



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, December 8, 2022, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor, North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chair, Commissioner Parker called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:05 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Holly Becker, Vice-Chair  
Katelyn Parker, RA, Secretary  
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA  
Ted A. Reeds II, AIA  
Mark Sanders  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

#### **Members Absent**

James Turner, AIA, Chair  
Chris Bumgarner  
Royce Ellington  
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS  
Susan McKee, MFA

#### **Staff Present**

Felicity Good, Audrey Blank, Jeremy Banes

#### **Others Present**

John Spillyards, Christian Vaughan, Shari Tidwell, Taylor Tidwell

#### 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 22, 2022

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on November 22, 2022. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and passed unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 22, 2022

#### **In Favor**

1. Becker
2. Parker
3. Evans
4. Reeds
5. Sanders
6. Townsend

#### **Opposed**

#### **Abstaining**

#### **Not Present**

Turner  
Bumgarner  
Ellington  
Grant  
McKee

#### 3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0411-2022 / 1508 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 1, 2022*

Applicant: Christian Vaughan

Proposals:

1. Construction of addition on southwest side of residence
2. Construction of addition with carport on south and east sides of residence

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report, noting that the applicant was present and could answer questions. The applicant, Christian Vaughan, added that the gable roof on the east addition suggested by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee was not feasible, so the revised version submitted was slightly different from what was discussed at the subcommittee meeting. Commissioner Sanders reported that the subcommittee had expressed concerns about the roof lines previously proposed, and, although the applicant had been open to using a catslide to incorporate the carport into the residence, he had implemented the suggestion in a different way than what had been discussed. Commissioner Sanders reported that the subcommittee did not care for the stone wainscot on the west side that was previously proposed, so it had been removed from the proposal. The subcommittee forwarded the application to the preservation commission without revised plans because the applicant had been cooperative, had intended to follow their suggestions, and had expressed a preference not to further delay the project by postponing review to the next meeting in January. Commissioner Townsend expressed concern about the carport. Commissioner Parker acknowledged the challenges that led to the revisions and stated that the catslide over the carport looked better in elevation. Commissioner Reeds preferred that the carport have a single slope rather than a catslide and suggested that the carport appear like a pergola with exposed timbering. Commissioner Parker noted that the catslide had been recommended because the roof would be tied into it, but that was not the case in the current version. Commissioner Parker added that the carport had moved closer to the street than in the previous version reviewed by the subcommittee. Commissioner Sanders explained that the subcommittee had raised the same concerns about the carport, which is an unusual element on an historic home, and had discussed several options, including detaching the carport or attaching it to the detached accessory building in the rear yard. Commissioner Townsend stated that attaching the carport to the detached garage would minimize the open space in the rear yard, and Mr. Vaughan agreed that it would not be feasible. Commissioner Reeds again expressed a preference for a carport with a simple slope, solid beams, and open trusses. Commissioner Parker suggested referring the application back to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Reeds indicated approval of the remaining proposals in the application but stated that the carport takes away from the front elevation because of its massing and prominence. Commissioner Parker agreed that the carport would be the most visible element in the addition. Commissioner Reeds asked the applicant if he would be willing to work on a new design for the carport, and Mr. Vaughan agreed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Evans made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the carport not be included. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.2.3, B.2.4, B.2.5, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, B.6.1, B.6.2, B.6.3, B.7.1, B.7.2, B.7.3, B.7.4

**Vote: 1508 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Becker			Turner
2. Parker			Bumgarner
3. Evans			Ellington
4. Reeds			Grant
5. Sanders			McKee
6. Townsend			

2. **HP-0413-2022 / 2212 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 1, 2022*

Applicant: Shari Tidwell

Proposals:

1. Construction of addition on south side of residence
2. Construction of fence within street yard

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant was present and could answer questions. The applicant's daughter, Taylor Tidwell, stated that the neighbor's fence, which had been used as an example, was four feet (4'-0") tall with brick piers fifty-eight inches (4'-10") tall, so they were proposing that the fence be four feet (4'-0") tall. Commissioner Sanders reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's main concern had been the match of the bricks and had not favored the previously proposed option incorporating board and batten siding on the east side of the addition. The subcommittee had suggested adding a window to the east façade, and the applicant had complied with the suggestion. Commissioner Sanders then asked for clarification about how the brick would be mixed in on the east facade, and Taylor Tidwell stated that as many bricks as possible would be reclaimed from the rear of the residence. Commissioner Sanders stated that the expectation would be that only as many new bricks as are needed should be used. Commissioner Parker stated that the bricks were a relatively good match to the existing masonry, and Commissioner Reeds stated that the most important factor would be to match the color of the existing mortar. Commissioner Becker asked the commissioners which fence design was preferred. Commissioner Parker expressed a preference for the design with spikes (finials). Commissioners Evans and Reeds agreed. Commissioner Evans asked about the manufacturer, and the applicant confirmed the fence would be manufactured by Ameristar.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the fence design with spikes (finials) be used. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.2.3, B.2.4, B.2.5, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, B.7.1, B.7.2, B.7.3, B.7.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.1.5

**Vote: 2212 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Becker			Turner
2. Parker			Bumgarner
3. Evans			Ellington
4. Reeds			Grant
5. Sanders			McKee
6. Townsend			

3. **HP-0412-2022 / 1528 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)**  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 1, 2022*  
Applicant: Nathan Moseley  
Proposal:  
1. Replacement of windows  
*Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit*  
*Application to amend HP-0395-2022 denied by Tulsa Preservation Commission on October 25, 2022*

At the request of the applicant, who was unable to be present, the review of the application was postponed until the next regular meeting on January 12, 2023.

4. **Nomination and Election of Officers for the 2023 calendar year**

Commissioner Becker announced her resignation from both the Arts Commission and the Preservation Commission due to aha pausing operations. As no other members of the nominating committee were present, Commissioner Sanders moved to elect Commissioner Turner as interim chair and Commissioner Parker as interim vice-chair until the nominating committee could present a slate of candidates. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and passed unanimously.

**Vote: Nomination and Election of Interim Chair and Vice-Chair**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Becker			Turner
2. Parker			Bumgarner
3. Evans			Ellington
4. Reeds			Grant
5. Sanders			McKee
6. Townsend			

C. Reports

1. Staff Report  
Staff reported on activity at 1605 South Detroit Avenue and 715 North Denver Avenue. Staff reported on the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay District. Staff reported on updates to the website of the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Finally, staff announced that the Annual Retreat would be held on January 7, 2023, and collected requests for discussion items to be included in the agenda.
2. Chair Report  
None

D. New Business  
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None

F. Public Comment  
None

G. Adjournment  
Commissioner Parker adjourned the Regular Meeting at 11:57 A.M.