



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, November 10, 2022, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor, North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Turner called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:04 A.M.

Members Present

James Turner, AIA, Chair
Katelyn Parker, RA, Secretary
Royce Ellington*
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Susan McKee, MFA
Mark Sanders
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

Members Absent

Holly Becker, Vice-Chair
Chris Bumgarner
Geoffery Evans, PLA, ASLA
Ted A. Reeds II, AIA

Staff Present

Felicity Good, Robi Jones, Audrey Blank

Others Present

Bhadri Verduzco, John Spillyards, Bob Johnson

*Late Arrival

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, October 25, 2022

Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting on October 25, 2022. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, October 25, 2022

In Favor

1. Turner
2. Parker
3. Grant
4. McKee
5. Sanders
6. Townsend

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Becker
Bumgarner
Ellington
Evans
Reeds

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0405-2022 / 1747 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Bhadri Verduzco

Proposal:

1. Construction of retaining wall

Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff directed commissioners' attention to Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report, noting that the applicant was present and could answer questions. Commissioner Turner pointed out that the other retaining walls in the area that were noted in the applicant's proposal, except for the wall at 1343 East 19th Street, were completed before the regulations in the Unified Design Guidelines changed to exclude segmental retaining walls. Commissioner Sanders verified with staff that the application had not gone before the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. He went on explain that the material, segmental concrete blocks, are not permitted under guideline G.1.5, which states:

Use wall materials that are consistent with the historic walls found along the same street and within the district. Cinder block, segmental retaining wall systems, corrugated metal, and railroad ties are not allowed. Historically styled cast concrete block will be considered on a case-by-case basis.

Commission Sanders explained to the applicant that they were aware of other similar retaining walls in the Swan Lake Historic District, but those walls were either completed before 2017, when the Unified Design Guidelines were adopted, or they were completed without a permit. The applicant stated that he had not been aware of the historic preservation permit requirement and noted that cost and aesthetics had been factors in his selection of the material. Commissioner Parker acknowledged the applicant's situation and stated that the wall was an improvement over the railroad ties, which had previously been present. Commissioner Turner explained that the split-faced blocks were not allowed by the guidelines because they were not visually similar to historic walls. There was some discussion among the commissioners and the applicant as to what type of materials would be appropriate, including rock-face block veneer, tumbled blocks of different sizes, poured concrete, masonry, and natural stone. The applicant was encouraged to return with an amended application.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Sanders made a motion to deny the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and passed with a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.1.5

Vote: 1747 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

In Favor

1. Turner
2. Grant
3. McKee
4. Sanders
5. Townsend

Opposed

1. Parker

Abstaining

1. Ellington

Not Present

Becker
Bumgarner
Evans
Reeds

2. **HP-0407-2022 / 1616 S. Quincy Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Eagle Eye Construction

Proposals:

1. Replacement and expansion of driveway
2. Replacement of retaining wall blocks with concrete curb along south side of driveway

Project completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant's representative, Brad Banks, was not present. Commissioners Turner and Ellington both stated that the new retaining wall was very similar to the original retaining wall as illustrated in the survey photo from 1995. Commissioner Sanders noted that the twelve-foot (12'-0") width of the driveway was slightly large for the neighborhood but felt the site was an exception because the house was located on a double lot and the driveway would not interrupt the rhythm of other driveways along the street. Commissioners Ellington and Grant agreed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and passed unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.1.5, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3, G.2.4

Vote: 1616 S. Quincy Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Turner			Becker
2. Parker			Bumgarner
3. Ellington			Evans
4. Grant			Reeds
5. McKee			
6. Sanders			
7. Townsend			

C. Discussion

1. City Council November 2, 2022, hearing and decision on the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay and possible ways to improve outreach and education regarding the Tulsa Preservation Commission's procedures

Staff informed the commissioners that the Tulsa City Council had approved the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay excluding the property that contained Tracy Park. Staff stated that the city council had then directed staff to propose amendments to the Unified Design Guidelines and return in six months for them to reconsider the inclusion of the park in the overlay. Commissioner McKee, who had requested the discussion item be added to the agenda, expressed disappointment in misinformation about the preservation commission's process and expertise that had been spread during the city council meeting and suggested engaging with the city council to give a presentation about the commission's roles and processes. In response to questions from commissioners, legal staff explained the city council's procedures for voting on

zoning map amendments. Commissioner Turner requested that staff clarify what would be required for the preservation commission to pursue the inclusion of the park in the historic preservation overlay, and staff stated they would get more information. Commissioner Sanders stated he felt confident that most councilors understood the role of the commissioner and were willing to consider the inclusion of the park in the overlay if changes to the Unified Design Guidelines were made. Commissioner Sanders suggested creating a separate set of guidelines for public spaces and noted the importance of working with the Parks department to do so. Commissioners further discussed possible scenarios for engaging with city councilors moving forward.

D. Reports

1. Staff Report

Staff reported on projects completed without historic preservation permits at 1571 East 19th Street and 1839 East 17th Street.

2. Chair Report

1. Formation of nominating committee for 2023 officer elections

Commissioner Turner formed the nominating committee for the election of officers for the 2023 calendar year. The nominating committee will comprise Commissioners Turner, Becker, and McKee.

E. New Business

None

F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Townsend asked about scheduling the commission's Annual Retreat, and January 7, 2022, was mentioned as a possible date. Staff will follow up via email to gather availability from commissioners.

Commissioner Ellington inquired about the Tulsa Skyride, and Commissioner Turner stated that he had seen some news reports that covered the preservation commission's letter to the Tulsa County Public Facilities Authority.

G. Public Comment

John Spillyards and Bob Johnson commented on the Tracy Park Historic Preservation Overlay, noting that the park property could be leased and that the repair of the fountain would not be as expensive as that in Swan Lake Park.

H. Adjournment

Commissioner Turner adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:06 P.M.