all trim match the trim around the original windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Evans and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7, A.4.8, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1523 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Grant
2. Sanders			
3. Ellington			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Evans			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

3. **HP-0422-2023 / 1139 N. Denver Ave. (The Heights/Brady Heights)**
 Applicant: Daniel Flores
 Proposal:
 1. Replacement of soffit and fascia

Staff presented its report, noting that the proposed soffit and fascia would match the

existing dimensions. The applicant was present. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the proposed T1-11 paneling to be used for the soffit would have wide or narrow spacing between the grooves and expressed a preference for narrow spacing with grooves running perpendicular to the face of the house. Mr. Flores indicated no preference for the spacing but preferred that the grooves run parallel to the house to reduce the amount of labor for cutting that would be required. Commissioners Parker and Sanders recalled examples of soffit with grooves running parallel to the face of the house. However, Commissioners Parker and Turner explained that T1-11 boards should be installed with grooves running perpendicular to the house because of the lap joints built into the boards. Commissioner Turner pointed out that running the lines parallel to the house would be difficult without leaving noticeable joints.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the conditions T1-11 paneling with narrow spacing between grooves be used, that the grooves run perpendicular to the face of the house, and that miter joints be used at the corners. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4

Vote: 1139 N. Denver Ave. (The Heights/Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Grant
2. Sanders			
3. Ellington			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Evans			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

4. **HP-0417-2023 / 1701 S. Newport Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 17, 2023
 Applicants: Connor & Madeleine Hasbrook
 Proposals:
 1. Construction of retaining wall
 2. Construction of fence and gate

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicants had submitted two alternate versions—one in which the fence ran straight across the north property line and the other in which the fence curved along the driveway on the north side of the house. Neither the applicants nor their contractor were present to represent the application. Commissioners reviewed both versions but had questions about the feasibility of both and the proposed cap along the wall. Commissioners agreed that not enough information had been presented to make a decision on the application.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to declare the application incomplete and return it to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee for another review. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

Vote: 1701 S. Newport Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Parker			Grant
2. Sanders			
3. Ellington			
4. Bumgarner			
5. Evans			
6. McKee			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on a staff-approved historic preservation permit:

a. **1624 S. Troost Ave. (HP-0424-2023)**

Removal of non-historic siding

Repair and replacement in-kind of original siding with matching exposure

2. Chair Report

Commissioner Parker selected committees for the 2023 calendar year.

Historic Preservation Committee / Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

Mark Sanders (Chair)

Royce Ellington

Katelyn Parker

James Turner

Geoffery Evans (Alternate)

Rules and Regulations Committee

Mary Lee Townsend (Chair)

Chris Bumgarner

Susan McKee

Outreach Committee

James Turner (Chair)

Royce Ellington

Peter Grant

Susan McKee

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Parker adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:13 P.M.