



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, July 9, 11:00 A.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Grant called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:00 A.M. As permitted by the temporary amendment of the Open Meeting Act, the Regular Meeting was conducted as a videoconference due to the concern about COVID-19.

Members Present

Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Chair*
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D., Vice-Chair*
Holly Becker*
Chris J. Bumgarner*
Susan J. McKee, MFA*
Katelyn C. Parker, RA*
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA**
David W. Schoell, P.E., S.E.**
James E. Turner, AIA*

Members Absent

Joy Jones, Secretary
Robert L. Shears, ASLA

Staff Present

Audrey D. Blank*, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr.** , Felicity O. Good**

Others Present

Brandon Jackson**, Antonio F. Massi*, Matthew D. McAfee*

* Participation via Remote Access

** Attendance in South Conference Room

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, June 23, 2020

Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, June 23, 2020

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant		Parker	Jones
2. Townsend			Shears
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Reeds			
7. Schoell			
8. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0196-2020 / 1720 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 2, 2020
Applicant: Atlas Homes, LLC
Proposals:
 1. Reconstruction of porch on south side of residence
 2. Replacement of door on south façade
 3. Replacement of door on east façade
 4. Construction of steps
 5. Installation of sconces*Application to amend previous approval of application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on December 12, 2019*

Staff presented its report, noting that the extension of the porch eastward was previously approved by the Tulsa Preservation Commission. According to the applicant, fluted Ionic columns were no longer available, and the Doric columns had been purchased. As the applicant was not present, Commissioner Townsend commented on the complexity of the project, noting that it was unclear whether the former porch had been original. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee found the proposals for the reconstruction of the porch and construction of the steps to be appropriate but did not discuss thoroughly the replacement of the doors. Commissioner Grant stated that the Craftsman Style front door did not fit the style of the residence and suggested a fifteen-lite door. Commissioner Parker requested information about the status of the former door, and Staff replied that, according to the applicant, it had been damaged. Commissioner Schoell commented that the upper two-thirds (2/3) of the original door contained twelve (12) panes and the lower one-third (1/3) contained a solid panel with a mail slot, adding that the retention of the original door would have been preferable. Commissioner Schoell expressed disapproval of the proposed front door and informed the commission that many front doors on residences on Madison Avenue were original and commonly contained from fifty percent (50%) to eighty percent (80%) glass. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the steps and bulkheads, and Commissioner Parker replied that they would be retained if possible. Commissioner Turner commented on the columns, noting that the fluted columns significantly contributed to the character of the residence. Commissioner McKee agreed with the comments about the door and columns.

Commissioner Townsend suggested a separate discussion of each item, and Commissioner Grant directed discussion to Item 1 - Reconstruction of the porch, noting that the roof should be relatively flat with a slight slope from the south side of the residence to the south side of the porch. Commissioner Parker expressed a need for more details regarding the reconstruction of the porch. Commissioners Grant and Schoell echoed Commissioner Parker's comment, noting the need for a detailed representation, including the expression of the beam and the projection of the eaves, and an indication of the treatment of the stem wall.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the proposal for Item 1 - Reconstruction of the porch on the south side of the residence and to request additional information. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.2, A.6.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1720 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Item 1: Reconstruction of porch on south side of residence

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Shears
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Turner			

Commissioner Grant then directed discussion to Item 2 - Replacement of the door on the south façade and Item 3 - Replacement of the door on the east façade. Commissioner Schoell indicated a preference for the retention or replication of the former door, and Commissioner Turner stated that the doors on the east and south façade should match. Commissioner Schoell expressed the need for Product Data. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Townsend, Commissioner Parker expressed approval of the hardware presented for both doors.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to deny the proposal for Item 2 - Replacement of the door on the south façade and Item 3 - Replacement of the door on the east façade and to request that the applicant select a door that more closely matches the original front door. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1720 S. Madison Ave. (**North Maple Ridge**)
Item 2: Replacement of door on south façade
Item 3: Replacement of door on east façade

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Shears
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Turner			

Commissioner Grant then directed attention to Item 4 - Construction of steps and Item 5 - Installation of sconces. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve Item 4 - Construction of steps and Item 5 - Installation of sconces. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1720 S. Madison Ave. (**North Maple Ridge**)
Item 4: Construction of steps and
Item 5: Installation of sconces

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Becker			Shears
3. Bumgarner			Townsend
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Schoell			
8. Turner			

2. **HP-0199-2020 / 824 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 2, 2020

Applicant: Brandon L. Jackson

Proposals:

1. On the first story of the north façade (right side), substitution of two separate windows for the pair of windows near the corner, substitution of four windows for the single window near the center, and substitution of three windows for the single window near the rear
2. On the first story of the south façade (left side), removal of one window and adjustment of the positions of two windows
3. On the second story of the south façade (left side), addition of two windows
4. On the first story of the west façade (rear), adjustment of the width of the Patio Door and addition of a door for entry to the Mud Room

Application to amend previous approval of application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on May 14, 2020

Staff presented its report, noting that the alteration of the floor plan prompted changes to the façade. Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the placement of the windows and requested that the patio door be included in the West Elevation. Commissioner Parker added that a wall on the east side of the patio had been removed in the East Elevation.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.4, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3

Vote: 824 N. Cheyenne Ave. (**Brady Heights**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Shears
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Turner			

3. **HP-0200-2020 / 1723 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Antonio F. Massi

Proposal:

1. Installation of columns on porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the two columns would provide structural support for the beam. Commissioner Grant inquired whether columns had previously been present, and the applicant replied that he found no evidence of columns but assumed they had been present due to the span of the beam. Commissioner Parker commented that the porch probably did not have columns and noted that the base, cap, and trim on each column should match the existing columns. Commissioner Turner noted the distance between the piers and beam, adding that the proposed columns would be taller than the columns presently on the porch. Commissioner Parker suggested the installation of two thin metal pipes concealed by black paint rather than the construction of columns, but the applicant and Commissioner Turner preferred columns. Commissioner Grant inquired whether the columns would be centered on the beam and whether the beam would be adjusted before the columns were installed, and the applicant responded affirmatively. Commissioner Turner requested information about the condition of the columns presently on the porch, and the applicant replied that they would need to be repaired in the future. Commissioner McKee emphasized the placement of the columns, indicating that each column should be centered on its respective pier.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the beam be adjusted to its original height prior to installation of the columns and that the dimensions of the base, cap, and trim of each column match those of the columns presently on the porch. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Parker and was approved unanimously.

Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.5

Vote: 1723 S. St. Louis Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant			Jones
2. Townsend			Shears
3. Becker			
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Parker			
7. Reeds			
8. Schoell			
9. Turner			

4. **HP-0198-2020 / 1202 E. 17th PI.** (North Maple Ridge)
Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: July 2, 2020
Applicant: Mark D. G. Sanders
Proposals:
1. Adjustment of alignment of driveway
 2. Construction of wall

Staff presented its report, noting that the adjustment of the alignment of the driveway arose from a desire to prevent vehicles from entering the driveway from Owasso Avenue. As the applicant was not present, Commissioner Townsend reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee had recommended approval of the application. Commissioner Parker added that the subcommittee had requested additional details, including an indication of the distance between the driveway and the porch. Commissioner Parker expressed a preference for a twelve foot (12'-0") wide driveway to match the present driveway, and Commissioner Turner indicated that the entrance to the driveway should be straight rather than curved. Commissioner Grant agreed, and Commissioner Parker noted the requirement for a right-of-way permit from the City of Tulsa. Commissioner Schoell indicated a need for a more detailed site plan and information about the retaining wall, and Commissioner Parker added that the plans should include dimensions and be drawn to scale.

Staff contacted the applicant, who agreed to extend the period for review and present revisions to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee at its Regular Meeting on July 21, 2020.

- C. Reports
1. Chair Report
None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on work in progress at the residence located at 1158 North Denver Avenue.

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
Commissioner Turner announced that the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture has implemented virtual tours in place of walking tours due to the concern about COVID-19.

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Grant adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:37 P.M.