

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES Thursday, July 28, 4:30 P.M. City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street 10th Floor - North Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
 - Call to Order and Verification of Quorum Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:41 P.M. As permitted by the temporary amendment of the Open Meeting Act, the Regular Meeting was conducted as a videoconference due to the concern about COVID-19.

Members Present

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair* Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair* Holly Becker* Chris J. Bumgarner* Susan J. McKee, MFA* Katelyn C. Parker, RA* Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA** David W. Schoell, P.E., S.E.** Robert L. Shears, ASLA* James E. Turner, AIA* Members Absent

Joy Jones, Secretary

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank*, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr.**, Felicity O. Good**

Others Present

Amanda Howell*, Jenna Bromley*, Matthew D. McAfee*, Chris Gausvik*, Charles D. Higgins*, Mark D. G. Sanders*, David Connolly*, Janice Connolly*

- * Participation via Remote Access
- ** Attendance in North Conference Room
- Approval of Minutes Regular Meeting, July 9, 2020 Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: Minutes - Regular Meeting, July 9, 2020

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	Abstaining	Not Present
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			

- 5. McKee
- 6. Parker
- 7. Reeds
- 8. Schoell
- 9. Shears
- 10. Turner
- Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. HP-0196-2020 / 1720 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: July 2, 2020; July 21, 2020
Applicant: Atlas Homes, LLC
Proposal:

Reconstruction of porch on south side of residence

Application to amend previous approval of application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on December 12, 2019

Staff presented its report, noting that the Product Data for the lonic columns had only just become available and that the planks on the floor of the porch would extend from east to west. Commissioner Townsend reported that, according to the applicant, the doors previously installed on the residence would be repaired and installed and there would be no stucco on the stem wall. Commissioner Grant requested information on the slope of the roof, and the applicant's representative, Amanda Howell, replied that the roof would be constructed to match the former roof. Commissioner Parker noted that the roof would have a slight slope but should appear flat from the street. Commissioner Turner emphasized the importance of matching the former porch exactly, including details such as the beam, gutters, and projection of the eaves.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1720 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

In Favor

<u>Opposed</u>

Abstaining

Not Present Jones

- Grant
 Townsend
- 3. Becker
- 4. Bumgarner
- 5. McKee
- 6. Parker
- 7. Reeds
- 8. Schoell
- 9. Shears
- 10. Turner

2. HP-0201-2020 / 1720 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas Proposal:

1. Relocation of meter

Staff presented its report, noting that the meter would be relocated to the north side of the residence and would be visible only in profile. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.7.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1720 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u> 1. Grant	<u>Opposed</u>	Abstaining	<u>Not Present</u> Jones
2. Townsend			001100
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			
10. Turner			
HP-0198-2020 /	1202 E. 17 th P	I. (North Maple Ri	dge)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: July 2, 2020; July 21, 2020

Applicant: Mark D. G. Sanders Proposals:

- 1. Adjustment of width of driveway
- 2. Construction of wall

3.

Staff presented its report, describing two proposals submitted by the applicant and noting the applicant's preference for Proposal 2, which would widen the driveway near the northeast corner of the residence and conceal the expansion with vegetation. Commissioner Townsend reported that this proposal would not resolve the issue of vehicles entering the site from Owasso Avenue but noted that the treatment

of the landscape could alleviate the concern. The applicant expressed appreciation for the Tulsa Preservation Commission's recommendations and added that the preferred proposal would be compatible with the historic alignment of the driveway. According to the applicant, mature vegetation, including shrubs and a tree, would be installed along the driveway. Commissioner Grant inquired about the extent of the replacement, and the applicant replied that the entire length of the driveway would be replaced. Commissioner Grant recommended a clear delineation of the driveway's apron, and Commissioner Shears recommending tapering the curb until it is parallel with the sidewalk. Commissioner Shears expressed approval of the preferred proposal and inquired about the treatment of the retaining wall. As the applicant's connection to GoToMeeting was interrupted, staff responded that the preferred proposal involved removal of the retaining wall and grading the lawn.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the wall be removed and the lawn be graded to the driveway. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.5, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1202 E. 17th Pl. (North Maple Ridge)

In Favor Abstaining **Not Present Opposed** 1. Grant Jones 2. Townsend

- 3. Becker
- 4. Bumgarner
- 5. McKee
- 6. Parker
- 7. Reeds
- 8. Schoell
- 9. Shears
- 10. Turner

4. HP-0202-2020 / 1145 E. 16th St. (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Chris Gausvik Proposals:

- 1. Adjustment of width of driveway
- 2. Replacement of gate

Staff presented its report, noting that the proposed increase in the width of the driveway would ease access to the garage. According to the applicant, the gate would be fabricated to match the existing gate. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found the increase of the driveway's width from eight feet (8'-0") to twelve feet (12'-0") reasonable and noted that the driveway across the street was wider. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the gate would consist of two panels swinging inward, and the applicant answered affirmatively.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.4, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1202 E. 17th Pl. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	Abstaining	Not Present
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			
10. Turner			

5. HP-0170-2020 / 706 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: May 7, 2020; July 21, 2020 Applicant: Charles D. (Chas) Higgins

Proposal:

1. Construction of residence

Staff presented its report, noting the proposal to install Legacy 450 Series Vinyl Windows. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had requested additional information during its Regular Meeting on July 21. Commissioner Parker inquired about the profile of the windows, and staff responded only a section of the muntins had been provided. After discussion of the windows, the applicant agreed to install PlyGem 2000 Series Vinyl Windows with exterior muntins, as approved for the residence located at 824 North Cheyenne Avenue. Commissioner Townsend recited each request by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioners Reeds and Parker expressed approval of the roof's five-over-twelve (5/12) pitch, the eave's projection of two feet and six inches (2'-6"), and the enclosure of the deck with a soffit. Commissioner Parker found the door to be appropriate, and Commissioner Grant approved of the sconces. Commissioner Parker requested that the rail on the second-story balcony be adjusted to a height of three feet (3'-0"), and the applicant agreed. Commissioner Reeds noted that the proposed HardiePlank Lap Siding should have a smooth surface.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that

- the rough cedar of the rail be sanded smooth,
- PlyGem 2000 Series Vinyl Windows with exterior muntins matching those approved for the project at 824 North Cheyenne Avenue be installed,
- HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding be installed,
- the roof has a 5/12 pitch with eaves which project 2'-6", and
- the columns, including the base, cap, trim, and panels, match those shown in the illustration submitted.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 706 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

Opposed

In Favor 1. Grant

<u>Abstaining</u>

<u>Not Present</u> Jones

- 2. Townsend
- 3. Becker
- 4. Bumgarner
- 5. McKee
- 6. Parker
- 7. Reeds
- 8. Schoell
- 9. Shears
- 10. Turner

6. HP-0205-2020 / 1612 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Kathryn C. Jessogne Proposals:

- 1. Replacement of windows
- 2. Replacement of driveway

Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the new driveway matches or nearly matches the dimensions of the driveway formerly within the street yard. The section of the driveway behind the front facade of the residence is not subject to review by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. The applicant's representative, Jenna Bromley, added that they were not aware of the requirement of a Historic Preservation Permit for the replacement in kind of the windows and the driveway. Commissioner Grant inquired about a Site Plan with dimensions, and Ms. Bromley stated that the dimensions of the driveway between the facade and street had not been altered. However, the driveway was widened along the side of the residence to prevent infiltration of water into the basement. Commissioner Parker requested dimensions of the former and new driveways, and Ms. Bromley repeated her assurance that the width of the driveway between the street and the facade had not been changed but noted that two feet (2'-0") of width had been added at the northeast corner of the residence. Commissioner Parker observed that the curb cut appeared wider, but Ms. Bromley stated that it was not. Commissioner Grant agreed that the new driveway appeared wider, and Commissioner Parker expressed the necessity for a Site Plan.

Commissioner Grant then directed discussion to Item 1: Replacement of windows. Commissioner Schoell approved of the window selected as replacement and inquired whether the original windows had the same configuration. Commissioner Parker replied affirmatively, and Commissioner Grant agreed with Commissioner Schoell's expression of approval. Commissioner Parker remarked that the retention of the original windows would have been preferred, and Ms. Bromley apologized and emphasized that the prospective buyer requested that the windows be replaced. Commissioner Townsend directed discussion to the driveway, suggesting that its review be postponed to provide the applicant the opportunity to submit additional information. Commissioner Shears inquired about the retaining wall previously present on the site and was informed that its removal had been approved. Further review of the replacement of the driveway will be conducted by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee during its Regular Meeting on August 6, with the agreement of Ms. Bromley to the extension of the period of review.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve Item 1: Replacement of windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.4.6, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3

Vote: 1612 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	Opposed	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Shears			
10. Turner			
Reports			

- 1. Chair Report None
- 2. Staff Report

C.

Staff reported on Work completed at the residence located at 202 East 20th Street. During a Site Visit, staff observed that muntins had been installed on the exterior of the windows. Commissioner Turner inquired about the beam on the porch, and staff indicated that it was present and visible.

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at the residence located at 1819 East 17th Place. The owner agreed to remove the Trex Composite Decking and replace it with wooden tongue-and-groove planks.

- D. New Business None
- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items None
- F. Public Comment None
- G. Adjournment Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:17 P.M.