



**TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 12, 2019, 11:00 A.M.  
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

- 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum  
Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:04 A.M.

**Members Present**

David W. Schoell, P.E., Chair  
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Vice-Chair  
Holly Becker  
Susan J. McKee, MFA  
Katelyn C. Parker, RA\*  
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA\*  
Robert L. Shears, ASLA  
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.  
James E. Turner, AIA

**Members Absent**

Joy Jones, Secretary  
Chris J. Bumgarner

**Staff Present**

Audrey D. Blank, Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Felicity O. Good

**Others Present**

Hannah Musto, Josh Musto, Jason Mills, Amanda Howell, Dave Habermehl, Tom Neal, Meg Sutherland, Carlos Moreno

\*Late

- 2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 26, 2019  
Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved by majority.

**Vote:** Minutes – Regular Meeting, November 26, 2019

**In Favor**

- 1. Schoell
- 2. Grant
- 3. McKee
- 4. Shears
- 5. Townsend
- 6. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

Becker

**Not Present**

Jones  
Bumgarner  
Parker  
Reeds

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0140-2019 / 1712 S. Quaker Ave.** (Swan Lake)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Review Dates: November 7, 2019, December 10, 2019*  
Applicant: J Mills Architecture  
Proposal:  
  1. Construction of addition

Staff presented its report, noting the applicant had addressed every request for revisions, including documentation of the addition’s scale compared with adjacent properties. Commissioner Grant added the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, after two reviews, had forwarded the application with a recommendation for its approval. The applicant confirmed that the existing windows would remain intact. Upon questions from Commissioners Turner and Schoell, the applicant stated that the new door would have a dentil shelf with no glass and that the existing door would be removed and installed on the side of the house.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.2.1, B.2.2, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3

**Vote:** 1712 S. Quaker Ave. **(Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Becker			
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

2. **HP-0148-2019 / 1315 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)  
Applicant: Tom Neal Design  
Proposal:  
  1. Construction of rail on third-story deck

Staff presented its report, explaining that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee requested that the rail be shifted to align with the residence’s facade. The applicant provided the commission with new exhibits reflecting the request. Commissioner Turner reported that the subcommittee had found the design to be consistent with the Colonial Revival style and added that the staircase would be located behind the existing addition and nearly invisible from the street. The applicant echoed Commissioner Turner’s comments, noting that a Site Plan with the location of the staircase had been provided.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.5

**Vote:** 1315 E. 19<sup>th</sup> St. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Becker			
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

3. **HP-0149-2019 / 1720 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)  
*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: December 10, 2019*  
Applicant: Atlas Homes LLC  
Proposal:  
1. Extension of porch  
2. Expansion of driveway

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had responded to the subcommittee's request for revisions with three proposals for consideration:

1. the inclusion of a two-foot (2'-0") greenbelt between the driveway and the residence and the replacement of the door on the south facade with a window from the second story
2. the inclusion of an eight-foot (8'-0") greenbelt between the driveway and the residence and the replacement of the door on the south facade with a window from the second story
3. the retention of the existing porch and the replacement of the door on the south facade with a window from the second story.

Staff noted that none of the three proposals had been reviewed by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Grant inquired about the previous proposal to add a set of stairs leading from the door on the south facade to the driveway, and the applicant stated that a landing and stairs were no longer part of the request. The applicant's representative, Ms. Howell, indicated a preference for the first proposal. Commissioner Turner clarified that the subcommittee's suggestion was to widen the driveway from one to two lanes with a flare beginning at the face of the residence. The applicant's contractor, Mr. Habermehl, commented that leakage and lack of stability in the foundation of the porch and the basement posed concerns about safety, which required the porch's demolition and reconstruction.

Commissioner Schoell offered the commission the options to discuss the three proposals or to forward the application to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee for further refinement. Commissioner Turner expressed approval for the proposed treatment of the porch, which was reviewed by the subcommittee. According to Commissioner Turner, the applicant had agreed to match existing details and materials during reconstruction, altering only the porch's outline. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Reeds, Mr. Habermehl confirmed that the front stairs and their

caps would remain intact. Commissioner Parker expressed a preference to retain the wrap-around porch as a character-defining feature, but Commissioner Grant indicated that the porch may not have been original. Ms. Howell confirmed Commissioner Grant's observation, stating that a meeting with former owners revealed that the porch had possibly been added in the 1940s. Staff inquired whether a different style of column would be required, and Commissioner Parker stated that the Ionic columns were not inappropriate for the period. Commissioner Turner commented on other details of the Italianate Style, such as quoins.

Commissioner Schoell then directed discussion to the removal of the second-story window on the south facade and the replacement of the door on the south facade with a window. Mr. Habermehl confirmed that the replacement window would match the window removed from the second story. Commissioner Grant recommended the approval of the proposal to reconstruct the porch and the referral of the other items to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Shears requested information on the treatment of the stem wall, and Ms. Howell stated that the treatment would replicate the stucco presently on the wall.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the first item—the extension of the porch—as presented in the first proposal and exclusive of any other work. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.2.2, G.2.3

**Vote:** 1720 S. Madison Ave. (**North Maple Ridge**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Becker			
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

4. **HP-0150-2019 / 1751 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Joshua Musto

Proposal:

1. Installation of gate

*Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report, noting the applicant's prompt response after notification. According to staff, the gate was black metal and approximately five feet (5'-0") in height and ten feet and six inches (10'-6") in width. The applicant stated that the gate was installed due to concern about security and that an application had not been submitted previously as he considered the gate to be in the side yard. The applicant's wife, Ms. Musto, added that the gate was not attached to the residence. Upon request for clarification, staff stated the gate was considered to be in the street yard because it was located just in front of the face of the residence. Staff noted that the review of the gate was consistent with the review of similar features in Swan

Lake and other districts. Commissioner Turner requested information on the neighbor's ability to access the shared driveway through the gate. The applicant stated that the gate would be open during the day but locked at night and added that the neighbors would be provided with a key.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.3, G.1.4

**Vote:** 1751 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell		Turner	Jones
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Becker			
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			

**5. Nomination and Election of Officers**

Commissioner Schoell reported that the Nomination Committee had nominated Commissioner Townsend for Vice-Chair and Commissioner Jones for Secretary. Both Commissioners Townsend and Jones had accepted the nominations.

As there were no further nominations, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the nominations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** Nomination and Election of Officers

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Jones
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Becker			
4. McKee			
5. Parker			
6. Reeds			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

**C. Presentation on Design of Website**

Staff announced that the Tulsa Preservation Commission's website would be revised to improve visual clarity and ease of access while retaining the information presently available on the site. Staff introduced Carlos Moreno, who presented three designs for the website and received comments from the members of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

D. Reports

1. Chair Report  
None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on Work begun without an Historic Preservation Permit at 202 East 20<sup>th</sup> Street. The Project Manager had responded to the Letter of Notification with an application, which has been reviewed by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee.

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at 811 North Cheyenne Avenue, noting that apparently the shingles and second-story windows had been replaced. The owner responded to the Letter of Notification with an application, and staff was awaiting Product Data.

Staff reported on Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit at 1103 North Cheyenne Avenue. The Working in Neighborhoods Department has issued a Notice of Violation with a deadline for response of December 16, 2019. According to staff, a citation would be issued if no response was received.

Staff reported on Work recently completed at 736 and 740 North Cheyenne Avenue. The residence located at 736 North Cheyenne Avenue featured construction with rammed earth.

- E. New Business  
None

- F. Announcements and Future Agenda Items  
None

- G. Public Comment  
None

- H. Adjournment  
Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:22 P.M.