



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, January 24, 2023, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor, South Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Turner called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:36 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

James Turner, AIA, Interim Chair  
Katelyn Parker, RA, Interim Vice-Chair  
Chris Bumgarner  
Royce Ellington  
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS  
Susan McKee, MFA

#### **Members Absent**

Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA  
Mark Sanders  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

#### **Staff Present**

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank, Jeremy Banes

#### **Others Present**

Ted A. Reeds II, John Spillyards, Stephanie Madsen, Michael Madsen, Nate Moseley, Dariela Gonzalez, Dennis Barlow

#### 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 8, 2022

Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on December 8, 2022. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and passed with a majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 8, 2022

#### **In Favor**

1. Bumgarner
2. McKee
3. Parker
4. Turner

#### **Opposed**

#### **Abstaining**

Ellington  
Grant

#### **Not Present**

Evans  
Sanders  
Townsend

#### 3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Parker disclosed that she had a conflict of interest as the architect for HP-0418-2023 at 1132 East 20<sup>th</sup> Street and that she would recuse herself during discussion and voting on that item.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0412-2022 / 1528 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 1, 2022*

Applicant: Nathan Moseley

Proposal:

- 1. Replacement of windows

*Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit*

*Application to amend HP-0395-2022 denied by Tulsa Preservation Commission on October 25, 2022*

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. As amended, the current proposal was to install double-hung windows on the east façade only and to retain the single-hung windows elsewhere, which had been previously installed. Commissioner Ellington reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application with the exception of muntins. The applicant replied that he had used the windows on a neighboring house as the basis for the proposed muntins.

Commissioner Turner asked if the windows had all been installed within the existing openings, and Mr. Moseley confirmed that they had. Commissioner Parker expressed a preference for not including muntins on the proposed windows.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that no muntins be included. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7, A.4.8

**Vote: 1528 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

**In Favor**

- 1. Bumgarner
- 2. Ellington
- 3. Grant
- 4. McKee
- 5. Parker
- 6. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

- Evans
- Sanders
- Townsend

2. **HP-0414-2022 / 1701 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 5, 2023*

Applicant: Nate Greving

Proposal:

- 1. Installation of solar panels on south and east sides of residence

Staff presented its report, noting that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had forwarded the application without recommendation and had suggested removing the solar panels on the east side and placing them on the accessory building instead. The applicant was not present. Commissioner Parker reported that the subcommittee had agreed that the panels on the east side of the roof would be visible but that, because of the slope of the roof, panels on the south side might be acceptable. Commissioner Turner gave his opinion that visible solar panels were not appropriate on an historic home and referenced Guideline A.7.6. Commissioner Bumgarner

agreed that the Unified Design Guidelines should be adhered to. Commissioner Grant stated that a Tesla solar roof system had been approved on a nearby house and could be an appropriate alternative to solar panels. Commissioner Parker expressed approval for installing solar panels on the south side of the roof because the house was located on a corner lot with visibility on all sides, the south facing roof was the least prominent, and she did not believe the panels would be visible from the street due to the slope of the roof. Commissioner Grant emphasized the importance of staying consistent with previous decisions on solar panels, and Commissioner Turner recalled a project in the Gillette Historic District in which solar panels on a side roof were denied because they would be visible from the street. Commissioner Bumgarner noted that Guideline A.7.6 allows review of solar panels on a case-by-case basis. Commissioner Turner pointed out that the panels would project some from the roof, and Commissioner Grant stated that the proposed panels had a low profile. Commissioner Parker again emphasized that she did not believe the panels would be apparent from the street because of the low slope of the roof. John Spillyards, neighborhood representative for North Maple Ridge, stated that he had spoken with the owner about the project and believed they would be open to excluding the panels on the east side of the roof.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to deny the installation of solar panels as proposed. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and failed without a majority.

**Vote #1: 1701 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	Bumgarner		Evans
2. McKee	Ellington		Sanders
3. Turner	Parker		Townsend

Commissioners discussed aspects of allowing solar panels only on the south side of the roof where they would not be visible from the street. Commissioner Bumgarner stated that the proposed panels on only the south side of the roof were consistent with Guideline A.7.6 because they would have minimal visual impact from the street.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that

- solar panels be installed only on the south side of the roof of the house because they will have minimal visual impact from the street;
- the panels be mounted parallel to the roof;
- the panels, once mounted, do not exceed six inches (0'-6") from the plane of the roof;
- the panels not be visible from the street; and
- no panels be installed on the east side of the roof of the house because they would be visible from the street.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed with a majority.

**Vote #2: 1701 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bumgarner	Turner		Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Grant			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			

Guideline cited: A.7.6

**3. HP-0417-2023 / 1701 S. Newport Ave. (North Maple Ridge)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 17, 2023*

Applicants: Connor & Madeleine Hasbrook

Proposals:

1. Construction of retaining wall
2. Construction of fence and gate

At the request of the applicant, who was unable to be present, the review of the application was postponed until the next regular meeting on February 9, 2023.

**4. HP-0418-2023 / 1132 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 17, 2023*

Applicant: Stephanie Madsen

Proposals:

1. Removal of chimney on east side of residence
2. Construction of addition on east side of residence
3. Construction of rail atop porte-cochere on west side of residence

Because of Commissioner Parker's recusal there would not be a quorum for this item, so the applicants agreed to postpone the review of the application until the next regular meeting on February 9, 2023.

**5. HP-0419-2023 / 1612 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 17, 2023*

Applicant: Dariela Gonzalez

Proposals:

1. Replacement of rafter rails, soffit, and fascia
2. Replacement of vent in gable
3. Reconstruction of damaged elements on porch
4. Replacement of windows on east façade
5. Replacement of door and hardware on east façade
6. Replacement of trim around door and windows
7. Replacement of siding
8. Replacement of light fixtures on porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the elements proposed for replacement had been damaged in a fire. Commissioner Ellington reported that the applicant intended to return the front façade to its previous appearance, so the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval. Ted Reeds, who had been present at the subcommittee review, agreed. The applicant, Dariela Gonzalez, requested leaving some cedar elements, like the vent and brackets, unpainted. Commissioners discussed that painting the elements would be more historically

appropriate but that there were no requirements concerning paint color. Commissioner Grant stated the requested wood elements would be acceptable as long as the cedar had a smooth rather than rough texture. Commissioner Turner encouraged the applicant to remove the existing asbestos siding and repair the original wood siding underneath, but Ms. Gonzalez stated that her insurance company required all materials to be replaced in-kind.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application as presented with the condition that no rough cedar be used for the wood elements. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

**Vote: 1612 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bumgarner			Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Grant			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Turner			

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.2.5, A.3.1, A.3.3, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.8, A.3.9, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.8, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4

6. **HP-0415-2022 / 1508 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 5, 2023*

Applicant: Christian Vaughan

Proposal:

1. Construction of carport on east side of residence

Staff presented its report, noting that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had forwarded the application without recommendation and with several suggestions for revisions. The applicant was not present. Commissioner Parker stated that the subcommittee recommended exposing the timbering to make the carport appear like a pergola and that the applicant had mentioned an issue with the location of the neighbor's fence that would prevent him from recessing the carport further. Commissioner Grant questioned whether any other houses on the street also had carports. Commissioners discussed that the carport being attached to the house created the impression that it was a part of the historical structure, and Commissioner Parker expressed disappointment that the revisions requested by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had not been made. Commissioner Turner expressed a willingness to support the project if the footprint of the carport were moved back so that the rear of the carport was in line with the rear of the new addition but could not support the project as presented.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and passed unanimously.

**Vote: 1508 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bumgarner			Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Grant			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Turner			

Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.2.3, B.2.4, B.2.5, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, B.6.1, B.6.2, B.6.3

**7. HP-0416-2023 / 715 N. Denver Ave. (The Heights/Brady Heights)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Applicant: Austin Broach-Casey

Proposal:

1. Replacement of fence within street yard

*Project completed without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report. The applicant was not present. Commissioners discussed the fence as installed. Upon examination of images of the fence submitted with the application, Commissioner Parker noted that a chain link fence was still present along the north property line. Commissioner Grant indicated approval of the design of the new picket fence but stated that the existing chain link fence to the north should be replaced as well. Although the applicant would not be required to replace the existing chain link fence on the north side of the property, the commissioners agreed to suggest that the applicant do so.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application as presented with the suggestion that the applicant continue the picket fence along the north property line until it connects to the privacy fence. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

**Vote: 715 N. Denver Ave. (The Heights/Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bumgarner			Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Grant			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Turner			

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4

**8. Nomination and election of officers for the 2023 calendar year**

Commissioner Turner announced on behalf of the Nominating Committee the slate of officer candidates for the 2023 calendar year. Commissioner Parker had accepted a nomination as Chair, Commissioner Sanders as Vice-Chair, and Commissioner Ellington as Secretary. Commissioner Turner then invited additional nominations, and, as no nominations were presented, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to

approve the nominations and elect officers for the 2023 calendar year. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and passed unanimously.

**Vote: Nomination and election of officers for the 2023 calendar year**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bumgarner			Evans
2. Ellington			Sanders
3. Grant			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported that she had received an inquiry about the Isaiah 53 Church, formerly the Rentie Grove Baptist Church, located at 8350 South Harvard Avenue, and asked if any commissioners had information about the site. Ted Reeds stated that there was a cemetery adjacent to the church property. Commissioner Grant recalled speaking with the owner at some point about their interest in pursuing a nomination of the building to the National Register of Historic Places.

Staff reported on a staff-approved historic preservation permit:

a. **1523 S. Madison Ave. (HP-0420-2023)**

Removal of non-historic siding

Repair and replacement in-kind of original siding with matching exposure

2. Chair Report

None

D. New Business

Commissioners asked staff for an update on commission vacancies. Staff stated that there were currently vacancies for the Allied Commissioner roles to be filled by the Arts Commission and the Planning Commission.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Ted Reeds, whose term on the planning commission and preservation commission had expired, thanked the preservation commission for the opportunity to serve and announced that he had begun teaching full-time at the University of Oklahoma. Commissioner Turner thanked Commissioner Reeds for his participation and active attendance at both planning commission and preservation commission meetings during his term.

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Commissioner Turner adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:55 P.M.