



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Tuesday, October 22, 2019, 4:30 P.M.
City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:31 P.M.

Members Present

David W. Schoell, P.E., Chair
Peter Grant, CGR, CAPS, Vice-Chair
Joy Jones, Secretary
Katelyn C. Parker, RA
Ted A. Reeds, II, AIA
Robert L. Shears, ASLA
Mary Lee Townsend, Ph.D.
James E. Turner, AIA

Members Absent

Holly Becker
Chris J. Bumgarner
Susan J. McKee, MFA

Staff Present

Roy M. (Jed) Porter, Jr., Audrey Blank, Felicity O. Good

Others Present

Janet Attisha
Seleste Y. King
Jim Edwards
Sasha A. Martin

2. Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, October 10, 2019

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved by majority.

Vote: Minutes – Regular Meeting, October 10, 2019

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
Schoell		Jones	Becker
Grant		Shears	Bumgarner
Parker			McKee
Reeds			
Townsend			
Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
Commissioner Schoell noted that the applicant for HP-0139-2019, Janet Attisha, was his neighbor, but he had no financial interest in the application.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0136-2019 / 1875 E. 17th St.** (Yorktown)
Applicants: Seleste Y. King
Proposals:
 1. Removal of two windows on west facade
 2. Increase in width of doorway
 3. Replacement of door

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant withdrew a proposal to replace fourteen (14) windows on the residence to explore the possibility of repairing the windows. Staff reported that the proposed removal of two windows on the north-west corner was prompted by the enclosure of a closet inside the house. According to staff, the applicant intended to match the door presently on the residence but had provided an alternative Craftsman Style door if a match could not be found. Commissioner Reeds reported that the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee agreed with either proposal for the replacement of the door and the removal of the two windows on the west facade. In response to an inquiry from Commissioner Grant, the applicant stated that the new siding to replace the windows would blend in with the other siding. Commissioners recommended alternating the length of the new siding sixteen inches (16”) and thirty-two inches (32”) from the window’s location. Commissioner Parker inquired about the replacement of the front door, and the applicant replied that the proposal addressed replacement of the door entirely rather than an attempt to widen it. According to the applicant, the front door presently on the residence would be moved and used as a back door.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the novelty siding be alternated at least sixteen inches (16”) and thirty-two inches (32”) on the south side of the present window’s location and the siding be extended to the corner of the residence on the north side. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.7, A.4.1, A.4.2

Vote: 1875 E. 17th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Jones			McKee
4. Parker			
5. Reeds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

2. HP-0137-2019 / 1332 E. 18th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Sasha A. and Keith A. Martin

Proposal:

1. Replacement of vents in soffit

Application to amend previous approval of an application by the Tulsa Preservation Commission on October 10, 2019

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicants proposed approximately twenty-seven (27) aluminum vents (four inches (4”) by sixteen inches (16”) in size) distributed throughout the soffit on all four (4) sides of the residence. The vents would not be aligned with the windows on each side of the residence. The applicant added that the proposed vents would cover half as much area as the existing vents because of their size and that a continuous soffit vent had been considered as an alternative. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Turner, the applicant stated the vents and soffit panels would be placed parallel to the face of the house. Upon an inquiry from Commissioner Parker, the applicant noted that the attic fan was not operable. Commissioner Grant expressed the opinion that a continuous vent would be preferable, and Commissioners Reeds and Parker agreed. The applicant stated that they would need to calculate the cost of a continuous vent and estimated that it would likely need to be four inches (4”) or six inches (6”) in width. Commissioner Turner commented that the commission did not have enough information to approve a continuous soffit vent.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the soffit vents be parallel to the face of the residence and the panels to be replaced. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.5.2, A.5.3

Vote: 1332 E. 18th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell	Shears	Grant	Becker
2. Jones			Bumgarner
3. Parker			McKee
4. Reeds			
5. Townsend			
6. Turner			

3. **HP-0138-2019 / 1732 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Oklahoma Natural Gas

Proposal:

- 1 Relocation of meter

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant proposed relocation of the meter to a position immediately adjacent to the south facade and between the two windows closest to its southeast corner.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.7.2

Vote: 1732 S. St. Louis Ave. (**Swan Lake**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Jones			McKee
4. Parker			
5. Reeds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

4. **HP-0139-2019 / 1702 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Janet L. Attisha

Proposal:

1. Construction of fence

Staff presented its report, noting that the present fence would be removed and replaced with a wooden picket fence. Staff added that each picket would be four feet (4'-0") in height and two inches (2") in width and separated by a two-inch (2") space and that the pickets would extend in front of four-inch (4") by four-inch (4") posts with caps. A gate would be present as well. Commissioner Turner expressed the opinion that the pickets seemed small, and the applicant confirmed that the pickets would each be two inches (2") wide.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4

Vote: 1702 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Jones			McKee
4. Parker			
5. Reeds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

5. Review and Approval of 2020 Regular Meeting Schedule of Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

Staff presented the proposed schedule, noting that the format remained the same. The Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee would convene on the first Thursday and third Tuesday of each month, and the Tulsa Preservation Commission would convene on the second Thursday and fourth Tuesday of each month.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the 2020 Regular Meeting Schedule. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

Vote: 2020 Regular Meeting Schedule of Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Bumgarner
3. Jones			McKee
4. Parker			
5. Reeds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

Commissioner Schoell announced that the Board of Adjustment affirmed the Tulsa Preservation Commission's decision during the appeal of the denial of the application for HP-0116-2019. Commissioner Schoell mentioned staff, several commissioners, and a former commissioner who spoke on behalf of the Tulsa Preservation Commission and reported that the Board of Adjustment had voted unanimously to deny the appeal. Commissioner Schoell found the Board's reasoning for denying the appeal to be sensitive and thoughtful, and Commissioner Shears expressed satisfaction with

the staff and commissioners' representation at the review. Legal Staff agreed. Commissioners Reeds and Schoell thanked Commissioner Becker for organizing discussion points for each commissioner in preparation for the review. Commissioner Reeds inquired about next steps, and staff and legal staff responded that the Capeharts now had the option to appeal the decision to District Court within ten (10) days of the Board of Adjustment's decision. Commissioners then considered whether the asphalt shingles could be used as a base for the tiles and discussed several options. Commissioner Reeds again asked what the commission's options were henceforth. Commissioner Shears stated the replacement of the roof would remain a zoning violation and a fine could be issued. Commissioner Turner commented that many mortgage companies would review completed Work for permits, but Commissioner Jones noted that reviews depended on the individual appraiser.

2. Staff Report
None

D. New Business
None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Public Comment
None

G. Adjournment
Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:17 P.M.