



## TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, February 22, 2022, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

#### A. Opening Matters

##### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Turner called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:33 P.M. Due to a conflict with the schedule in the North Conference Room, Commissioner Turner called a recess and continued the Regular Meeting in the South Conference Room. Commissioner Turner ended the recess and again called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:35 P.M.

##### **Members Present**

James E. Turner, AIA, Chair  
Holly Becker, Vice-Chair\*  
Katelyn C. Parker, RA, Secretary  
Royce Ellington  
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS  
Susan J. McKee, MFA  
Mark D. G. Sanders  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.

##### **Members Absent**

Chris J. Bumgarner  
Ted A. Reeds II, AIA  
Robert L. Shears, ASLA

##### **Staff Present**

Audrey D. Blank, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

##### **Others Present**

Shari Tidwell, Kurt Barron, Lesli E. Augsburger, Stephen F. Beck

\*Late Arrival

##### 2. Approval of Minutes – Special Meeting, January 25, 2022

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved with a majority.

**Vote:** Minutes – Special Meeting, January 25, 2022

##### **In Favor**

1. Parker
2. Ellington
3. Grant
4. McKee
5. Sanders
6. Townsend

##### **Opposed**

##### **Abstaining**

Turner

##### **Not Present**

Becker  
Bumgarner  
Reeds  
Shears

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
None

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0339-2022 / 1131 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St.** (North Maple Ridge)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 15, 2022*  
Applicant: Lesli E. Augsburger  
Proposals:  
1. Installation of gate at entry to walkway  
2. Installation of gate at entry to driveway  
3. Replacement of doors in Sunroom\*  
*\*Project completed without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff recited Section 70.070-F of the Tulsa Zoning Code and afterwards presented its report. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee posed questions regarding the design of the gate and the replacement of doors with windows but recommended approval of the application. Commissioner Parker inquired about the windows, and the applicant explained that they had divided lites with separate panes of glass within each section. Upon requests for clarification from Commissioner Turner, the applicant confirmed that the double rail of the gates would be present at the top but not the bottom and that a single gate would be placed at the driveway and at the walkway. Commissioner Grant inquired about the width of the gate at the entry to the walkway, and the applicant replied that it would be between three feet (3'-0") and four feet (4'-0") wide.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.7, A.3.8, A.3.9, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4

**Vote:** 1131 E. 18<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Turner			Bumgarner
2. Becker			Reeds
3. Parker			Shears
4. Ellington			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Sanders			
8. Townsend			

2. **HP-0341-2022 / 1701 S. Newport Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 15, 2022*  
Applicant: Barron and McClary General Contractors, Inc.  
Proposals:

1. Removal of windows on porch
2. Replacement of floor on porch
3. Installation of windows on west facade
4. Installation of siding on west facade

Staff presented its report, noting that the windows would be salvaged and placed on the wall parallel to their current position. Kurt Barron of Barron and McClary General Contractors explained that he had provided two elevations—one showing the three windows separated and the other showing the three windows mulled together. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application but had not been presented with an alternative proposal. Upon inquiries from Commissioner Turner, Mr. Barron stated that he believed the porch had originally been open and proposed that the brick on the west facade of the porch be removed to the level of the floor. Commissioner Turner suggested retention of the masonry and limestone sill. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Grant, Mr. Barron confirmed that the floor of the now-enclosed area would be four-inch (0'-4") tongue-and-groove planks. Commissioner McKee inquired about a rail, and Mr. Barron replied that the floor of the porch was low enough that a rail would not be required. Commissioner Parker agreed that removal of the windows and retention of the masonry in its current location would be preferable to removal of part of the masonry. Commissioner Sanders questioned the retention of only three (3) of the four (4) windows. Commissioner Grant inquired about the distance between the floor and the sill, and Mr. Barron replied that the distance was thirty inches (2'-6"). Commissioner Parker expressed her doubt that the porch was originally open, but Mr. Barron explained that he had found evidence suggesting that the porch had been altered, although he assumed that the alteration had occurred soon after the residence was constructed. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Turner, Mr. Barron and Staff stated that they were unable to find any early photographs of the residence, and Mr. Barron indicated a readiness to accept suggestions for the treatment of the porch. Commissioner Turner explained that the Tulsa Preservation Commission would have concerns if the area under review were original, and Commissioner Becker noted that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had made its recommendation based on Mr. Barron's conclusion that the feature had originally been an open porch. Upon inquiries from Commissioner Grant, Mr. Barron stated that a crawl space was present under the enclosed portion of the residence but not under the porch in front of the entry. Commissioner Turner recommended further exploration of the feature before the Tulsa Preservation Commission's decision on the application, and Mr. Barron agreed to postpone the review. Staff agreed to schedule a Site Visit with Mr. Barron. Commissioner Sanders noted that several porches in the North Maple Ridge Historic Preservation Overlay District had been enclosed soon after their construction.

3. **HP-0342-2022 / 1808 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 15, 2022*

Applicant: Stephen F. Beck

Proposals:

1. Replacement of door
2. Replacement of columns
3. Construction of beam

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant explained his intent to remove the vinyl siding and restore the original siding. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had accepted the proposal for the columns but expressed concern about the proposal for the door. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the reason for the replacement of the door, noting that it appeared to be original, and the applicant responded that the owner was concerned about security. Commissioner Parker requested clarification about the beam and porch ceiling, and the applicant replied that a beam could be present under the siding and that the vinyl ceiling of the porch covered the rafters. Commissioner Turner expressed concern about the placement of the brackets, and Commissioner McKee suggested that a bracket be added at the center of the gable. The applicant explained that he had not explored conditions underneath the vinyl siding but could do so. Commissioner Sanders suggested replacement of the door but retention of the sidelites as a compromise, and the applicant stated that he would discuss the option with the owner. The applicant then agreed to postpone review to allow further exploration of the conditions on the porch and further consideration of the proposal to replace the door.

4. **HP-0345-2022 / 2211 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Shari Tidwell

Proposal:

1. Replacement of windows

*Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report, noting that the windows on the east facade had been repaired, that the windows on the south and west facades would be replaced with aluminum-clad wood windows, and that several had already been installed. The applicant explained that she did not realize an Historic Preservation Permit would be required to install windows which had been previously approved for installation on other residences. Staff directed the commissioners' attention to correspondence between the applicant and her contractor, who had indicated that the selected windows had been previously approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Parker, the applicant stated that the windows were in poor condition but that the windows on the residence had been repaired whenever feasible. Commissioner Grant inquired about the muntins, and Staff replied that the windows had simulated divided lites with muntins that were seven-eighths of an inch (0'-7/8") wide. Commissioner McKee inquired whether the windows would be double-hung, and Staff responded affirmatively, adding that the Window Survey Form had been included in the Staff Report. Upon inquiries from Commissioner Sanders, the applicant stated that the windows had been purchased but had not all of them had arrived. Commissioner Grant requested a description of the windows that had already been installed, and Staff replied that the muntins were visible and the windows appeared to be identical to others on the residence. Commissioner Turner expressed approval of the windows' appearance. Commissioner Sanders inquired whether all of the windows had been inspected, and the applicant

stated that they had been inspected and that the damage was so significant that each window would have to be entirely rebuilt, which would have increased cost significantly. The applicant added that the windows appeared to be nearly identical to the original windows. Commissioner Sanders emphasized the importance of the Tulsa Preservation Commission being able to review proposals before work is performed but conceded that, based on the applicant's description, the condition of the windows seemed to be poor enough to warrant their replacement. Commissioner Parker expressed appreciation for the applicant's attempt to restore the windows.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ellington and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6

**Vote: 2211 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

<b><u>In Favor</u></b>	<b><u>Opposed</u></b>	<b><u>Abstaining</u></b>	<b><u>Not Present</u></b>
1. Turner			Bumgarner
2. Becker			Reeds
3. Parker			Shears
4. Ellington			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Sanders			
8. Townsend			

5. **HP-0340-2022 / 1510 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl.** (Swan Lake)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 15, 2022*  
Applicant: Samantha McDaniel  
Proposal:  
1. Installation of solar photovoltaic system

Staff presented its report, and afterward Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee recommended approval of the solar panels in every proposed location except for the north side of the roof. Commissioner Parker noted that there appeared to be plenty of space on the south panel of the roof of the accessory building for additional solar panels.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the condition that no panels be installed on the north side of the roof of the residence. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.6

**Vote: 1510 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Turner			Bumgarner
2. Becker			Reeds
3. Parker			Shears
4. Ellington			
5. Grant			
6. McKee			
7. Sanders			
8. Townsend			

6. **HP-0344-2022 / 1571 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: February 15, 2022*

Applicant: ME Design

Proposals:

1. Replacement of roof on porch
2. Replacement of floor on porch
3. Construction of columns on porch

*Project initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report, and then Commissioners Turner, Parker, and Townsend commented on the appearance of the barrel vault. Commissioner Turner recommended widening the barrel vault so that its width matched that of the front door. Commissioner Becker reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had clearly expressed that the windows would need to be approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission as well and that the acceptance of the proposal was not unanimous. Staff added that the floor of the porch would be wood, and Commissioner Sanders observed that the floor would not be visible from the street due to the slope of the site. Commissioner Becker requested additional information about the floor, and, as the applicant was not present, Staff replied that the floor would be constructed from 1x4 tongue-and-groove planks extending perpendicularly from the facade of the residence. Commissioner Grant expressed disapproval of the barrel vault with the extended roof and indicated a preference for a flat roof, but Commissioner Turner pointed out that it was one of the few distinct features on the facade. Commissioner Sanders noted that the bay window was another distinct feature that was now obscured by the shed roof and added that he could not approve the proposal based on this alteration and the exclusion of the alterations to the windows from the application. Commissioner Townsend observed that the pitch of the roof seemed odd, and Commissioner Turner stated that it would be difficult to see in person because of the slope of the site. Commissioner Grant expressed his disapproval of the shed roof, and Commissioner Parker agreed and noted that porches are unusual for residences constructed in the Dutch Colonial Revival Style. Commissioner Townsend suggested postponement of the review to allow participation by the applicant. Commissioners then discussed several revisions, including changing the spacing of the columns, ensuring that the roof of the porch extended across the entire facade, and extending the eaves to retain the bay window and barrel vault rather than constructing a roof on the porch. The commissioners agreed that further consideration of alternative designs would be preferred and directed Staff to request additional information from the applicant.

- C. Review – Draft of Agenda for Annual Retreat  
Staff relayed a draft of the agenda for the Annual Retreat on Saturday, February 26, and invited suggestions for additional items. Commissioner Sanders requested that a discussion of regulations on demolition be added to the agenda. Commissioner Turner inquired about the status of a workshop on the repair of historic wooden windows, and Staff replied that a site had been proposed and that the workshop could possibly be held in May.
  
- D. Reports
  - 1. Chair Report  
None
  - 2. Staff Report  
Staff reported that the Tulsa Preservation Commission had received an invitation to appear on *Perspectives*, a weekly program aired by RSU Public TV. Staff reported that the City of Tulsa had been awarded \$15,750 in funds for the forthcoming year for its Certified Local Government Program.
  
- E. New Business  
None
  
- F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None
  
- G. Public Comment  
None
  
- H. Adjournment  
Commissioner Turner adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:24 P.M.