

#### **TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Tuesday, November 24, 2020, 4:30 P.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

# A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:32 P.M.

# **Members Present**

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair Holly Becker<sup>1</sup> Chris J. Bumgarner<sup>4</sup> Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA Mark D. G. Sanders Robert L. Shears, ASLA<sup>2</sup> James E. Turner, AIA

#### **Members Absent**

Joy Jones, Secretary Susan J. McKee, MFA Katelyn C. Parker, RA

# **Staff Present**

Audrey D. Blank<sup>3</sup>, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

#### **Others Present**

Tyler S. Suder<sup>3</sup>, Lesli L. and Cody D. Dinsmore<sup>3</sup>, Alex Moore<sup>3</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Participation via Remote Access from 101 East Archer Street
- <sup>2</sup> Participation via Remote Access from 1522 South Carson Avenue
- <sup>3</sup> Participation via Remote Access
- <sup>4</sup> Late Arrival
- 2. Approval of Minutes Regular Meeting, November 12, 2020 Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 12, 2020

<u>In Favor</u>		<b>Opposed</b>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1.	Grant			Jones
2.	Townsend			Bumgarner
3.	Becker			McKee
4.	Reeds			Parker
5.	Sanders			
6.	Shears			
7.	Turner			

 Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

#### B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0228-2020 / 1628 S. Troost Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: October 20, 2020,

November 17, 2020 Applicant: Tyler S. Suder

Proposals:

- 1. Replacement of columns on porch
- 2. Replacement of rail on porch
- 3. Installation of shingles in gable of porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the columns shown in the photograph of the residence dated 1995 were square but later replaced with round columns, which were subsequently replaced with the columns presently on the porch. Commissioner Townsend reported that the applicant had agreed to extend the height of the beam, adjust the proportions of the columns, and alter the dimensions of the rail during the review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Townsend noted, however, that the space between each baluster appeared to be larger than the distance previously reviewed. Commissioner Turner complimented the proposal but agreed that the space between each baluster should be four inches (0'-4") or less. Commissioner Sanders agreed, recalling that the subcommittee had recommended matching the dimensions of the rail at 1510 East 17th Place. Upon a request from Commissioner Townsend, Staff displayed photographs of the rail on the residence located at 1510 East 17<sup>th</sup> Place. Commissioner Turner noted that the cap of the rail in the proposal should be larger as well. Commissioner Reeds agreed that the dimensions of the rail should match those of the rail at 1510 East 17th Place and inquired whether the applicant would be prepared to adjust the dimension. The applicant accepted the proposal. Commissioner Shears inquired about the material of the piers, noting that they would typically be constructed with masonry, and the applicant replied that the material would be plywood. Commissioner Townsend recalled that the material of the piers had been discussed during the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee's review of the application and noted that the applicant had preferred wood but would consider masonry in the future. Commissioner Shears observed that plywood was an unusual material for the style of columns and expressed disapproval. Commissioner Turner agreed that masonry would be preferable but expressed his approval for the application as presented. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired whether the columns would be painted, and the applicant answered affirmatively.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application as submitted with the condition that the rail match that on the residence located at 1510 East 17<sup>th</sup> Place. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved by a majority.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4, A.6.5

Vote: 1628 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>		<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1.	Grant	Shears		Jones
2.	Townsend			McKee
3.	Becker			Parker
4	D			

- 4. Bumgarner
- 5. Reeds
- 6. Sanders
- 7. Turner

# 2. **HP-0232-2020 / 824 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicants: Lesli L. and Cody D. Dinsmore Proposal:

1. Substitution of masonry for stucco on facades
Application to amend previous approval of application by Tulsa Preservation
Commission on July 9, 2020

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicants had expressed a desire for their residence to be compatible with other residences in the Brady Heights Historic District. Staff shared photographs of residences with similar treatments of masonry for piers, which had been provided by the applicants. Commissioner Townsend complimented the applicants on their active participation in the review and reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had approved of the proposal for the piers constructed with masonry. Commissioner Townsend reported that the applicants and subcommittee had agreed that the front and sides of the porch should be covered in unpainted, rubbed concrete with a trim board. Commissioner Sanders observed that the brick in the photograph appeared to be a paving brick and did not show the side that would be exposed, and the applicants replied that the photograph was meant to be an example of the color and style of the brick to be used. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether a standard size brick would be used, and the applicants confirmed that it would.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 824 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>		<b>Opposed</b>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1.	Grant			Jones
2.	Townsend			McKee
3.	Becker			Parker
4.	Bumgarner			
5.	Reeds			
6.	Sanders			
7.	Shears			
8.	Turner			

#### 3. **HP-0234-2020 / 1145 E. 16th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Chris Gausvik

Proposal:

1. Replacement of mailbox

Staff presented its report, noting that the mailbox would be larger than the present mailbox and would be fitted with a lock. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1145 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>		<b>Opposed</b>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1.	Grant			Jones
2.	Townsend			McKee
3.	Becker			Parker
4.	Bumgarner			
5.	Reeds			

# C. Reports

1. Chair Report None

6. Sanders7. Shears8. Turner

#### 2. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit at 630 North Cheyenne Avenue. The Owner has ceased activity and responded to the Letter of Notification with an application for an Historic Preservation Permit.

Staff reported on Work initiated without an Historic Preservation Permit at 1624 South Owasso Avenue. Staff conducted a Site Visit and delivered a Letter of Notification, an Application Form, and a copy of the Unified Design Guidelines.

#### D. New Business

Commissioner Reeds noted that the annual holiday party would not be held due to concern about COVID-19. Commissioner Sanders requested information regarding the standard of review for nominations for the National Register of Historic Places. Staff provided guidance, noting attention to the statement of significance and integrity of the resource. Legal Staff recommended that the item be added to the agenda for a future Regular Meeting if it were to be discussed further.

# E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items None

#### F. Public Comment

Alex Moore provided public comment via the Chat Room on GoToMeeting, requesting that the Tulsa Preservation Commission discuss the Tulsa Association of Pioneers Monument at a future Regular Meeting. No other comments were recorded.

### G. Adjournment

Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:10 P.M.