



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Tuesday, July 27, 2021, 4:30 P.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum
Commissioner Townsend called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 P.M.

Members Present

Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Chair
James E. Turner, AIA, Vice-Chair
Susan J. McKee, MFA, Secretary
Holly Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner*
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
Mark D. G. Sanders*

Members Absent

Jillian Ihloff
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Robert L. Shears, ASLA

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity Good

Others Present

Kristine Stevens

*Late Arrival

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, July 8, 2021
Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, July 8, 2021

In Favor

1. Townsend
2. Turner
3. McKee
4. Becker
5. Grant
6. Reeds

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Bumgarner
Ihloff
Parker
Sanders
Shears

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
None

B. Public Information Session

1. Section 106 Process – Demolition – 714 North Birmingham Place

In accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and its implementing regulations, 36 CFR Part 800, Staff presented information and invited public comment to address the determination of adverse effect of demolition on the residence located at 714 North Birmingham Place. Staff explained that the property was located in the Cherokee Hills Historic District, which has been determined to be eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places. Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds administered by the Working in Neighborhoods Department would be used for the demolition of the residence. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the ownership of the property and the owner's plans for the property, and staff replied that the property is privately owned but unoccupied and that no proposal for its replacement had been made. Commissioners discussed whether public funds could be used to prevent demolition of residences, and staff explained that CDBG funds are available for rehabilitation, demolition, or acquisition of residences and that the Working in Neighborhoods Department does attempt to engage owners to encourage rehabilitation when possible. Commissioner Townsend requested that staff relay the comment that commissioners wish public funds to be used for the rehabilitation or relocation of historic structures rather than their demolition. Upon a request for clarification from Commissioner Sanders, staff explained that CDBG funds are used for demolitions throughout the City of Tulsa, not just in districts included in or eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places and that the Section 106 Process is not engaged unless funds from the Federal Government would be used for the project. Staff added that the mitigation of the adverse effect would probably be further documentation of the Cherokee Hills Historic District.

C. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0291-2021 / 1220 E. 17th Pl.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 20, 2021

Applicant: Kristine D. Stevens

Proposal:

1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, and afterwards Commissioner Turner reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had focused its discussion on the east facade and the request to add windows on the second story had been fulfilled. Commissioner Sanders indicated a preference to install windows salvaged from the south facade on the first story of the east facade, and the applicant replied that, if the windows cannot be salvaged, then metal-clad wooden windows matching the dimensions and muntins of the windows presently on the residence would be used. Commissioners Sanders, Reeds, and Townsend expressed approval of the proposal.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1220 E. 17th Pl. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend			Ihloff
2. Turner			Parker
3. McKee			Shears
4. Becker			
5. Bumgarner			
6. Grant			
7. Reeds			
8. Sanders			

2. **HP-0292-2021 / 1110 E. 20th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 20, 2021

Applicant: Stacey R. and Eric B. Woolley

Proposal:

1. Replacement of siding with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding

Staff presented its report, noting that HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding had previously been installed on the addition with approval by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner reported that, although the thickness of HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding differs from that of the original wood siding and the repair of the original siding would be preferable, the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application because of the previous approval of HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding on the addition to the residence. Upon a request for clarification from Commissioner Sanders, staff stated that the owners' objective would be the match of the exposure of the original siding. Commissioner Grant expressed concern that the change in profile of the siding would leave gaps around the window frames and noted that the damage from the leaking gutters was not a compelling reason to replace the siding on the entire residence. Commissioner Turner agreed, noting that repair and replacement in kind of the damaged siding as-needed would be more cost effective than replacing the siding on the entire residence. Commissioner Reeds observed a visible difference between the HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding on the addition and the original wood siding. Commissioner Sanders commented that, although he voted to recommend approval of the application during the review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, after visiting the site he determined that he could no longer support the proposal. Commissioner Turner agreed that the replacement of the siding would not be preferable. Commissioner Townsend stated that, upon visiting the site, she did not notice a substantial difference between the siding on the residence and on its addition, and Commissioner Turner agreed that the difference was subtle. Commissioner Reeds expressed support for the application based on the previous approval of HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding on the addition to the residence. Commissioner Bumgarner observed that the difference between the two materials would not be immediately apparent and noted that the residence was a Non-Contributing Resource.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application with a comment that the Tulsa Preservation Commission encouraged the applicants to investigate further the options for repair and replacement in kind of the siding. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved with a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1110 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Townsend	McKee		Ihloff
2. Turner	Sanders		Parker
3. Becker			Shears
4. Bumgarner			
5. Grant			
6. Reeds			

D. Reports

1. Chair Report

None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on work in progress on The Joinery, located at 640 North Denver Avenue. Staff reported on work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit on the residences located at 715 North Denver Avenue and 819 North Cheyenne Avenue. Staff reported on work in progress at 1104 North Cheyenne Avenue for which an Historic Preservation Permit had been issued by the staff. Several features, including the original windows, have been repaired and replaced in kind. Staff reported on the alteration of an Approved Proposal at 1607 South Trenton Avenue.

E. New Business

Commissioner Townsend inquired about alterations to the porch at 231 East 18th Street. Staff will issue a Letter of Notification and, if necessary, contact the Working in Neighborhoods Department. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the status of research regarding regulations concerning accessory structures and procedures for demolition. Staff replied that a Request for Proposals could be pursued with the Certified Local Government Program funds for the forthcoming fiscal year.

F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Turner announced that the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture has resumed its tours on the second Saturday of each month.

G. Public Comment

None

H. Adjournment

Commissioner Townsend adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:21 P.M.